

World Trade Center Building Performance Study:

*Data Collection, Preliminary
Observations, and
Recommendations*



Federal Emergency Management Agency

Federal Insurance and Mitigation Administration,
Washington, DC

FEMA Region II,
New York, New York

FEMA 403 / May 2002

World Trade Center Building Performance Study:

*Data Collection, Preliminary
Observations, and Recommendations*



Federal Emergency Management Agency

Federal Insurance and Mitigation Administration,
Washington, DC

FEMA Region II,
New York, New York

GREENHORNE &



O'MARA, INC.

ASCE
American Society of Civil Engineers

Report Editor:

Therese McAllister

Chapter Leaders and Authors:

Executive Summary Gene Corley
Ronald Hamburger
Therese McAllister

Chapter 1 Therese McAllister

Jonathan Barnett
John Gross
Ronald Hamburger
Jon Magnusson

Chapter 2 Ronald Hamburger

William Baker
Jonathan Barnett
Christopher Marrion
James Milke
Harold "Bud" Nelson

Chapter 3 William Baker

Chapter 4 Jonathan Barnett

Richard Gewain
Ramon Gilsanz
Harold "Bud" Nelson

Chapter 5 Ramon Gilsanz

Edward M. DePaola
Christopher Marrion
Harold "Bud" Nelson

Chapter 6 Robert Smilowitz

Adam Hapij
Jeffrey Smilow

Chapter 7 Therese McAllister

David Biggs
Edward M. DePaola
Dan Eschenasy
Ramon Gilsanz

Appendix A James Milke

Venkatesh Kodur
Christopher Marrion

Appendix B John Fisher

Nestor Iwankiw

Appendix C Jonathan Barnett

Ronald R. Biederman
R. D. Sisson, Jr.

Appendix D Ramon Gilsanz

Audrey Massa

Appendix F Edward M. DePaola

This report was produced by Greenhorne & O'Mara, Inc. (G&O) under Contract EMW-99-CO-0267 to the Federal Insurance and Mitigation Administration of FEMA

G&O Project Manager:	Eric Letvin
FEMA Project Officer:	Paul Tertell
ASCE Project Manager:	James Rossberg
G&O Technical Editors:	Bob Pendley Deb Daly
G&O Graphic Designers:	Wanda Rizer Julie Liptak

Team Leader:

Gene Corley

Team Members:

William Baker, Partner,
Skidmore Owings & Merrill LLP

Jonathan Barnett, Professor of Fire Protection Engineering,
Worcester Polytechnic Institute

David Biggs, Principal, Ryan-Biggs Associates

Gene Corley, Structural Engineer, Senior Vice President,
Construction Technology Laboratories

Bill Coulbourne, Principal Structural Engineer,
URS Corporation

Edward M. DePaola, Principal,
Severud Associates Consulting Engineers, PC

Robert Duval, Senior Fire Investigator,
National Fire Protection Association

Dan Eschenasy, Chief Structural Engineer,
City of New York Dept. of Design & Construction

John Fisher, Professor of Civil Engineering,
Lehigh University

Richard Gewain, Senior Engineer,
Hughes Associates, Inc.

Ramon Gilsanz, Partner, Gilsanz Murray Steficek

John Gross, Structural Systems and Design Group Leader,
National Institute of Standards & Technology

Ronald Hamburger, Chief Structural Engineer,
ABS Consulting

Nestor Iwankiw, Vice President, Engineering and Research,
American Institute of Steel Construction

Venkatesh Kodur, Research Officer,
National Research Council of Canada

Eric Letvin, Director, Hazards Mitigation Division,
Greenhorne & O'Mara, Inc.

Jon Magnusson, Partner,
Skilling Ward Magnusson Barkshire, Inc.

Christopher Marrion, Associate, Arup Fire

Therese McAllister, Senior Structural Engineer,
Greenhorne & O'Mara, Inc.

James Milke, Professor of Fire Protection,
University of Maryland

Harold E. "Bud" Nelson, Senior Research Engineer,
Hughes Associates, Inc.

