

**THE WORD PROBLEM FOR FREE GROUPS CANNOT BE
SOLVED IN LINEAR TIME***

ALESSANDRO SISTO

ABSTRACT. *by a standard (one-tape) Turing machine. It is well-known that the word problem for hyperbolic groups, whence in particular for free groups, can be solved in linear time. However, these algorithms run on machines more complicated than a standard Turing machine. By contrast, in this note we show that a standard Turing machine cannot solve the word problem for the free group on two generators in less than quadratic time.

The word problem for hyperbolic groups can be solved in linear time (see, e.g. [ABC⁺91, Theorem 2.28]), but this requires using two tapes (or more for a real-time solution [Hol00]). Theorem 1 below shows that with one tape one cannot do better than quadratic time, even for a free group on two generators. All Turing machines below are one-tape.

We will consider the free group F_2 on two generators a, b . When referring to words, we will always mean words in the alphabet $\mathcal{A} = \{a, b, \bar{a}, \bar{b}\}$ (where \bar{a}, \bar{b} represent the inverses of a, b). Recall that a word in \mathcal{A} is called trivial if it represents the trivial element of F_2 .

In the theorem below, we regard words in the alphabet \mathcal{A} as inputs of Turing machines where we index the cells of the tapes by integers. Specifically, we assume that the word is written starting at cell 1, which we also assume to be the starting position of the head.

Theorem 1. *There does not exist a Turing machine with tape alphabet symbols \mathcal{A} which accepts a word in \mathcal{A} if and only if it is trivial, and which halts in $o(n^2)$ time when the input word has length n .*

Proof. We will need large sets of trivial words with suitable additional properties whose use will be clear later.

Lemma 2. *There exists $\alpha > 1, n_0 \in \mathbb{N}$ and sets of words \mathcal{W}_n with the following properties for all even n .*

- (1) *Each $w \in \mathcal{W}_n$ is trivial and has length n .*
- (2) *$|\mathcal{W}_n| \geq \alpha^n$ for all $n \geq n_0$.*
- (3) *For all integers $t \in [n/4, n/2)$, the initial subwords of length t of the words in \mathcal{W}_n all represent distinct elements of F_2 .*

Proof. We can take the initial words of length $n/2$ of the elements of \mathcal{W}_n to be words in $\{a, b\}$ only, and property (3) will hold as long as the sub-subwords of length $n/4$ are distinct. We can then “complete” the various words just by appending the inverse of the chosen initial words. \square

Fix $\alpha > 1$ and n_0 as in Lemma 2, as well as the corresponding sets of words. Consider a Turing machine with $K \geq 2$ states, and suppose that it runs in $\leq \epsilon n^2$ time

when the input word has length n , where we fix some $0 < \epsilon < \log(\alpha)/(4 \log(K))$. We show that the Turing machine accepts at least one non-trivial word.

Given any word $w \in \mathcal{W}_n$ for an even $n \geq n_0$, there exists some index $c = c(w) \in [n/4, n/2)$ such that the head of the Turing machine lies at c at most $4\epsilon n$ times. We call such c a checkpoint index. Moreover, either for a set $\mathcal{W}'_n \subseteq \mathcal{W}_n$ containing at least half of the words in \mathcal{W}_n the final position of the head is larger than $c(w)$ on input w , or it is at most $c(w)$. We assume the former for infinitely many n , the argument for the latter being similar (noting that item (3) of the lemma automatically holds for final subwords as well since all words in \mathcal{W}_n are trivial). We only consider such n below, and also we assume $n \geq n_0$.

It is not hard to see that whether a word w in \mathcal{W}'_n is accepted by the Turing machine only then depends on:

- the checkpoint index,
- the sequence of states at the times when it moves from c to $c + 1$ or vice versa (which we call checkpoint sequence),
- the final subword of w starting after the checkpoint index.

Indeed, the operations performed by the Turing machine in each of the visits of its head beyond the checkpoint (that is, while the head is at indices larger than c) only depend on the state at the time it moves from c to $c + 1$. The reason we included information on the states when the head moves back will be clear later.

Note that there are $\leq n/4$ possible checkpoint indices. Since the checkpoint sequences have length at most $4\epsilon n$ and the Turing machine has K states, there are at most

$$\frac{n}{4} 2K^{4\epsilon n} = nK^{4\epsilon n}/2$$

possible pairs of checkpoint index and checkpoint sequence. By our choice of ϵ , for any sufficiently large n we have

$$nK^{4\epsilon n}/2 < \alpha^n/2 \leq |\mathcal{W}'_n|.$$

For such n , we must have two words w_1, w_2 in \mathcal{W}'_n with the same checkpoint index c and the same checkpoint sequence. We can then consider the “hybrid” word w' that has the same initial subword of length c as w_1 and the same final subword as w_2 after c . We have that w' cannot represent the identity of F_2 in view of the fact that w_2 does, and the initial subword of length c in w' represents a different group element. However, w_2 is accepted by the Turing machine if and only if w' is, since the operations performed by the Turing machine within the checkpoint only depend on the checkpoint sequence. Therefore, the Turing machine accepts at least one non-trivial word, as required. \square

REFERENCES

- [ABC⁺91] J. M. Alonso, T. Brady, D. Cooper, V. Ferlini, M. Lustig, M. Mihalik, M. Shapiro, and H. Short. Notes on word hyperbolic groups. In *Group theory from a geometrical viewpoint (Trieste, 1990)*, pages 3–63. World Sci. Publ., River Edge, NJ, 1991. Edited by Short.
- [Hol00] Derek F. Holt. Word-hyperbolic groups have real-time word problem. *Internat. J. Algebra Comput.*, 10(2):221–227, 2000.

MAXWELL INSTITUTE AND DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, HERIOT-WATT UNIVERSITY, EDINBURGH, UK

Email address: a.sisto@hw.ac.uk