



This is the **accepted version** of the journal article:

Azzarà, Beatrice; Breda, Marzia; Cirilli, Omar; [et al.]. «Vigna Nuova: the first Middle Villafranchian mammal assemblage from the Valdichiana Basin, Perugia (Italy)». Bollettino della Società Paleontologica Italiana, Vol. 61, Issue 2 (September 2022), p. 223-247. DOI 10.4435/BSPI.2022.12

This version is available at https://ddd.uab.cat/record/271465 under the terms of the  $\bigcirc^{\mbox{\footnotesize IN}}$  license

## Vigna Nuova (Perugia): the first Middle Villafranchian mammal assemblage

2	from the Valdichiana Basin
3	
4	Abbreviated title: Mammals from Vigna Nuova
5	
6	Beatrice AZZARÀ*, Marzia BREDA, Omar CIRILLI, Joan MADURELL-MALAPEIRA, Federica RUZZA,
7	Leonardo Sorbelli, Domenico Tancredi & Marco Cherin
8	
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	<ul> <li>B. Azzarà, Dipartimento di Fisica e Geologia, Università degli Studi di Perugia, Via A. Pascoli, 06123 Perugia, Italy; beatrice.azzara@studenti.unipg.it *corresponding author</li> <li>M. Breda, Centro di Ateneo per i Musei (CAM), Università di Padova, Via Giotto 1, 35121, Padova, Italy; marzia.breda@unipd.it</li> <li>O. Cirilli, Laboratory of Evolutionary Biology, Department of Anatomy, College of Medicine, Howard University, 20059, Washington DC, USA; Dipartimento di Scienze della Terra, Paleo[Fab]Lab, University of Florence, Via La Pira 4, 50121, Firenze, Italy; omar.cirilli@howard.edu</li> <li>J. Madurell-Malapeira, L. Sorbelli, Institut Català de Paleontologia Miquel Crusafont, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, 08193 Cerdanyola del Vallès, Spain; joan.madurell@uab.cat, leonardo.sorbelli@icp.cat</li> <li>F. Ruzza, M. Cherin, Dipartimento di Fisica e Geologia, Università degli Studi di Perugia, Via A. Pascoli, 06123 Perugia, Italy; federica.ruzza@studenti.unipg.it, marco.cherin@unipg.it</li> <li>D. Tancredi, Dipartimento di Chimica, Biologia e Biotecnologie, Università degli Studi di Perugia, Via dell'Elce di Sotto 8, 06123 Perugia, Italy; domenico.tancredi@studenti.unipg.it</li> </ul>
<ul><li>23</li><li>24</li><li>25</li></ul>	KEY WORDS – Canis, Croizetoceros ramosus, Early Pleistocene, Equus senezensis, Fossil mammals, Umbria.
26	
27	ABSTRACT - Umbria (central Italy) represents one of the most interesting areas for the study of
28	Mediterranean Plio-Pleistocene mammal faunas thanks to the abundance of paleontological deposits
29	distributed throughout the territory. Most of the fossils have been discovered in the Tiberino Basin,
30	which extends over ca. $1800 \text{ km}^2$ along the middle part of the regional territory, and in the small
31	Tavernelle-Pietrafitta Basin, south of Trasimeno Lake. Instead, in this paper we report on the
32	assemblage from Vigna Nuova (Piegaro, Perugia) in the Valdichiana Basin, whose continental
33	deposits crop out in few areas of western Umbria. Taphonomic and geological evidence, coupled

with the few available excavation notes, allow to divide the sample into two assemblages. The younger comes from the conglomerates (here called "upper layer") still visible on the outcrop and is composed only of remains of cf. Leptobos. The data obtained from this fragmentary sample and some sedimentological-stratigraphic considerations suggest that it can be correlated with other well-known Valdichiana assemblages (e.g., Selvella, Farneta), dated at ca. 1.5 Ma. The older sub-sample comes from a putative paleosol (here called "lower layer") no longer visible in the field. It includes cf. Megantereon, Canis sp., Mustelidae indet., Proboscidea indet., Equus cf. senezensis, cf. Leptobos, Croizetoceros ramosus, 'Pseudodama' sp., Cervidae indet. (large size), and Sus cf. strozzii. This assemblage can be referred to the Coste San Giacomo Faunal Unit (late Middle Villafranchian; ca. 2.2–2.1 Ma). It represents the first well-preserved sample of this age in Umbria and one of the few in Italy, opening new interesting research perspectives on the distribution of mammals in the Peninsula and also on the stratigraphy and evolution of the Valdichiana Basin.

Aggiungeva che per scavare le poche ossa che mi avrebbe subito inviate aveva dovuto faticare enormemente e lottare per due giorni contro ogni sorta di difficoltà. Ricevuto il graditissimo invio mi affrettai a consolidare e restaurare con ogni cura quelle primizie ed oggi sono lieto di poter annunziare, in così solenne adunanza, la interessante scoperta...

He added that in order to excavate the few bones that he would immediately send me he had had to work enormously and fight for two days against all sorts of difficulties. Having received the very welcome shipment, I hastened to consolidate and restore those fruits of the soil with every care and today I am pleased to be able to announce, in such a solemn meeting, the interesting discovery...

Giovanni Capellini (1890: 275)

60

61

### 62

### INTRODUCTION

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

In spite of its small geographical extension (ca. 8500 km²), Umbria represents a treasure trove of very interesting discoveries for Plio-Pleistocene vertebrate paleontology. Mentioned since the first half of the 19th century (Cuvier, 1821), in the following decades these discoveries began to draw the attention of the Italian scientific community (e.g., Verri, 1879; Pantanelli, 1886; Tuccimei, 1891, 1895; Clerici, 1894, 1895; Meli, 1895), including eminent scholars such as Giovanni Capellini, who published at least three contributions on Umbrian mammals (Capellini, 1888, 1889, 1890).

From the paleogeographic point of view, during the Plio-Pleistocene, central Italy was intersected by a set of NW-SE trending grabens related to the eastward migration of the Apennine extensional deformation (Martini & Sagri, 1993; Pascucci et al., 1999; Collettini et al., 2006). These depressions were filled by marine sediments on the west and by continental sediments on the east, with the transition between the two realms (i.e., the Tyrrenian paleocoast) crossing western Umbria from Città della Pieve south-east to Orvieto (Ambrosetti et al., 1987; Bizzarri & Baldanza, 2020). The main intermontane basin in the central-eastern part of the region is the Tiberino Basin (Fig. 1a), which extends for ca. 1800 km<sup>2</sup> from Sansepolcro to Terni (southwest) and Spoleto (southeast) (Basilici, 1997). This extensional basin, historically erroneously interpreted as a single huge lake ("Tiberino Lake"; Lotti, 1917), has actually been occupied at least over the last 3 Ma by a complex and dynamic system of lake, marsh, and river environments interconnected each other (Basilici, 1997). Among the smaller basins, it is worth noting the Tavernelle-Pietrafitta Basin (Fig. 1a), located south of Trasimeno Lake, characterized alternatively by lacustrine/palustrine and alluvial plain conditions during the Plio-Pleistocene. This basin hosts the most important Umbrian fossiliferous site, and one of the most important in Europe, that is, Pietrafitta (Martinetto et al., 2014; Sorbelli et al., 2021, and references therein). The Tavernelle-Pietrafitta Basin is interposed between the Tiberino Basin to the east and the Valdichiana Basin to the west (Fig. 1a). The latter develops from north-west to south-east along the Tuscany-Umbria-Latium boundary and has been filled by shallow marine and continental sediments since the early Pliocene (Bizzarri & Baldanza, 2020).

Reports on fossil continental mammals are abundant in the literature for the Tiberino Basin (e.g., localities of Pantalla, Torre Picchio, Podere San Lorenzo, Villa San Faustino, among others) and for the Tavernelle-Pietrafitta Basin (see the aforementioned site of Pietrafitta) and, following the steps traced by the famous 19th century researchers, they have been the subject of many modern studies and revisions (e.g., Sardella et al., 1995, 2018; Girotti et al., 2003; Cherin et al., 2016, 2019a). On the contrary, in the western part of Umbria (i.e., in the Valdichiana Basin), the occurrence of marine vertebrates is known above all (fossil cetaceans from the Allerona area; Baldanza et al., 2018).

This knowledge gap is filled by the Vigna Nuova local faunal assemblage (LFA), which represents the only record of continental mammals from this portion of the regional territory. The collection was briefly mentioned by Gentili (1993). A faunal list was published by Petronio et al. (2002) and copied-and-pasted by Argenti (2004), who also stated that the Vigna Nuova LFA should be referred to the Tasso faunal unit (FU) "for its stratigraphic position with respect to Pietrafitta and its paleontological assemblage (mainly for the presence of *Megantereon cultridens*)" (Argenti, 2004: 70).

Here we provide the first systematic study of the Vigna Nuova LFA, ascertaining that, in fact, it is made up of two distinct assemblages, one of which offers some surprising biochronological information.

# 

The Vigna Nuova LFA was unearthed in 1989 during excavation works on the front of a hill (named "Greppo Lidolfo") for the planting of a vineyard (hence the name, which means "new

GEOLOGICAL SETTING AND TAPHONOMY

vineyard"). The site is located near Piegaro (Perugia; 42°58'04.2"N, 12°04'04.7"E) at the easternmost border of the Valdichiana Basin (Fig. 1a).