James Rossberg, Director,
Structural Engineering Institute

Saw-Teen See, Managing Partner,
Leslie E. Robertson Associates, RLLP

Robert Smilowitz, Principal, Weidlinger Associates

Bruce Swiren, Senior EMP Specialist, FEMA Region II

Paul Tertell, Civil Engineer, FEMA



Table of Contents

Executive Summary

1 Introduction

1.1	Purpose and Scope of Study	1-1
1.2	WTC Site	1-2
1.3	Timeline and Event Summary	1-4
1.4	Response of the Engineering Community	1-8
1.4.1	Local Authorities	1-8
1.4.2	SEaONY Participation	1-10
1.5	Overview of Building Codes and Fire Standards	1-15
1.5.1	Building Codes	1-15
1.5.2	Unusual Building Loads	1-16
1.5.3	Overview of Fire-Structure Interaction	1-17
1.5.3.1	ASTM E119 Standard Fire Test	1-18
1.5.3.2	Performance in Actual Building Fires	1-18
1.6	Report Organization	1-20
1.7	References	1-21

2 WTC 1 and WTC 2

2.1	Building Descriptions	2-1
2.1.1	General	2-1
2.1.2	Structural Description	2-1
2.1.3	Fire Protection	2-11
2.1.3.1	Passive Protection	2-12
2.1.3.2	Suppression	2-12

Table of Contents

2.1.3.3	Smoke Management	2-13
2.1.3.4	Fire Department Features	2-13
2.1.4	Emergency Egress	2-13
2.1.5	Emergency Power	2-14
2.1.6	Management Procedures	2-14
2.2	Building Response	2-15
2.2.1	WTC 1	2-15
2.2.1.1	Initial Damage From Aircraft Impact	2-15
2.2.1.2	Fire Development	2-21
2.2.1.3	Evacuation	2-24
2.2.1.4	Structural Response to Fire Loading	2-24
2.2.1.5	Progression of Collapse	2-27
2.2.2	WTC 2	2-27
2.2.2.1	Initial Damage From Aircraft Impact	2-27
2.2.2.2	Preliminary Structural Analysis	2-32
2.2.2.3	Fire Development	2-34
2.2.2.4	Evacuation	2-35
2.2.2.5	Initiation of Collapse	2-35
2.2.2.6	Progression of Collapse	2-35
2.2.3	Substructure	2-35
2.3	Observations and Findings	2-36
2.4	Recommendations	2-39
2.5	References	2-40

3 WTC 3

3.1	Design and Construction Features	3-1
3.1.1	Project Overview	3-1
3.1.2	Building Description	3-1
3.1.3	Structural Description	3-2
3.2	1993 Attack	3-5
3.3	2001 Attacks	3-5
3.3.1	Fire and Evacuation	3-5
3.3.2	Building Response	3-6
3.4	Observations	3-8
3.5	Recommendations	3-8
3.6	References	3-8