112

113

114

115

116

117

118

119

120

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

132

133

134

135

136

137

Some inconsistencies exist as regards the stratigraphy of the deposits cropping out in the area. In the description of the Geological Map of Italy in 1:50,000 scale (Foglio 310, Passignano sul Trasimeno), Barchi & Marroni (2010) mention the Vigna Nuova assemblage as recovered from the Fosso Cigne Unit (Tiberino Basin, Nestore Synthem). Following Argenti (2004), the assemblage, hence the unit, is referred to the Tasso FU (ca. 1.8 Ma). Conversely, the most recent Umbrian geological mapping projects (Regione Umbria, 2013) include the Vigna Nuova locality in the Meletto Unit (Valdichiana Basin, Sanfatucchio Synthem), also referred to the Tasso FU. The Meletto Unit is very similar to and probably partially heteropic with the nearby Gioiella Unit, which yielded important samples of terrestrial mammals in the surroundings of the homonymous town, in particular at the locality of Selvella (De Giuli, 1987), which is located only 16 km north-west of Vigna Nuova (Fig. 1a). The Selvella LFA, originally dated at ca. 1 Ma (De Giuli, 1987), is today referred to the Farneta FU (ca. 1.5 Ma; Alberdi & Palombo, 2013; Cirilli et al., 2020). In fact, the lithological and sedimentological features of the Fosso Cigne and Meletto Units are quite similar. Both are mainly composed by conglomerates with a reddish medium-coarse sand matrix. Clasts are poorly sorted and predominantly made of sandstone in the first unit and carbonate in the second. The main difference is that the Fosso Cigne conglomerates have channeled geometry, while those of Meletto show no clear structures. Unfortunately, the Vigna Nuova outcrop (about 6 m in height) today is almost completely covered by vegetation, so it is not possible to describe the local stratigraphic succession. The few exposed portions (Fig. 1b) are made of conglomerates with rounded, polygenic clasts, sometimes with imbricate bedding, alternating with thin layers of medium-coarse sand. The current evidence therefore does not allow to resolve the doubts about the stratigraphic attribution of the outcrop, for which further geological studies will be necessary.

Nonetheless, the taphonomic features of the Vigna Nuova mammal collection, coupled with excavation notes and labels, offer some hints on the stratigraphic context. Based on the lithology of

the embedding sediment (when available), color of fossils, and their mineralization, it is possible to clearly separate the collection into two groups. The first includes fossils embedded by or maintaining traces of a whitish-yellowish sand with carbonate matrix, rich in large-sized quartz crystals and spots of black organic matter. Calcite crystals can occur as coating and infills within larger bone cavities (e.g., medullary cavity in long bones). Bones are both mineralized and impregnated (i.e., minerals and secondarily organic matter filled the smaller cavities such as trabeculae; Fig. 2), thus being very heavy. Some show root traces. Few specimens (SABAP UMB 129847, 129849, 129852, 129853, 129869, 129881) are encrusted by a yellow-brown carbonate coating with reticular concretions. This assemblage is characterized by considerable variability in taphonomic attributes, ranging from poorly preserved isolated specimens (very abraded and broken bones) to well-preserved ones, sometimes still in anatomical connection. The weathering stages (Behrensmeyer, 1978) are heterogeneous, ranging from 0 to 4 (Fig. 2). Several taxa are recognized in this first assemblage (Supplementary Online Material), with about half of the identifiable specimens referred to Cervidae (see Systematic paleontology). On the contrary, only a bovid taxon (probably a single individual) is recognized in the second group of bones. These latter show traces of a dark-yellow to reddish sand. Mineralization is much less advanced and the inner cavities of the bones, regardless of their size, are empty. Most of the remains show evidence of abrasion and breakage typical of fluvial transport, whereas weathering is low (Fig. 2) suggesting little time spent in a sub-aerial environment prior to burial.

138

139

140

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

149

150

151

152

153

154

155

156

157

158

159

160

161

162

The observations above support the hypothesis that the two assemblages come from different stratigraphic layers. The remains of the second group certainly come from the conglomerates cropping out at Vigna Nuova. A putative fluvial depositional environment for these sediments is compatible with the taphonomic features of bovid bones. On the other side, no traces of the sediments associated to the fossils of the first group are visible today in the field. Based on original notes and labels, we know that the paleontological material was recovered near the bottom of the hill, therefore from a portion of the succession that is no longer exposed today. On the basis of the few lithological

and taphonomic elements available, we can assume that this lower layer was a paleosol, but only future studies in the area could confirm this hypothesis.

The fossils of the two assemblages are treated as separate (lower layer and upper layer) hereinafter.

167

163

164

165

166

168

169

### MATERIALS AND METHODS

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

179

180

181

182

183

184

185

186

187

188

The studied material is curated by SABAP UMB and was prepared/restored and studied at the Dipartimento di Fisica e Geologia of the Università degli Studi di Perugia (Italy). For preparation details see Cherin et al. (2019a). The identification codes of the SABAP UMB are of two types: those assigned in the past have six digits (e.g., SABAP\_UMB 129842), while those recently assigned are composed of an alphanumeric code such as SABAP\_UMB 22.S241-3.263 (the complete list is provided in Supplementary Online Material). In the manuscript the identifier "S241-" is omitted, thus obtaining a code like SABAP UMB 22.3.263.

Identification of paleontological specimens is based on anatomical descriptions and morphological comparative analysis. Biometric/statistical comparisons are performed is some cases. In particular, for equids, bivariate plots and PCA were built in R Environment v. 1.4.1103 (R Core Team, 2013), using the packages prcomp() v. 3.6.2 (Venables & Ripley, 2008) and ggplot2() v. 3.3.3 (Wickham, 2016). PCA were performed on third metatarsals, using the parameter scale = T to have a unit variance before starting the analyses in R. The Log10 Ratio diagrams on third metatarsals are based on the log-transformed mean values of the Höwenegg Hippotherium primigenium von Meyer, 1829 (Bernor et al., 1997). The Höwenegg H. primigenium sample represents a well-studied, homogeneous sample of a single species of Equinae, for which the full range of descriptive statistics (mean, standard deviation, confidence limits, and minimum, maximum, and median values) are available for each bone, including the cranium, mandible, and teeth.

189	All measurements are taken with digital calipers and are given with a precision of 0.1 mm.
190	Measurements are provided in Supplementary Online Material. Sources of data used for comparisons
191	and measurement and anatomical abbreviations are indicated in the relative figure/table captions.
192	Anatomical and/or measurement nomenclature follows Eisenmann et al. (1988) and Bernor et
193	al. (1997) for equids; Sala (1986), Masini (1989), and Duvernois (1990) for bovids; Heintz (1970)
194	for cervids; Fujita et al. (2010) and Cherin et al. (2018) for suids.
195	Institutional abbreviations - AUT, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece; IGF, Museo
196	di Storia Naturale, Sezione di Geologia e Paleontologia, Università di Firenze, Italy; IPS, Institut
197	Català de Paleontologia Miquel Crusafont, Spain; LAMC, Natural History Museums of Los Angeles
198	County, USA; MCL, Musée des Confluences de Lyon, France; NHMB, Natural History Museum
199	Basel, Switzerland; SABAP_UMB, Soprintendenza Archeologia Belle Arti e Paesaggio dell'Umbria,
200	Italy.
201	
202	
203	SYSTEMATIC PALEONTOLOGY (LOWER LAYER)
204	
205	Class Mammalia Linnaeus, 1758
206	Order CARNIVORA Bowdich, 1821
207	Family Felidae Fischer von Waldheim, 1817
208	Genus Megantereon Croizet & Jobert, 1828
209	cf. Megantereon
210	(Fig. 3)

Referred material – Fragmented right upper canine (SABAP\_UMB 129842).

Description – SABAP\_UMB 129842 (Fig. 3a) preserves the root and a small part of the crown without appreciable crenulations on the edges. The root is moderately curved in mesiodistal direction. In mesial view, the tooth appears overall stouter and only slightly compressed labiolingually.

Comparisons and discussion – Sabertoothed felids (subfamily Machairodontinae) are a widespread group of top predators in the Plio-Pleistocene carnivoran guilds of Europe and several other parts of the world (Antón, 2013).

The fragmentary nature of the specimen from Vigna Nuova does not permit detailed comparisons. The absence/presence of crenulations along the mesial and distal edges of the crown is the more reliable criteria to differentiate Smilodontini and Homotherini, with the latter normally showing clear crenulations. However, the absence of crenulations in the small preserved portion of the crown of SABAP\_UMB 129842 could be due to preservation issues. The morphology of the crown is another diagnostic character, being normally stouter and less compressed in *Homotherium* and slenderer and more labiolingually compressed in *Megantereon*. Unfortunately, this character cannot be assessed too. The curvature of the root in SABAP\_UMB 129842 is intermediate between that of *Megantereon cultridens* Cuvier, 1824 from Villarroya and that of *Homotherium crenatidens* Fabrini, 1890 from the Incarcal complex as can be seen in Fig. 4a. The morphology of the tip of the root is not rounded as in Smilodontini, but more pointed as in *Homotherium* (Fig. 4a). However, the taxonomic value of this character is not discussed in the literature and we do not know its variability other than in the samples we have selected for comparison.

To solve these issues, we built a violin plot of the ratio between labiolingual with and mesiodistal length of the upper canine of Old World *Homotherium* and *Megantereon* (Fig. 4b). Our results show that the studied specimen fully falls into the range if *Megantereon* species, although it is also close to the earliest representatives of the *Homotherium* lineage (i.e., early Pliocene of Odessa Catacombs), for which however, biometric variation is virtually unknown due to poor record.

Accordingly, we confidently refer the studied specimen to cf. *Megantereon*.

239	Family CANIDAE Fischer von Waldheim, 1817
240	Genus Canis Linnaeus, 1758
241	Canis sp.
242	(Fig. 3)
243	
244	Referred material - Articulated cervical vertebrae 3-7 (SABAP_UMB 129850); rib
245	(SABAP_UMB 129875); thoracic vertebra 1 and rib fragments (SABAP_UMB 129877); articulated
246	thoracic vertebrae 2-3 (SABAP_UMB 129879).
247	Description - The canid material from Vigna Nuova is represented only by elements of the
248	axial skeleton, all belonging to a single individual. The articulated cervical vertebrae 3-7 (C3-7;
249	SABAP_UMB 129850) have retained their original shape, even if they miss some portions (Fig. 3b).
250	The spinous process is still present only in C3, while the right transverse process is preserved only in
251	C4-6. The vertebrae have a long and stout body, which gradually became shorter and narrower
252	towards C7 (see measurements in Supplementary Online Material). The first thoracic vertebra (T1;
253	SABAP_UMB 129877 partim) preserves only the body and few fragments of the neural arch. T2 and
254	T3 are still articulated (SABAP_UMB 129879) and in the former, a slender, long, and posteriorly
255	directed spinous process is still visible, but half broken (Fig. 3d). The two most complete ribs
256	(SABAP_UMB 129875 and SABAP_UMB 129877 partim; Fig. 3c) probably correspond to the first
257	pair, as they perfectly articulate into the articular facets on T1-T2.
258	Comparisons and discussion - The first occurrence of Canis in Europe has long been regarded
259	as one of the main biochronological markers of the onset of the Late Villafranchian, i.e., the so-called
260	"wolf event" (Azzaroli, 1983; Azzaroli et al., 1988; Torre et al., 1992, 2001). Nevertheless, further
261	discoveries such as those of Canis sp. in the Early Villafranchian of Vialette (France; Lacombat et
262	al., 2008) and in the Middle Villafranchian of Coste San Giacomo (Italy; Bellucci et al., 2012, 2014),
263	point to an earlier arrival of Canis in Western Europe and support a model of diachronous dispersal
264	across the continent (Sotnikova & Rook, 2010). Aside from the aforementioned records of Canis

sensu stricto in the Early-Middle Villafranchian, several species are recognized in later times, including *Canis etruscus* Forsyth Major, 1877, *Canis arnensis* Del Campana, 1913, and *Canis mosbachensis* Soergel, 1928, among others (Cherin et al., 2014; Bartolini-Lucenti & Rook, 2016; Bartolini-Lucenti et al., 2017, 2020 and references therein).

The C3 and C4 from Vigna Nuova show striking morphological resemblance with the same vertebrae of *C. etruscus* from Olivola (Italy; IGF 4523) figured by Torre (1967: plate VIII, fig. 8). In turn, the same author stated that the postcranial morphology of *C. etruscus* does not differ significantly from that of the extant wolf *Canis lupus* Linnaeus, 1758, except in relatively smaller dimensions (Torre 1967: 131). The vertebrae from Vigna Nuova are extremely similar to those of Olivola especially in the relative development of the pre- and postzygapophyses with respect to the neural arch and body, in the inclination (ca. 45° anterodorsally to posteroventrally) of the anterior and posterior articular facets in lateral view, and in the ventral projection of the posterior portion of the body relative to the anterior (i.e., the ventral edge of the body is inclined posteroventrally in lateral view) (Fig. 3e-f). In addition to the morphological similarities, the vertebrae are also very similar in size (e.g., the length of the body is 35.6 versus 34.7 mm in C3 and 31.4 versus 32.1 mm in C4 in SABAP\_UMB 129850 and IGF 4523, respectively). However, despite these similarities with *C. etruscus*, the sample from Vigna Nuova does not offer sufficient diagnostic characters for identification at the species rank and is therefore referred to *Canis* sp.

Family MUSTELIDAE Fischer von Waldheim, 1817

Mustelidae indet.

286 (Fig. 3)

Referred material – Crown of left upper canine (SABAP UMB 22.3.263).

Description – An almost complete canine crown from the Vigna Nuova collection can be attributed to a small-sized carnivoran (Fig. 3g). The crown is straight and has a roughly circular

section along all its height. The lingual wall is smooth, whereas the labial one shows a shallow vertical furrow in distolabial position and another groove, markedly deeper, in mesiolabial position. Neither of them reaches the apex of the crown. The latter is relatively rounded. A well-developed keel is present along the mesial margin of the tooth and a weaker one along the distal one.

Comparisons and discussion – The incompleteness of the specimen hinders any attempt at taxonomic attribution. Assuming that it is an upper canine (due to the virtually absent curvature of the crown) of the left side (due to the position of furrows and keels), the field can be restricted to small-sized carnivorans (the preserved portion of the crown is about 1 cm in height). We can exclude felids and canids, characterized by upper canines with more marked curvature, very pointed apexes, and labiolingual flattening (i.e., elliptical section). The greatest similarities are found with the mustelids, which instead have straight upper canines, with an approximately circular section and a complex of furrows corresponding, in relative position and development, to that of SABAP\_UMB 22.3.263. The overall size of the latter is approximately between that of a marten and that of a badger, i.e., it approaches that of extinct forms such as *Pannonictis* (see Colombero et al., 2012).

### Order PROBOSCIDEA (Illiger, 1811)

Proboscidea indet.

Referred material – Rib fragment (SABAP UMB 22.3.264).

Description – The only available proboscidean material is a small fragment of a rib.

Comparisons and discussion – At least four proboscideans occur in the European Villafranchian mammal assemblages: Mammut borsoni (Hays, 1834), Anancus arvernensis (Croizet & Jobert, 1828), Mammuthus rumanus (Stefanescu, 1924), and Mammuthus meridionalis (Nesti, 1825) (approximately in stratigraphic order, from older to younger). Due to the fragmentation of the available specimen, it is not possible to refer it to a specific taxon.

317	Order Perissodactyla Owen, 1848
318	Family EQUIDAE Gray, 1821
319	Genus Equus Linnaeus, 1758
320	Equus cf. senezensis Prat, 1964
321	(Fig. 5)
322	
323	Referred material - Articulated left metacarpals II-III-IV, proximal part (SABAP_UMB
324	129840); left metacarpal III, proximal epiphysis (SABAP_UMB 129857); cervical vertebrae
325	(SABAP_UMB 129867, SABAP_UMB 129874); left astragalus (SABAP_UMB 129869); mandible
326	with left and right c1-i3 and left p2, divided into two pieces (SABAP_UMB 129835+129837); partial
327	left hindlimb in anatomical connection with distal tibia, tarsus, metatarsals II-III-IV (SABAP_UMB
328	129856+129861+129862+129868).
329	Description - The mandible SABAP_UMB 129835+129837 includes a well-preserved left p2
330	with medium-high stage of wear. It shows a short and blunt anterostylid, the metaconid is small and
331	rounded, and the metastylid is pointed distally. The linguaflexid is V-shaped, a feature diagnostic of
332	stenonian horses. The ectoflexid is very shallow. The preflexid is short whereas the postflexid is
333	longer with simple ornamented morphology. This last feature indicates an advanced wearing stage.
334	A small pli caballinid is present on the mesial border of the hypoconid. The anterior portion of the
335	mandible exhibits a slender symphysis with the left mandibular body partially preserved. The lower
336	incisors show a high degree of wear, with the infundibulum not always present (e.g., left i1). The
337	lower canines are visible as small blunt enamel knobs that emerge from the mandible about 1 cm
338	behind the i3s.
339	SABAP_UMB 129840 includes a left third metacarpal (MC3) preserving about half diaphysis
340	and the proximal epiphysis. It has a narrow appearance in anterior view, although not slender. The
341	proximal epiphysis has a flat articular surface for the magnum and large articular facets for the second

and fourth metacarpals (MC2, MC4). The latter are almost complete and preserved in anatomical connection.