4 WTC 4, 5, and 6

4.1 Design and Construction Features 4-1

 4.1.1 Structural Design Features 4-1

 4.1.2 Fire Protection Features 4-2

4.2 Building Loads and Performance 4-4

 4.2.1 Impact Damage to WTC 5 4-7

 4.2.2 Fire Damage 4-9

4.3 Analysis of Building Performance 4-10

 4.3.1 Steel and Frame Behavior 4-10

 4.3.2 WTC 5 – Local Collapse Mechanisms 4-12

4.4 Observations and Findings 4-16

4.5 Recommendations 4-21

4.6 References 4-21

5 WTC 7

5.1 Introduction 5-1

5.2 Structural Description 5-3

 5.2.1 Foundations 5-3

 5.2.2 Structural Framing 5-4

 5.2.3 Transfer Trusses and Girders 5-4

 5.2.4 Connections 5-8

5.3 Fire Protection Systems 5-10

 5.3.1 Egress Systems 5-10

 5.3.2 Detection and Alarm 5-10

 5.3.3 Compartmentalization 5-11

 5.3.4 Suppression Systems 5-12

 5.3.5 Power 5-13

5.4 Building Loads 5-13

5.5 Timeline of Events Affecting WTC 7 on September 11, 2001 5-16

 5.5.1 Collapse of WTC 2 5-16

 5.5.2 Collapse of WTC 1 5-16

 5.5.3 Fires at WTC 7 5-20

 5.5.4 Sequence of WTC 7 Collapse 5-23

Table of Contents

5.6	Potential Collapse Mechanism	5-24
5.6.1	Probable Collapse Initiation Events	5-24
5.6.2	Probable Collapse Sequence	5-30
5.7	Observations and Findings	5-31
5.8	Recommendations	5-32
5.9	References.....	5-32

6 Bankers Trust Building

6.1	Introduction	6-1
6.2	Building Description	6-1
6.3	Structural Damage Description	6-4
6.4	Architectural Damage Description.....	6-6
6.5	Fireproofing.....	6-10
6.6	Overall Assessment	6-10
6.7	Analysis	6-11
6.7.1	Key Assumptions	6-12
6.7.2	Model Refinement	6-12
6.7.3	Simulation of Nonlinear Behavior	6-13
6.7.4	Connection Details	6-13
6.7.5	Connection Behavior	6-14
6.8	Observations and Findings	6-15
6.9	Recommendations	6-16
6.10	References.....	6-16

7 Peripheral Buildings

7.1	Introduction	7-1
7.2	World Financial Center	7-4
7.2.1	The Winter Garden.....	7-4
7.2.2	WFC 3, American Express Building.....	7-5
7.3	Verizon Building.....	7-7
7.4	30 West Broadway	7-13
7.5	130 Cedar Street.....	7-14
7.6	90 West Street	7-15

7.7	45 Park Place	7-17
7.8	One Liberty Plaza	7-17
7.9	Observations and Findings	7-19
7.10	Recommendations	7-19
7.11	References.....	7-19

8 Observations, Findings, and Recommendations

8.1	Summary of Report Observations, Findings, and Recommendations.....	8-1
8.2	Chapter Observations, Findings, and Recommendations	8-2
8.2.1	Chapter 1: Building Codes and Fire Standards	8-2
8.2.2	Chapter 2: WTC 1 and WTC 2	8-2
8.2.2.1	Observations and Findings	8-2
8.2.2.2	Recommendations	8-5
8.2.3	Chapter 3: WTC 3.....	8-6
8.2.3.1	Observations.....	8-6
8.2.3.2	Recommendations	8-6
8.2.4	Chapter 4: WTC 4, 5, and 6	8-6
8.2.4.1	Observations and Findings	8-6
8.2.4.2	Recommendations	8-7
8.2.5	Chapter 5: WTC 7.....	8-7
8.2.5.1	Observations and Findings	8-7
8.2.5.2	Recommendations	8-8
8.2.6	Chapter 6: Bankers Trust.....	8-8
8.2.6.1	Observations and Findings	8-8
8.2.6.2	Recommendations	8-9
8.2.7	Chapter 7: Peripheral Buildings.....	8-10
8.2.7.1	Observations and Findings	8-10
8.2.7.2	Recommendations	8-10
8.2.8	Appendix C: Limited Metallurgical Examination	8-10
8.2.8.1	Observations and Findings	8-10
8.2.8.2	Recommendations	8-11
8.3	Building Performance Study Recommendations for Future Study	8-11
8.3.1	National Response	8-11
8.3.2	Interaction of Structural Elements and Fire	8-11
8.3.3	Interaction of Professions in Design	8-12
8.3.4	Fire Protection Engineering Discipline	8-12
8.3.5	Building Evacuation	8-12

8.3.6	Emergency Personnel	8-12
8.3.7	Education of Stakeholders	8-13
8.3.8	Study Process	8-13
8.3.9	Archival Information	8-13
8.3.10	SEAO NY Structural Engineering Emergency Response Plan	8-13