342

343

344

345

346

347

348

349

350

351

352

353

354

355

356

357

358

359

360

361

362

363

364

365

366

367

specimen is articulated left hindlimb SABAP UMB The complete the 129856+129861+129862+129868. The tibia preserves the diaphysis and the distal epiphysis, lacking the proximal one. Its general appearance is rather bulky. Much information about the morphology of the distal epiphysis cannot be not observed due the presence of the astragalus and calcaneum in anatomical connection, with some sediment in between. The latter bones are complete. The calcaneum has a short and robust corpus, with a well-preserved massive tuber calcanei. The morphology of the other ankle elements (central, first+second, third, and fourth tarsal bones) cannot be described due to anatomical connection. The second, third, and fourth metatarsals (MT2-4) are articulated and complete. The MT3 appears robust, due the reduced maximal length, the relatively large proximal and distal epiphyses, and the wide circular diaphysis. The distal epiphysis has small medial and lateral protuberances, which are not larger than the medial and lateral trochleae. The latter are round, with a well-developed *crista sagittalis* in between. In posterior view, the long lines for the attachment of the interosseus ligaments connecting the MT2 and MT4 are partially preserved.

SABAP\_UMB 129869 is a left astragalus, with incomplete and weathered articular surface for the calcaneum. The astragalus has a short and massive aspect, with small medial and lateral trochleae and a large medial *tuberculum tali* for the attachment of the *ligamentum collaterale*. The trochlear groove is large.

Comparisons and discussion – In Europe, the Equus Datum is marked by the appearance of the large-sized Equus livenzovensis Bajgusheva, 1978, occurring at the beginning of the Pleistocene (ca. 2.6 Ma) in the localities of Liventsovka (Russia), Montopoli (Italy), Roca-Neyra (France), and El-Rincón 1 (Spain) (Alberdi et al., 1997, 1998; Azzaroli, 2000; Bernor et al., 2018, 2019; Rook et al., 2019; Cirilli et al., 2021a, 2021b, 2021c). This biochronological event represents the dispersal of the monodactyl horses form North America into the Old World, with the species Equus simplicidens Cope, 1892 as the most likely original pool for the Eurasian species. During the Gelasian, monodactyl

equids diversified in different species such as Equus stenonis Cocchi, 1867, Equus major Depéret in Delafond & Depéret, 1893 ex Boule, Equus senezensis, and Equus stehlini Azzaroli, 1964. Equus stenonis represents the most widespread species during this time frame, with its first occurrence in the Early Pleistocene site of Saint Vallier (France; 2.45 Ma; dating in Nomade et al., 2014). This species dispersed in western Eurasia, from Caucasus to the Iberian Peninsula, and diversified into different populations/ecomorphotypes (Palombo & Alberdi, 2017; Cherin et al., 2021; Cirilli et al., 2021a). The distribution of E. major is still not well defined, but at the present time it seems mostly present in Central, North, and Eastern Europe (Palombo & Alberdi, 2017). Cirilli (2022) reported some new insights on the evolution and dispersals of the Gelasian medium-small sized horses. Recent research on the Middle Villafranchian localities of Senèze (France) and Coste San Giacomo (Italy) have confirmed the presence of a medium-sized horse, intermediate between E. stenonis and E. stehlini (Palombo et al., 2017; Cirilli et al., 2021a; Cirilli, 2022), identified as E. senezensis. The species was originally described as a subspecies of E. stenonis, namely E. stenonis senezensis, by Prat (1964, 1980) from the locality of Senèze (France; 2.2-2.0 Ma; dating in Nomade et al., 2014). Subsequently, Alberdi et al. (1998) questioned its subspecific rank, suggesting a better attribution to the species level. This interpretation was supported by the revision of the European E. stenonis and E. stehlini samples undertaken by Cirilli et al. (2021a) and Cirilli (2022), suggesting that the mediumsized horse from Senèze truly represents a different species during the Early Pleistocene. Beside Senèze, E. senezensis has been reported also in Italy, from the Early Pleistocene localities of Coste San Giacomo and Montecarlo (Upper Valdarno Basin). These sites have been dated at ca. 2.2–2.1 Ma (Ghinassi et al., 2005; Bellucci et al., 2012, 2014; Fidolini et al., 2013; Florindo et al., 2021), hence similar in age with Senèze. The European medium-sized horses of the late Early Pleistocene underwent a turnover at the Gelasian-Calabrian boundary. Indeed, the first occurrence of Equus altidens von Reichenau, 1915 has been recognized in the paleoanthropological site of Dmanisi (Georgia; 1.85–1.76 Ma), predating the first Italian occurrences of Farneta and Pirro Nord (Bernor et al., 2021). Equus altidens would appear to be the most geographically widespread species in the late

368

369

370

371

372

373

374

375

376

377

378

379

380

381

382

383

384

385

386

387

388

389

390

391

392

393

Early Pleistocene, sharing its range with the last representatives of *E. stenonis* and the earliest representatives of *Equus suessenbornensis* Wüst, 1900, and being part of an extensive faunal turnover occurring at ca. 1.8 Ma in Eastern Europe and slightly later in Central and Western Europe (Alberdi & Palombo, 2013; Palombo & Alberdi, 2017; Cirilli et al., 2020; 2021a; Bernor et al., 2021; Bartolini-Lucenti et al., 2022).

Morphometric comparisons on the Vigna Nuova equid remains are here provided based on the most relevant elements, namely the p2 and the complete MT3. Fig. 6a plots the maximum width (M6) versus maximum length (M1) for p2, comparing the Vigna Nuova specimen with the European Early Pleistocene species. SABAP\_UMB 129835 is included in the range of variation of *E. senezensis* from Senèze, and plots close to the largest *E. stehlini* (Upper Valdarno Basin) and the smallest *E. altidens* (Dmanisi and Venta Micena). It is well separated from the European *E. stenonis*, thus far highlighting its attribution to a medium-small sized species. *Equus suessenbornensis* represents the largest species considered in the plot, whereas *E. stenonis mygdoniensis* from Gerakarou-1 (Mygdonia Basin, Greece) overlaps the morphometric range of variation of *E. stehlini* and *E. altidens*.

More interesting results are depicted in the multivariate analyses on the MT3s. Fig. 6b shows the results for the MT3 PCA, with PC1 and PC2 accounting for 85.4% of the total variance (PC1 = 80.4%; PC2 = 5.0%). The loading distribution is reported as an inset in Fig. 6b and in Supplementary Online Material within the variance components. PC1 separates species by maximal length from negative to positive values (less to more elongate), whereas PC2 denoted a slenderer morphology from positive to negative values. The Vigna Nuova specimen is included in the range of variation of *E. senezensis*, distinct from the *E. stehlini* sample from Upper Valdarno and close to the smallest *E. altidens* individuals from Dmanisi. *Equus senezensis* occupies an intermediate position between *E. stenonis* and *E. stehlini*, confirming the previous results obtained by Cirilli et al. (2021b) and Cirilli (2022). *Equus stehlini* is well separated from the rest of the comparative sample and shows a narrow and massive MT3 morphology, with the largest *E. stehlini* specimens overlapping the smallest *E. senezensis*. On the other hand, the medium-sized *E. altidens* shows a slenderer morphology, with a

more elongated maximal length a reduced diaphysis. The Dmanisi and Pirro Nord populations overlap their range of variation, whereas the sample from Venta Micena (Spain) is somewhat larger. The Gerakarou-1 medium-sized *E. stenonis mygdoniensis* is included in the range shown by the European *E. altidens* samples. The European *E. stenonis* samples (Saint Vallier, Olivola, Matassino, and Upper Valdarno Basin) overlap in their range of variation, characterized by larger dimensions and more robust morphology than the medium-sized *E. senezensis* and *E. altidens. Equus eisenmannae* Qiu et al., 2004 from Longdan (China) and *E. livenzovensis* exhibit again longer MT3s when compared with *E. simplicidens* and *E. stenonis*, whereas *E. major* and *E. suessenbornensis* remain the largest equid species from the European Early Pleistocene.

420

421

422

423

424

425

426

427

428

429

430

431

432

433

434

435

436

437

438

439

440

441

442

443

444

445

These results are also confirmed in the Log10 ratio diagrams on MT3. Fig. 6c plots the mean values of the European Gelasian Equus species, whereas Fig. 6d shows the Calabrian ones. Both diagrams include the complete MT3 (SABAP UMB from Vigna Nuova 129856+129861+129862+129868 partim). As shown in Fig. 6c, the Vigna Nuova MT3 has a pattern close to that of E. senezensis from Senèze, characterized by a reduced maximum length (M1) and robust diaphysis, proximal, and distal epiphyses (M3-M14). It is overall larger than that of E. stehlini (Upper Valdarno), whereas the incomplete MT3 from Montecarlo (Upper Valdarno Basin) plots in between. The Vigna Nuova MT3 is smaller than that of E. stenonis, although showing a similar pattern. Fig. 6d compares the Vigna Nuova MT3 with the E. altidens samples and E. suessenbornensis. Although SABAP UMB 129856+129861+129862+129868 partim shows similar dimensions in the proximal and distal epiphyses than E. altidens, but its M1-M3 pattern is much different form the E. altidens samples, which show a slender morphology with a more elongated M1 and reduced M3. SABAP UMB 129856+129861+129862+129868 partim exhibits the same M3 values of E. altidens from Venta Micena, the largest among the E. altidens samples. As reported in the PCA, *E. stenonis mygdoniensis* from Gerakarou-1 is included in the European *E. altidens* samples.

Considering this evidence, we ascribe the medium-sized equid from Vigna Nuova to *E.* cf. *senezensis*, recognizing their close similarities, especially in the postcranial elements.

446	
447	Order Artiodactyla Owen, 1848
448	Family BOVIDAE Gray, 1821
449	Genus Leptobos Rütimeyer, 1877-1878
450	cf. Leptobos
451	(Fig. 7)
452	
453	Referred material – Horn core fragment (SABAP_UMB 129851).
454	Description - The only bovid fossil from the Vigna Nuova lower layer is a fragment of horn
455	core. Unfortunately, it is so heavily weathered and abraded that the surface is no longer visible. Faint
456	parallel furrows are visible along one of the edges. The horn core is virtually straight and does not
457	show clear spiralization.
458	Comparisons and discussion - Based on the absence of curvature and spiralization, specimen
459	SABAP_UMB 129851 is here referred to cf. Leptobos (see detailed discussion in the section on the
460	bovid remains from the upper layer of Vigna Nuova).
461	
462	Family CERVIDAE Goldfuss, 1820
463	Genus Croizetoceros Heintz, 1970
464	Croizetoceros ramosus (Croizet & Jobert, 1828)
465	(Fig. 7)
466	
467	Referred material – Left maxilla with P2-M3 (SABAP_UMB 129863).
468	Description - Specimen SABAP_UMB 129863 belongs to an adult individual with teeth in
469	moderate stage of wear. The upper premolars are relatively large and similar in size to each other. In
470	occlusal view, the P3 and especially the P2 stand out for the pointed lingual margin. The P4 has a
471	more squared lingual margin, with a slight hint of molarization (i.e., a faint vertical groove crosses

the lingual wall of the tooth). On the labial side, the three premolars show pointed parastyle and metastyle and, between them, a strong pillar of the paracone, which is mesially shifted and points forward. The upper molars are similar to each other in overall morphology and exhibit lingual cones with trapezoidal shape. The protoconal fold (*pli protoconal*) is noticeable in the M3, present but not marked in the M2, and not visible in the M1 due to the more advanced wear. A sharp entostyle is developed in all molars, while no lingual cingula are present.

Comparisons and discussion – Croizetoceros is an extinct cervid with uncertain phylogenetic relationships and body size smaller than the Dama-like deer (see section on 'Pseudodama' below). The genus is reported in Europe since the late Miocene with scanty remains (Azanza, 2000) and becomes a relatively common element of the Early-Middle Villafranchian assemblages with the species C. ramosus, ranging from Spain to Greece, with different samples sometimes referred to different subspecies (Valli, 2004 and references therein). Croizetoceros sp. is reported based on a single tooth from the Pliocene of Burdur (Turkey; Mayda et al., 2017).

The main dental features of *C. ramosus* are well described by Heintz (1970) on the basis of several samples from France and Spain, and resumed by Valli (2004) with reference to the richest European collection, namely that of Saint Vallier (France). Most of the recognized features can be found also in the Vigna Nuova specimen, including the asymmetrical development of the strong pillar of the paracone in the premolars, the presence of the protoconal fold in the molars, the relative development of the styles on the labial wall of the molars. In particular, the maxilla from Vigna Nuova shows striking morphological similarities with some known specimens of *C. ramosus* such as NHMB Prr.346 from the type locality of Les Etouaires (France), MCL QSV-766 from Saint Vallier, AUT GER-188 from Gerakarou (Greece), IPS28245/740b from La Puebla de Valverde (Spain) (see Fig. 8 for comparisons). Dimensionally, the Vigna Nuova specimen falls into the lower part of the range of *C. ramosus*, approaching in particular to the material from Gerakarou (measurements in Supplementary Online Material). However, it must be noted that the apparently larger size of the specimens from the French localities of Saint Vallier, Pardines, and Les Etouaires could be due to a

slightly different measuring technique (Supplementary Online Material). The same applies to the ratio between the premolar and molar length (LP/LM), which is 0.70 in SABAP\_UMB 129863 and between 0.69 and 0.79 in *C. ramosus* from several localities (Heintz, 1970; Kostopoulos, 1996; Kostopoulos & Athanassiou, 2005).

The overall size of SABAP\_UMB 129863 is also similar to the average values of small-sized cervids of the roe deer lineage (i.e., *Procapreolus*, *Capreolus*). However, these latter taxa are well recognizable in the more articulated occlusal pattern of the upper teeth (e.g., numerous enamel folds that develop into the fossae), unlike the relatively simple morphology observed in SABAP\_UMB 129863. Moreover, roe deer have more elongated premolar series with respect to molars. For instance, the average LP/LM is 0.92 in *Procapreolus cusanus* from Les Etouaires (Heintz, 1970), 0.89 in *Capreolus cusanoides* from Untermassfeld (Germany) and 0.84 in *Capreolus suessenbornensis* from Süssenborn (Germany) (personal data).

The above lines of evidence allow us to confidently refer the Vigna Nuova maxilla to *C. ramosus*, of which it represents one of the most complete and better-preserved specimens in Italy.

Genus 'Pseudodama' Azzaroli, 1992

*'Pseudodama'* sp.

515 (Fig. 7)

Referred material – Left i2 (SABAP\_UMB 129841); right frontal bone fragment with basal antler (SABAP\_UMB 129843); left frontal bone fragment with basal antler (SABAP\_UMB 129844); left frontal bone fragment with basal antler (SABAP\_UMB 129845); right frontal bone fragment with basal antler (SABAP\_UMB 129846); right hemimandible with p3-m3 (SABAP\_UMB 129848); antler fragments (SABAP\_UMB 129849, SABAP\_UMB 129853, SABAP\_UMB 129881); left hemimandible fragment with dp4 (broken), m1, and m2 (SABAP\_UMB 129860+129865), right M1

(SABAP\_UMB 129870); broken left m3 (SABAP\_UMB 129871); left i3 (SABAP\_UMB 129872); left i1 (SABAP\_UMB 129873); right antler fragment (SABAP\_UMB 129880).

Description – Fossils of a medium-sized deer are relatively common in the Vigna Nuova collection. The antler remains SABAP\_UMB 129843, SABAP\_UMB 129844, SABAP\_UMB 129845, and SABAP\_UMB 129846 are quite similar to each other both in shape and dimensions (measurements in Supplementary Online Material). All show a basal portion of the beam with an almost circular section and the insertion of the first tine (unfortunately never preserved) at a certain distance above the burr. The pedicles are also roughly circular in section (measurements in Supplementary Online Material). The most complete specimen (SABAP\_UMB 129880) is a long fragment of right antler with basis of the basal tine, but missing the burr. The basal tine branches at about 3 cm from the bottom edge of the antler. Above the basal tine, the beam runs roughly vertical, with a slight lateral curvature in the first part and a medial curvature in the second.

The only upper tooth is the isolated right M1 SABAP\_UMB 129870. It is virtually unworn and shows mesiodistally compressed lingual cones, between which a small entostyle develops. Mesiolingual, lingual, and distolingual cingula are present but weak. The labial styles are instead very prominent, as are the pillars of the labial cones.

The right hemimandible SABAP\_UMB 129848 bears the complete cheek tooth row, but in a very advanced stage of wear (the m1 is almost completely worn out). This prevents a detailed description of the dental morphology. In occlusal view, the lingual wall of the paraconid is open, that is, the paraconid and metaconid are not fused (i.e., "unmolarized" condition). Lingual cingula and a faint ectostylid are still visible in the m2 and m3, but not in the m1 due to wear. The lower molar morphology is better recognizable in the hemimandible fragment SABAP\_UMB 129865+129860, bearing a fragmented dp4 and complete m1 and m2. Both molars show a mesial cingulum and a prominent ectostylid in labial view.

The lower incisors SABAP\_UMB 129841, SABAP\_UMB 129872, and SABAP\_UMB 129873 may belong to the same individual based on preservation, relative size, and absent wear.

Comparisons and discussion – Pliocene and Pleistocene cervids with overall morphology and size similar to the extant fallow deer are known as Dama-like deer. Villafranchian and Epivillafranchian forms from Europe are characterized by un-palmated antlers with three or four points. These forms have been allocated into a variety of genera (e.g., Cervus, Dama, Axis, Rusa, Metacervocerus, Praeelaphus, etc.) and species, whose relationships with each other and with present-day species are not clear (see a summary in Cherin et al., 2019a). Azzaroli (1992) proposed to refer all these species to the genus *Pseudodama*, including the "Italian" lineage - with the species Pseudodama lyra Azzaroli, 1992, Pseudodama nestii (Azzaroli, 1947), and Pseudodama farnetensis Azzaroli, 1992 - and the "French" lineage - with the species Pseudodama pardinensis (Croizet & Jobert, 1828), Pseudodama rhenana (Dubois, 1904), and Pseudodama perolensis (Bout & Azzaroli, 1952). Although we believe that some of the aforementioned species could probably be synonymized, we follow Azzaroli's concept, recognizing significant similarities between them all (Breda & Lister, 2013; Breda, 2015), but also including the Epivillafranchian *Pseudodama vallonnetensis* (de Lumley et al., 1988) (Breda et al., 2020). However, pending a comprehensive phylogenetic analysis, we prefer to indicate the genus 'Pseudodama' with inverted commas (following Breda et al., 2015, 2020; Cherin et al., 2019a, among others).