A Overview of Fire Protection in Buildings

A.1	Introduction	A-1
A.2	Fire Behavior	A-1
A.2.1	Burning Behavior of Materials	A-1
A.2.2	Stages of Fire Development	A-4
A.2.3	Behavior of Fully Developed Fires	A-4
A.3	Structural Response to Fire	A-5
A.3.1	Effect of Fire on Steel	A-5
A.3.1.1	Introduction	A-5
A.3.1.2	Evaluating Fire Resistance	A-6
A.3.1.3	Response of High-rise, Steel-frame Buildings in Previous Fire Incidents	A-9
A.3.1.4	Properties of Steel	A-10
A.3.1.5	Fire Protection Techniques for Steel	A-14
A.3.1.6	Temperature Rise in Steel	A-14
A.3.1.7	Factors Affecting Performance of Steel Structures in Fire	A-17
A.3.2	Effect of Fire on Concrete	A-19
A.3.2.1	General	A-19
A.3.2.2	Properties of Lightweight Concrete	A-19
A.3.3	Fire and Structural Modeling	A-22
A.4	Life Safety	A-23
A.4.1	Evacuation Process	A-24
A.4.2	Analysis	A-24
A.5	References	A-26

B Structural Steel and Steel Connections

B.1	Structural Steel	B-1
B.2	Mechanical Properties	B-2
B.3	WTC 1 and WTC 2 Connection Capacity	B-4
B.3.1	Background	B-4

B.3.2	Observations	B-5
B.3.3	Connectors.....	B-5
B.4	Examples of WTC 1 and WTC 2 Connection Capacity	B-7
B.4.1	Bolted Column End Plates	B-7
B.4.2	Bolted Spandrel Connections	B-8
B.4.3	Floor Truss Seated End Connections at Spandrel Beam and Core	B-9
B.4.4	WTC 5 Column-tree Shear Connections	B-12
B.5	References.....	B-14

C Limited Metallurgical Examination

C.1	Introduction	C-1
C.2	Sample 1 (From WTC 7)	C-1
C.3	Summary for Sample 1	C-5
C.4	Sample 2 (From WTC 1 or WTC 2)	C-5
C.5	Summary for Sample 2	C-13
C.6	Suggestions for Future Research.....	C-13

D WTC Steel Data Collection

D.1	Introduction	D-1
D.2	Project Background	D-1
D.3	Methods	D-2
D.3.1	Identifying and Saving Pieces	D-2
D.3.2	Documenting Pieces.....	D-5
D.3.3	Getting Coupons	D-8
D.4	Data Collected.....	D-10
D.5	Conclusions and Future Work	D-13
D.6	References.....	D-13

E Aircraft Information

General Specifications	E-1
------------------------------	-----

F Structural Engineers Emergency Response Plan

G Acknowledgments

H Acronyms and Abbreviations

I Metric Conversions

Tables

Table 1.1	Timeline of Major Events	1-10
Table 2.1	Estimated Openings in Exterior Walls of WTC 1	2-23
Table 5.1	WTC 7 Tenants	5-2
Table 5.2	WTC 7 Fuel Distribution Systems	5-14
Table 7.1	DoB/SEaONY Cooperative Building Damage Assessment – November 7, 2001	7-3
Table A.1	Peak Heat Release Rates of Various Materials (NFPA 92B and NFPA 72)	A-3
Table A.2	Fire Duration in Previous Fire Incidents in Steel-frame Buildings	A-10
Table A.3	Critical Temperatures for Various Types of Steel	A-15
Table A.4	Test Methods for Spray-applied Fireproofing Materials	A-18

Figures

Chapter 1

Figure 1-1	WTC site map.	1-3
Figure 1-2	Approximate flight paths of aircraft.	1-5
Figure 1-3	WTC impact locations and resulting fireballs.	1-5
Figure 1-4	Areas of aircraft debris impact.	1-6
Figure 1-5	Fireball erupts on the north face of WTC 2 as United Airlines Flight 175 strikes the building.	1-7
Figure 1-6	View of the north and east faces showing fire and impact damage to both towers.	1-7
Figure 1-7	Schematic depiction of areas of collapse debris impact, based on aerial photographs and documented damage.	1-9
Figure 1-8	Seismic recordings on east-west component at Palisades, NY, for events at WTC on September 11, 2001, distance 34 km.	1-11
Figure 1-9A	Satellite photograph of the WTC site taken before the attacks.	1-12
Figure 1-9B	Satellite photograph of the WTC site taken after the attacks.	1-13
Figure 1-10	Comparison of high-rise building and aircraft sizes.	1-19