The morphology and size of the identifiable material of middle-sized deer from Vigna Nuova are clearly akin to the genus 'Pseudodama'. On the other hand, the available fossils do not retain characters that allow for an attribution at the species rank, for which more complete craniodental remains (especially antlers) would have been needed. The antlers from Vigna Nuova differ from those of derived species of 'Pseudodama' such as 'P.' farnetensis and 'P.' vallonnetensis, in which the basal tine is normally inserted very close to or even leaning against the burr, as in the extant Dama. Similarly, the sub-vertical morphology of the best-preserved antler (SABAP\_UMB 129880) also recalls the earlier forms of 'Pseudodama' rather than the later ones, in which the antlers tend to diverge greatly posteriorly and laterally. However, these features must be considered with thoughtfulness because they can also be subject to ontogenetic variation.

Other primitive characters of the *Dama*-like deer from Vigna Nuova lie in the teeth and include the development of labial cones and styles and lingual cingulum in the upper molar (SABAP\_UMB 129870), enlarged i1 (SABAP\_UMB 129873), and un-molarized p4 (SABAP\_UMB 129848) (Azzaroli, 1947, 1992; Croitor, 2006; Pfeiffer, 2016). Another primitive condition is the high ratio between the lower premolar and molar lengths measured in SABAP\_UMB 129848 (Lp/Lm=0.69), which exceeds the average values available for 'P.' lyra from Montopoli (Italy; Lp/Lm=0.64, n=2), 'P.' rhenana from Saint Vallier (Lp/Lm=0.68, n=18) and Senèze (Lp/Lm=0.65, n=11), 'P.' nestii from Pantalla (Italy; Lp/Lm=0.68, n=3), Olivola (Italy; Lp/Lm=0.62, n=5) and Upper Valdarno (Italy; Lp/Lm=0.63, n=16). On the contrary, later forms of 'Pseudodama' show relatively shorter premolar rows, as can be seen in 'P.' farnetensis from Pietrafitta (Italy; Lp/Lm=0.63; n=5) and Pirro Nord (Italy; Lp/Lm=0.58; n=2) and 'P.' vallonnetensis from Untermassfeld (Germany; Lp/Lm=0.59; n=21) and Vallparadís Estació (Spain; Lp/Lm=0.57; n=9) (Breda, 2015; this paper).

In summary, the material of 'Pseudodama' of Vigna Nuova is suggested to belong to a basal species of the genus (e.g., 'P.' lyra, 'P.' rhenana), but the incompleteness of the specimens requires a cautious attribution to 'Pseudodama' sp.

591 Cervidae indet.

592 (Fig. 7)

Referred material – Left maxilla with dP2-M2 (SABAP UMB 129866).

Description – Specimen SABAP\_UMB 129866 is particularly interesting. It is a left maxillary fragment of a large-sized deer with deciduous premolars dP2-dP4, slightly worn M1, and freshly erupted M2. The dP2 is heavily worn and shows a distal lobe which is only slightly wider than the mesial one. Labially, the parastyle, paracone, and metastyle are pointed, while the metacone does not form a pillar on the labial wall. In the dP3, the distal lobe is significantly wider and shorter than the mesial one. On the labial wall, the pillar of the paracone and the mesostyle are particularly prominent

and are oriented mesially. A similar morphology characterizes the labial wall of the dP4, in which however, the two lingual cones are almost equally developed and constricted mesiodistally. In the M1, a low and rounded entostyle develops between the protocone and hypocone. The parastyle and mesostyle are very strong and stretch in labial direction. The M2 looks like a slightly larger version of the M1, although the entostyle is replaced by a lingual cingulum. In all teeth, the enamel on the lingual walls is rough.

Comparisons and discussion – The most common large-sized deer occurring in the Villafranchian is Eucladoceros, characterized by spectacular comb-like antlers (Azzaroli & Mazza, 1992; Croitor, 2018). Nevertheless, other groups of cervids of comparable size can be found in the same time interval, although their record is poorer. These include the enigmatic Arvernoceros, whose systematic status and chronological occurrence are debated (Heintz, 1970; Petronio & Pandolfi, 2011; Croitor, 2018). The genus Praemegaceros seems to replace Eucladoceros, at least in southwestern Europe, in the late Late Villafranchian (Abbazzi, 2004). Unfortunately, the diagnostic characters of all these forms reside mainly in the antlers, of which we have no evidence in Vigna Nuova. No peculiar character can be identified in the upper deciduous or permanent dentition, neither in shape nor in size. For this reason, the large-sized deer of Vigna Nuova remains unidentifiable.

Family SUIDAE Gray, 1821

Genus Sus Linnaeus, 1758

Sus cf. strozzii Forsyth Major, 1881

(Fig. 7)

Referred material – Fragmented right maxilla with P4-M2 and broken M3 (SABAP\_UMB 129847) and fragmented left maxilla with broken M3 (SABAP\_UMB 129852).

Description – SABAP\_UMB 129847 shows teeth with an advanced stage of wear that prevents a detailed description of the occlusal pattern. However, wear makes it possible to appreciate the

considerable thickness of the enamel in all preserved teeth. The P4 has a squarish occlusal outline, but appears slightly wider than long. A mesial cingulum and a distal cingulum are visible. The mesial one has a slight constriction in the middle. A hinted protoprestyle is visible. The protofossa is narrow, long and positioned lingually in the middle-mesial part of the tooth. The M1 is very worn (wear stage: 16, wear group: 4; Zeder & Lemoine, 2020), so much that the main cusps are unrecognizable. The tooth has a figure-eight shape in occlusal view, with the mesial lobe smaller than the distal one and a labial constriction between them. The M2 is similar in shape to the M1, but larger. Also in this molar, none of the four main cusps can be described in detail due to the state of wear (wear stage: 12, wear group: 2; Zeder & Lemoine, 2020). However, the difference in width between the mesial and distal lobe is more marked than in the M1. The mesial cingulum is flat and does not seem to bear a protopreconule. The oval-shaped paracone is narrow and in contact with the lingual cingulum. The residue of the protocone is pointed, tiny and slightly visible. The labial cingulum of the mesial lobe is broken but it is possible to recognize that a hypoectoconid was present. The transverse valley between the paracone and metacone is wide lingually and ends exactly halfway through the tooth; no tetrapreconule is visible. The tetracone is central and rectangular. In all the teeth no styles are visible in lingual and labial view.

627

628

629

630

631

632

633

634

635

636

637

638

639

640

641

642

643

644

645

646

647

648

649

650

651

652

No descriptions can be provided for SABAP\_UMB 129852 as the specimen preserves only a distal splinter of the M3, which however is dimensionally comparable to the corresponding tooth of SABAP\_UMB 129847 and shows a similarly high enamel thickness. Based on preservation features, it is likely that the two specimens belonged to the same individual.

Comparisons and discussion – The genus Sus, of putative Asian origin, spread rapidly towards Europe since the Pliocene and became a common element in the Early Pleistocene faunal assemblages throughout the continent (Cherin et al., 2020). The earliest member of this group is Sus arvernensis (Croizet & Jobert, 1828), occurring in Eurasia during the Ruscinian and Early Villafranchian. At the beginning of the Early Pleistocene, this species was replaced by the larger-sized S. strozzii. The latter survived in Europe at least until the end of the Early Pleistocene, although its presence during the

latest Villafranchian (i.e., ca. 1.7–1.3 Ma) is yet not confirmed [see the so-called "suid gap" hypothesis by Martinez-Navarro et al. (2015)] (Cherin et al., 2018, 2020). Starting from the Middle Pleistocene, the wild boar *Sus scrofa* Linnaeus, 1758 replaced *S. strozzii* rapidly expanding throughout Eurasia up to the present day (Cherin et al., 2020; Iannucci et al., 2020).

653

654

655

656

657

658

659

660

661

662

663

664

665

666

667

668

669

670

671

672

673

674

675

676

677

678

The distinction between the closely-related S. arvernensis and S. strozzii on one side and S. scrofa on the other, is easy when lower canines are available, even in the absence of complete skulls. This is because the first two species show a "verrucosic" morphology of lower canines, as opposed to the "scrofic" condition of S. scrofa (see Cherin et al., 2020). The lack of lower canines in the Vigna Nuova collection leads to rely only on biometric considerations (also because the advanced state of wear of the teeth in SABAP UMB 129847 prevents any detailed comparisons in dental morphology). The box-plots in Fig. 9 clearly show that the Pliocene S. arvernensis can be distinguished from S. strozzii and S. scrofa by its smaller size (especially molar length). SABAP UMB 129847 has relatively large-sized teeth, which fall in the ranges of these two latter species. Although in the literature there are several works in which an attempt has been made to recognize S. strozzii and S. scrofa on a dimensional basis (e.g., Ambrosetti et al., 1979; Faure & Guérin, 1983; Van der Made, 1999; Van der Made et al., 2017), Cherin et al. (2020) showed that this approach alone cannot be sufficient, especially when large samples are considered both geographically and chronologically (the wild boar shows enormous dimensional variation over time and space). As far as current knowledge is concerned, only the dimensions of the dp4 can be used for a statistically significant distinction between S. strozzii and S. scrofa (Iannucci et al., 2020). In this context, the length of the teeth of SABAP UMB 129847 alone is not decisive for the taxonomic identification of the specimen, while considerations on their proportions can be. In particular, the P4 exhibits a relatively low length-towidth ratio (i.e., it is more rectangular in occlusal view; Fig. 9). In this, it resembles S. strozzii rather than S. scrofa, which instead has a squarer P4. This evidence – associated with the very thick enamel possessed by the cheek teeth [i.e., one of the diagnostic characters of S. strozzii; Cherin et al. (2018)] - allows to refer the Vigna Nuova material to S. cf. strozzii.

6	/	9

680

681

682

683

684

686

687

689

690

691

696

697

699

700

702

704

685

688

692

693

694

695

698

701

703

The molars are mesiodistally elongated with well-separated lobes. The parastylid is well developed

SYSTEMATIC PALEONTOLOGY (UPPER LAYER)

Order ARTIODACTYLA Owen, 1848

Family BOVIDAE Gray, 1821

Genus Leptobos Rütimeyer, 1877-1878

cf. Leptobos

(Fig. 10)

129836); right metacarpal (SABAP UMB 129838); atlas (SABAP UMB 129839); intermediate

phalanx (SABAP\_UMB 129854); left P2 (SABAP\_UMB 129855); left tibia, proximal epiphysis

(SABAP UMB 129858); left tibia diaphysis (SABAP UMB 129876); humerus distal diaphysis

(SABAP UMB 129878); horn core fragments (SABAP UMB 22.3.248-22.3.252, 22.3.267); distal

phalanx fragments (SABAP UMB 22.3.256, SABAP UMB 22.3.266); cranium fragment

Nuova upper layer. The mandible (SABAP UMB 129836) includes the molars and the p4 with root

fragments of p2-p3. The teeth are all heavily worn. In the p4, the parastylid and paraconid are

separated by a shallow furrow, the protoconid is quite developed. The lingual valley between the

paraconid and protoconid strongly indents mesially. The metaconid is large and has the shape of a

blade, emerging lingually and strongly curving distally. The furrow separating the metaconid and

entoconid is quite deep and narrow due to the distal shift of the former. The entostylid and entoconid

are completely fused. The distal labial groove separating the protoconid from the hypoconid is strong.

Description – An incomplete hemimandible and an isolated P2 were recovered from the Vigna

(SABAP UMB 22.3.265); left medial malleolus fragment (SABAP UMB 22.3.268).

Referred material - Left hemimandible with p4-m3 and roots of p2-p3 (SABAP\_UMB

27

and mesially projecting. The protoconid and hypoconid are morphologically similar except for a slight mesiodistal constriction of the latter. The ectostylid emerges mesially from the distal lobe and lies almost attached to the protoconid. The entostylid is smaller than the parastylid and projects lingually. The inner enamel islets are halfmoon shaped. The mesial one is characterized by a constriction in the mid part. The islet of the distal lobe in m3 is marked by a bubaline fold (*sensu* Masini, 1989) in the distal portion. The cement is present in all the teeth, on both sides. The P2 SABAP\_UMB 129855 has an advanced stage of wear. The paracone and parastyle lie almost attached, separated by a shallow furrow that reaches the base of the tooth. The metacone is strongly reduced. The metastyle projects distally.

Several horn core fragments are part of the collection. Most of them present nutrient foramina and/or furrows on the outer side (e.g., SABAP\_UMB 22.3.248 and SABAP\_UMB 22.3.249) and clear sign of pneumatization in the inner portion (e.g., SABAP\_UMB 22.3.248 and SABAP\_UMB 22.3.251). Despite their scanty preservation, it is possible to state that all of the remains are characterized by a quite low degree of curvature and do not present evidences of spiralization.

The atlas SABAP\_UMB 129839 preserves most of the body and the left wing. Dorsally, the atlas is characterized by two large openings, on each wing, shifted towards the anterior portion of the bone, in which two foramina are located. The left wing projects posteriorly but not far from the posterior zygapophyses. The dorsal tubercle and the dorsal portion of the neural arch are missing. The alar fossae, visible on the ventral side of the wings, are large and relatively deep depressions. The posterior tubercle is partially preserved and not well developed. The anterior articular surface is almost complete and extends on the ventral side. The area connecting the two posterior zygapophyses is broad and flat.

The only complete metacarpal (SABAP\_UMB 129838) is relatively slender. It has an hourglass shape, with the two epiphyses having approximately the same width, mediolaterally wider than the diaphysis. The proximal epiphysis, seen from above, is D-shaped; the anterior margin is sub-rounded whereas the posterior one is straight. The lateral articular facet is triangular and much smaller than

the medial, which is sub-quadrangular with rounded anterior margin. The two facets are separated by a small crest perpendicular to the major axis of the articulation. The crest ends posteriorly in a deep, narrow groove which hosts the proximal nutrient foramen. Another foramen is present distally to the proximal end, connected with the former through a very narrow furrow. All the anterior border of the proximal epiphysis is characterized by a wrinkled tuberosity. The diaphysis has its minimum mediolateral width slightly above the mid-point. There are two shallow grooves in the proximo-anterior portion of the diaphysis. The anterior vascular groove at the distal shaft is narrow and shallow, getting deeper and marked by sharp edges distally. The ovoidal foramen is located just above the distal end of the vascular groove, covered by sediment. The mediolateral width at the contact area between the diaphysis and the distal epiphysis is slightly smaller than that across the trochleae. The intertrochlear margins as well as the crests are subparallel. The lateral and medial trochlear pits are deep and marked by faint radial rugosities. The lateral abaxial hemicondyle is anteroposteriorly thinner than the medial one.

The tibia remains includes a fragment of the diaphysis (SABAP\_UMB 129876) and a partial proximal epiphysis (SABAP\_UMB 129858). The articulation surface of the latter is composed by the two large condyles. Neither of these elements are complete. The proximally projected intercondylar eminences are partially preserved. The diaphysis fragment represents the proximal half of the tibia due to the visible crest running along one side of the shaft.

The intermediate phalanx SABAP\_UMB 129854 is complete and well preserved. The bone is stout, having a short and thick diaphysis. The proximal articulation is divided by the sagittal crest into two facets for the articulation with the proximal phalanx (abaxial and axial glenoid cavities). Posteriorly to the crest there is a deep U-shaped furrow. The abaxial cavity is slightly larger than the axial. The abaxial tubercle and the axial pit are visible although not well developed. The distal articular surface is subtriangular. The abaxial lobe has a pointed tip developing toward the diaphysis of the phalanx.

The other available specimens are heavily fragmented and do not allow for any detailed description.

756

757

758

759

760

761

762

763

764

765

766

767

768

769

770

771

772

773

774

775

776

777

778

779

780

781

Comparisons and discussion - The largest forms of bovids are part of the subfamily Bovinae which, during the earliest Pleistocene of Europe, was mainly represented by the genus *Leptobos*. This extinct taxon was populating most of the subtropical and temperate areas of Eurasia, spanning from the Iberian Peninsula to China, from Northern India to, possibly, British Islands (Cherin et al., 2019b). Although *Leptobos* has been matter of interest in numerous works (Merla, 1939; Pilgrim 1939; Masini, 1989; Duvernois, 1990; Cherin et al., 2019b, among others), there is still no consensus about its systematics and evolutionary history. Most of the scholars divide European Leptobos into two lineages/groups or subgenera (Masini, 1989; Duvernois, 1990, 1992; Masini et al., 2013; Cherin et al., 2019b; Sorbelli et al., 2021). The first includes the species Leptobos stenometopon (Sismonda, 1846), Leptobos elatus (Pomel, 1853), Leptobos merlai De Giuli (1987), and Leptobos furtivus Duvernois (1989) (called Leptobos ex gr. SEM hereinafter) constrained to the Early-Middle Villafranchian of Central and Western Europe; the second includes *Leptobos etruscus* (Falconer, 1868) and Leptobos vallisarni Merla (1949) (called Leptobos ex gr. EV hereinafter), limited to the Late Villafranchian of Europe and, as concerning the latter species, Asia (Masini et al., 2013; Tong et al., 2016; Sorbelli et al., 2021). Species of Leptobos ex gr. SEM are characterized by elongated neurocranium, "taurine" horns (i.e., laterally emerging, with strong anticlockwise spiralization), and slender limbs, whereas species of Leptobos ex gr. EV share shorter postcornual portion of the cranium, posterolaterally emerging horns with single curvature, and stouter limb proportions. During the last stages of the Villafranchian, a new group of large bovids reached Europe from Asia. These bovines represented the first western dispersal of Bison which, most probably, evolved in mainland Asia from a derivate stock of *Leptobos* at the end of the Pliocene (Sorbelli et al., 2021 and references therein). These forms of large and stout bovids, grouped in the subgenus Bison (Eobison), were well adapted to the harshened environmental condition that started to affect Europe during the Late Villafranchian and rapidly replaced *Leptobos* in all the herbivore guilds of the continent. With the

faunal turnover of the Early-Middle Pleistocene Transition (i.e., during the Epivillafranchian), *Eobison*, in turn, was replaced by the "true" *Bison*, which will be the dominant large bovids in all the Holarctic realm until the Holocene (Sorbelli et al., 2021).