Chapter 2

Figure 2-1	Representative floor plan (based on floor plan for 94th and 95th floors of WTC 1).	2-2
Figure 2-2	Representative structural framing plan, upper floors.	2-4
Figure 2-3	Partial elevation of exterior bearing-wall frame showing exterior wall module construction.	2-6
Figure 2-4	Base of exterior wall frame.	2-7
Figure 2-5	Structural tube frame behavior.	2-7
Figure 2-6	Floor truss member with details of end connections.	2-8
Figure 2-7	Erection of prefabricated components, forming exterior wall and floor deck units.	2-9
Figure 2-8	Erection of floor framing during original construction.	2-9
Figure 2-9	Cross-section through main double trusses, showing transverse truss.	2-9
Figure 2-10	Outrigger truss system at tower roof.	2-10
Figure 2-11	Location of subterranean structure.	2-11
Figure 2-12	Floor plan of 94th and 95th floors of WTC 1 showing egress stairways.	2-14
Figure 2-13	Zone of aircraft impact on the north face of WTC 1.	2-16
Figure 2-14	Approximate zone of impact of aircraft on the north face of WTC 1.	2-17
Figure 2-15	Impact damage to the north face of WTC 1.	2-18
Figure 2-16	Impact damage to exterior columns on the north face of WTC 1.	2-18
Figure 2-17	Approximate debris location on the 91st floor of WTC 1.	2-19
Figure 2-18	Landing gear found at the corner of West and Rector Streets	2-19
Figure 2-19	Redistribution of load after aircraft impact.	2-20
Figure 2-20	Expansion of floor slabs and framing results in outward deflection of columns and potential overload.	2-25
Figure 2-21	Buckling of columns initiated by failure of floor joist connections.	2-26
Figure 2-22	Catenary action of floor framing on several floors initiates column buckling failures.	2-26
Figure 2-23	Aerial photograph of the WTC site after September 11 attack showing adjacent buildings damaged by debris from the collapse of WTC 1.	2-28
Figure 2-24	Southeast corner of WTC 2 shortly after aircraft impact.	2-28
Figure 2-25	Approximate zone of impact of aircraft on the south face of WTC 2.	2-29
Figure 2-26	Impact damage to the south and east faces of WTC 2.	2-30
Figure 2-27	Impact damage to exterior columns on the south face of WTC 2.	2-30

Table of Contents

Figure 2-28	Conflagration and debris exiting the north wall of WTC 2, behind WTC 1.	2-31
Figure 2-29	A portion of the fuselage of United Airlines Flight 175 on the roof of WTC 5.....	2-32
Figure 2-30	North face of WTC 2 opposite the zone of impact on the south face, behind WTC 1.....	2-33
Figure 2-31	Plot of column utilization ratio at the 80th floor of WTC 2, viewed looking outward.	2-34
Figure 2-32	The top portion of WTC 2 falls to the east, then south, as viewed from the northeast.	2-36

Chapter 3

Figure 3-1	Developed north and west elevations.	3-2
Figure 3-2	Developed south and east elevations.	3-2
Figure 3-3	Typical hotel floor plan.	3-3
Figure 3-4	Typical hotel floor framing plan.	3-4
Figure 3-5	Typical transverse bracing elevation.	3-5
Figure 3-6	Exterior columns from the collapse of WTC 2 falling on the southern part of WTC 3.	3-6
Figure 3-7	Partial collapse of WTC 3 after collapse of WTC 2.	3-7
Figure 3-8	Remains of WTC 3 after collapse of WTC 1 and WTC 2.	3-8

Chapter 4

Figure 4-1	Typical floor plan for WTC 5.	4-2
Figure 4-2	Typical column-tree system (not to scale).	4-3
Figure 4-3	Typical interior bay framing in WTC 5.	4-3
Figure 4-4	Stairway enclosure core locations in WTC 5.	4-4
Figure 4-5	Damage to WTC 4.	4-5
Figure 4-6	Damage to WTC 5.	4-5
Figure 4-7	Approximate locations of damaged floor areas in WTC 5.	4-6
Figure 4-8	Damage to WTC 6.	4-8
Figure 4-9	Impact damage to WTC 6.	4-8
Figure 4-10	Impact damage to the exterior façade of WTC 6.	4-9
Figure 4-11	WTC 5 façade damage.	4-10
Figure 4-12	Impact damage to WTC 5.	4-11

Figure 4-13	WTC 5 on fire.	4-13
Figure 4-14	Deformed beams in WTC 5.	4-13
Figure 4-15	Unburned bookstore in WTC 5.	4-14
Figure 4-16	Looking through the door into the undamaged stair tower in WTC 5.	4-14
Figure 4-17	Buckled beam flange and column on the 8th floor of WTC 5 that was weakened by fire.	4-15
Figure 4-18	Internal collapsed area in WTC 5.	4-16
Figure 4-19	Internal collapsed area in WTC 5.	4-17
Figure 4-20	Internal collapsed area in WTC 5.	4-18
Figure 4-21	Internal collapsed area in WTC 5 with closeup of connection failure at column tree.	4-18
Figure 4-22	Connection samples.	4-19

Chapter 5

Figure 5-1	Foundation plan – WTC 7.	5-3
Figure 5-2	Plan view of typical floor framing for the 8th through 45th floors.	5-4
Figure 5-3	Elevations of building and core area.	5-5
Figure 5-4	Fifth floor diaphragm plan showing T-sections embedded in 14-inch slab.	5-6
Figure 5-5	3-D diagram showing relations of trusses and transfer girders.	5-6
Figure 5-6	Seventh floor plan showing locations of transfer trusses and girders.	5-7
Figure 5-7	Truss 1 detail.	5-8
Figure 5-8	Truss 2 detail.	5-9
Figure 5-9	Truss 3 detail.	5-10
Figure 5-10	Cantilever transfer girder detail.	5-11
Figure 5-11	Compartmentalization provided by concrete floor slabs.	5-12
Figure 5-12	Sequence of debris generated by collapses of WTC 2, 1, and 7.	5-17
Figure 5-13	Pedestrian bridge (bottom center) still standing after WTC 2 has collapsed, sending substantial dust and debris onto the street, but before WTC 1 (top center) has collapsed.	5-18
Figure 5-14	View from the north of the WTC 1 collapse and the spread of debris around WTC 7.	5-18
Figure 5-15	Debris from the collapse of WTC 1 located between WTC 7 (left) and the Verizon building (right).	5-19

Table of Contents

Figure 5-16	Damage to the southeast corner of WTC 7 (see box), looking from West Street.	5-19
Figure 5-17	Building damage to the southwest corner and smoke plume from south face of WTC 7, looking from the World Financial Plaza.	5-20
Figure 5-18	WTC 7, with a large volume of dark smoke rising from it, just visible behind WFC 1 (left).	5-21
Figure 5-19	Fires on the 11th and 12th floors of the east face of WTC 7.	5-22
Figure 5-20	View from the north of WTC 7 with both mechanical penthouses intact.	5-24
Figure 5-21	East mechanical penthouse collapsed.	5-25
Figure 5-22	East and now west mechanical penthouses gone.	5-25
Figure 5-23	View from the north of the “kink” or fault developing in WTC 7.	5-26
Figure 5-24	Areas of potential transfer truss failure.	5-27
Figure 5-25	Debris cloud from collapse of WTC 7.	5-27
Figure 5-26	Debris generated after collapse of WTC 7.	5-28

Chapter 6

Figure 6-1	North face of Bankers Trust building with impact damage between floors 8 and 23.	6-1
Figure 6-2	Closeup of area of partial collapse.	6-2
Figure 6-3	Floor plan above the 2nd level (ground floor extension not shown).	6-3
Figure 6-4	Area of initial impact of debris at the 23rd floor.	6-4
Figure 6-5	Approximate zones of damage – 19th through 22nd floors, 16th through 18th floors, 11th through 15th floors, and 9th through 10th floors.	6-5
Figure 6-6	Moment-connected beams to columns.	6-7
Figure 6-7	Column with the remains of two moment connections.	6-7
Figure 6-8	Failed shear connection of beam web to column web.	6-8
Figure 6-9	Suspended column D-8 at the 15th floor.	6-8
Figure 6-10	Area of collapsed floor slab in bays between C-8, E-8, C-7, and E-7, from 15th floor.	6-9
Figure 6-11	Bankers Trust lobby (note debris has been swept into piles).	6-9
Figure 6-12	Office at north side of the 8th floor.	6-10
Figure 6-13	3-D ANSYS model of flange and shear plate moment connection.	6-14
Figure 6-14	3-D ANSYS model of flange and seat moment connection.	6-14

Chapter 7

Figure 7-1	New York City DDC/DoB Cooperative Building Damage Assessment Map of November 7, 2001 (based on SEAoNY inspections of September and October 2001).....	7-2
Figure 7-2	Southeast corner of WFC 3.	7-5
Figure 7-3	View of Winter Garden damage from West Street, with WTC 1 debris in front of WFC 2.	7-6
Figure 7-4	View of Winter Garden damage from West Street, with WTC 1 debris leaning against WFC 3.	7-6
Figure 7-5	Interior damage at floor 20 of WFC 3.	7-7
Figure 7-6	Verizon building – damage to east elevation (Washington Street).	7-8
Figure 7-7	Verizon building – damage to east elevation (Washington Street) due to WTC 7 framing leaning against the building.	7-9
Figure 7-8	Verizon building – damage to east elevation (Washington Street).	7-9
Figure 7-9	Verizon building – column damage on east elevation (Washington Street).	7-10
Figure 7-10	Verizon building – damage to south elevation (Vesey Street).	7-11
Figure 7-11	Verizon building – localized damage to south elevation (Vesey Street).	7-11
Figure 7-12	Verizon building – detail of damage to south elevation (Vesey Street).	7-12
Figure 7-13	30 West Broadway – south façade, 6th floor to roof, looking northeast.	7-13
Figure 7-14	130 Cedar Street and 90 West Street.	7-14
Figure 7-15	Interior of 90 West Street showing typical construction features.	7-16
Figure 7-16	Buckling damage at top of column on floor 8 of 90 West Street.	7-17
Figure 7-17	Buckling damage at top of column on floor 23 of 90 West Street.	7-18
Figure 7-18	One Liberty Plaza – south elevation, lower floors.	7-19
Figure 7-19	One Liberty Plaza – south elevation, upper floors.	7-20

Appendix A

Figure A-1	Heat release rate for office module.	A-2
Figure A-2	Fire growth rates (from SFPE Handbook of Fire Protection Engineering).	A-3
Figure A-3	Comparison of exposure temperatures in standard tests.	A-6
Figure A-4	Thermal properties of steel at elevated temperatures.	A-11
Figure A-5	Stress-strain curves for structural steel (ASTM A36) at a range of temperatures.	A-11
Figure A-6	Strength of steel at elevated temperatures.	A-12

Table of Contents

Figure A-7	Modulus of elasticity at elevated temperatures for structural steels and steel reinforcing bars.	A-13
Figure A-8	Reduction of the yield strength of cold-formed light-gauge steel at elevated temperatures.	A-13
Figure A-9	Steel temperature rise due to fire exposure for unprotected steel column.	A-16
Figure A-10	Steel temperature rise due to fire exposure for steel column protected with 1 inch of spray-applied fireproofing.	A-16
Figure A-11	The effect of temperature on the modulus of elasticity strength of different types of concretes.	A-20
Figure A-12	Reduction of the compressive strength of two lightweight concretes (one with natural sand) at elevated temperatures.	A-21
Figure A-13	Usual ranges of variation for the volume-specific heat of normal-weight and lightweight concretes.	A-21
Figure A-14	Specific flow rate as a function of density (SPFE Handbook of Fire Protection Engineering).	A-25
Figure A-15	Estimated evacuation times for high-rise buildings.	A-26

Appendix B

Figure B-1	Exterior column end plates.	B-1
Figure B-2	Tensile stress-strain curves for three ASTM-designation steels.	B-3
Figure B-3	Expanded yield portion of the tensile stress-strain curves.	B-3
Figure B-4	Effect of high strain rate on shape of stress-strain diagram.	B-4
Figure B-5	Column tree showing bolt bearing shear failures of spandrel connection.	B-6
Figure B-6	Shear fracture failure of fillet welds connecting a W-shape column to a box core column.	B-7
Figure B-7	Bent and fractured bolts at a column four-bolt connection.	B-8
Figure B-8	Typical truss top chord connections to column/spandrel beam and to the core beam.	B-10
Figure B-9	(A) Visco-elastic damper angles bolted to angle welded to spandrel plate and (B) failed bearing seat connection	B-11
Figure B-10	(A) Bracket plate welded to the column/spandrel plate and (B) horizontal plate brace with shear connectors welded to the failed bracket.	B-11
Figure B-11	Shear failure of floor joist connections from column/spandrel plate.	B-12

Appendix C

Figure C-1	Eroded A36 wide-flange beam.	C-1
Figure C-2	Closeup view of eroded wide-flange beam section.	C-2
Figure C-3	Mounted and polished severely thinned section removed from the wide-flange beam shown in Figure C-1.	C-2
Figure C-4	Optical microstructure near the steel surface.	C-3
Figure C-5	Another hot corrosion region near the steel surface (etched with 4 percent nital).	C-3
Figure C-6	Microstructure of A36 steel.	C-4
Figure C-7	Deep penetration of liquid into the steel.	C-4
Figure C-8	Qualitative chemical analysis.	C-5
Figure C-9	Qualitative chemical analysis.	C-6
Figure C-10	Grain boundary corrosion attack.	C-6
Figure C-11	Microstructure of a typical region showing the surface and grain boundary corrosion attack of Sample 2.	C-7
Figure C-12	Higher magnification of the region shown in Figure C-10.	C-7
Figure C-13	Regions where chemical analysis was performed.	C-8
Figure C-14	Gradient of sulfides into the steel from the oxide-metal interface.	C-12

Appendix D

Figure D-1	Mixed, unsorted steel upon delivery to salvage yard.	D-2
Figure D-2	Torch cutting of very large pieces into more manageable pieces of a few tons each.	D-3
Figure D-3	Pile of unsorted mixed steel (background), with sorted, large steel pieces (center) being lifted and cut into smaller pieces (left).	D-3
Figure D-4	Engineer climbing in unprocessed steel pile to inspect and mark promising pieces	D-4
Figure D-5	Stenciled markings on WTC 2 perimeter column from floors 68-71.	D-5
Figure D-6	Steel pieces marked "SAVE."	D-6
Figure D-7	Engineers measuring and recording steel piece dimensions.	D-6
Figure D-8	Engineer measuring spandrel plate thickness (t_s).	D-7
Figure D-9	Measurement of 1/4 inch for web thickness (t_w).	D-7
Figure D-10	Measured dimensions of the steel pieces.	D-8
Figure D-11	Burnt steel piece marked for cutting of coupon.	D-9

Table of Contents

Figure D-12 Coupon cut from WTC 5 showing web tear-out at bolts. D-9

Figure D-13 WTC 1 or WTC 2 core column (C-74). D-10

Figure D-14 WTC 7 W14 column tree with beams attached to two floors. D-11

Figure D-15 Built-up member with failure along stitch welding. D-11

Figure D-16 Engineer inspecting fire damage of perimeter column tree from
WTC 1 or WTC 2. D-12

Figure D-17 Seat-connected in fire-damaged W14 column from WTC 7. D-12

Figure D-18 WTC 1 or WTC 2 floor-truss section with seat connection
fractured along welds. D-13