782

783

784

785

786

787

788

789

790

791

792

793

794

795

796

797

798

799

800

801

802

803

804

805

806

Due to their general morphology and size, the sample from Vigna Nuova is referable to a large bovid. As already remarked, during the Early Pleistocene, the only European representatives of this group are *Leptobos* and *Bison* (*Eobison*). The proportions of metapodials, in particular metacarpals, are a useful taxonomic tool in order to discriminate between the various species belonging to these genera (Maniakas & Kostopoulos, 2017; Sorbelli et al., 2021). However, due to the high intraspecific variation that characterizes bovids, a cautious approach is recommended when dealing with small samples, as in the Vigna Nuova case. The single metacarpal from this locality shows a relatively slender built, with a long and thin diaphysis. In order to assess the robusticity of this element, a biplot diagram comparing the total length of the metacarpal and the ratio between the transversal width and the length is provided (Fig. 11). The Vigna Nuova specimen falls within the range of the largest Leptobos, in the area overlapping with Eobison and the slenderest specimens of Bison schoetensacki Freudenberg, 1914. The most imponent and robust species of *Leptobos* are those belonging to the EV group. While the postcranial skeleton of L. etruscus is well known, that of L. vallisarni is still poorly represented in the fossil record. Moreover, few limb bones referred to L. vallisarni are quite similar to those of L. etruscus, thus, without complete cranial elements or a large sample of postcranial remains, it is virtually impossible to discern the two taxa.

The lower dentition of *Leptobos* and *Bison* are quite similar, except for the evident increasing of hypsodonty and larger average size in the latter. The morphology of the p4 has been used as tool in order to differentiate the two groups of *Leptobos* (Masini, 1989; Duvernois, 1990). The distally projected metaconid, the strong hypoconid, and the deep distolabial groove are characters shared between the Vigna Nuova and *Leptobos* ex gr. EV. Nonetheless, several scholars underlined the strong variability affecting the tooth morphology of large bovids, remarking how taxonomic

inferences based on dentognathic remains should be taken cautiously (Skinner & Kaisen, 1945; Olsen, 1990; Sher, 1997, among others)

The horn core morphology is one of the most useful tools for taxonomic purposes. *Leptobos* ex gr. SEM features long, spiralized horns emerging posterolaterally. On the contrary, *Leptobos* ex gr. EV shows crescent moon-shaped cores with no or little torsion, emerging in a more posterior position than in the former group (i.e., smaller angle between the sagittal plane and the core's mid line) and gently curving inwards. *Eobison* is characterized by relatively small and stout horns, projecting laterally with strong upward bending and slight anticlockwise torsion. The horn core fragments from Vigna Nuova show a low degree of bending and no sign of torsions, as in *Leptobos* ex gr. EV. Other skeletal elements from Vigna Nuova do not bear/preserve diagnostic characters and are not discussed furtherly.

Despite their scantiness, the analyzed elements evidence that the bovid from the upper layer of Vigna Nuova has affinities with *Leptobos* ex gr. EV. However, due to the limited number and preservation of the fossils and the strong variation that characterizes this group of large bovids, we prefer to cautiously refer the sample to cf. *Leptobos* pending for new material from the locality.

824 CONCLUSIONS

The fossil mammals from Vigna Nuova, collected more than thirty years ago, have revealed new extremely intriguing data. First of all, the combination of taphonomic, historical, and, to a lesser extent, geological data made it possible to divide the sample into two different assemblages. The one coming from what we have called the "upper layer" of Vigna Nuova (i.e., the only portion still visible in the outcrop), is made up of 18 identifiable remains, plus about 25 unidentifiable ones. The identifiable material is all assigned to cf. *Leptobos* in the light of morphological affinities with this genus of Villafranchian bovines. In particular, especially as regards the dimensions of the metacarpal

(Fig. 11), the remains of Vigna Nuova upper layer are similar to those of the most derived forms of the group, namely *L. etruscus* and *L. vallisarni*. Remains of the latter species are reported from the nearby locality of Selvella (De Giuli, 1987; Masini et al., 2013) (Fig. 1), whose referral to the Farneta FU (ca. 1.5 Ma) is supported by biochronological data on fossil horse (Alberdi & Palombo, 2013; Cirilli et al., 2020).

The assemblage from the "lower layer" (unfortunately not more cropping out at Vigna Nuova) includes at least ten taxa, some of which carrying crucial biochronological information. The co-occurrence of *C. ramosus* and *E. cf. senezensis* allows an attribution of the fauna to the second part of the Middle Villafranchian, matching a correlation with the Coste San Giacomo FU in the Italian biochronological framework. This result contrasts with the first hypotheses on a younger age of the fauna (Tasso FU; Argenti, 2004), probably also failing to recognize the division into two assemblages.

In Italy, scanty remains of *Croizetoceros ramosus* are reported only from Montopoli (ca. 2.6. Ma; De Giuli & Heintz, 1974) and Coste San Giacomo (ca. 2.1 Ma; Bellucci et al., 2012, 2014). Therefore, the well-preserved maxilla with upper dentition (SABAP\_UMB 129863) from Vigna Nuova allows to confirm the presence of this enigmatic species in the Italian Middle Villafranchian. Similarly, the horse *E. senezensis* is rare in Italy, having been reported with scanty remains only in Coste San Giacomo and Montecarlo fossil sites, in contrast to the rich French sample from Senèze (Palombo et al., 2017; Cirilli et al., 2021a; Cirilli, 2022). The occurrence of this species in Vigna Nuova provides a new support of the dispersion of this species in the Italian peninsula, which may have been the source for the origin of *E. stehlini* (Cirilli, 2022).

Some primitive characters of the sample of 'Pseudodama' from Vigna Nuova suggest that it may be referred to a primitive species of the genus, thus supporting the attribution of the assemblage to the Middle Villafranchian. On the other hand, this hypothesis can only be confirmed by the discovery of more complete fossils.

Finally, the discovery of the remains of *Canis* sp. is noteworthy. Although these predators probably arrived in Europe already in the Early Villafranchian as evidenced by the Vialette record

(Lacombat et al., 2008; Sotnikova & Rook, 2010), there is no trace of them in Italy before the second part of the Middle Villafranchian. Indeed, the record of *Canis* sp. from Coste San Giacomo (Bellucci et al., 2021, 2014) marks the first occurrence of the genus *Canis* in Italy, which is confirmed here by the Vigna Nuova fossils.

The recognition of a Middle Villafranchian assemblage in Umbria is novel information, given that the majority of the other LFAs in the region, especially those from the Tiberino Basin, have been attributed to the Late Villafranchian (see Cherin et al., 2019a for a summary). The only exception is represented by the small assemblage from the upper layers of Cava Toppetti near Todi (Perugia), which was referred to the Coste San Giacomo FU (Abbazzi et al., 1997). However, in our opinion, the sample is too small and the fossils too fragmentary to confirm such biochronological conclusion.

Our chronological results also open up stimulating research prospects in the stratigraphic field. To date, the continental deposits of the Valdichiana Basin were generically referred to the Calabrian, especially on the basis of biochronological data on mammals (e.g., Selvella, Farneta, Cava Liberatori LFAs, all dated to ca. 1.5. Ma; Masini & Sala, 2007). On the other hand, recent studies focused on the paleoenvironmental history of the marine portion of the Basin, which underwent a complex depositional history at least throughout the Early Pleistocene (Gelasian and Calabrian; Bizzarri & Baldanza, 2020). Further research is needed to identify in the field the deposit that yielded the fossils of the "lower layer" of Vigna Nuova, here dated to the Gelasian (ca. 2.2–2.1 Ma), and to understand its stratigraphic relationships with the surrounding marine and continental units of the Valdichiana Basin.

### **AUTHORS' CONTRIBUTIONS**

M.C. and B.A. conceived the study. F.R., D.T., M.C., and B.A. prepared the fossils. B.A., M.C., and F.R. collected the data. B.A., M.C., J.M.M., L.S., and O.C. made the figures. M.C., B.A., M.B., J.M.M., L.S., and O.C. developed the methods and performed the analyses. B.A. and M.C. wrote the

final version of the manuscript with input from the other authors. All authors contributed equally to develop the ideas, discussed the results, and reviewed the final version of the manuscript.

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** 

We are grateful to Giorgio Carnevale and Alberto Collareta for having invited us to join this issue; Angela Baldanza, Roberto Bizzarri, Sergio Gentili, and Fausto Pazzaglia for the useful discussions on the stratigraphy of Vigna Nuova and information on the discovery of the fossils; Leonardo Brustenga, Cristiano Spilinga, and Giovanni Testaferri for their availability and help in accessing the outcrop; Marco Bagli for the translation of the Capellini's quote; Massimo Delfino, Marco P. Ferretti, Andrea Villa, and Giorgio Carnevale for their opinion on the mustelid tooth; Luca Pulcinelli and Paola Romi (SABAP\_UMB) for constant assistance; Dimitris Kostopoulos for the pictures of Greek *Croizetoceros*; Luca Pandolfi for his thorough review; Luca Bellucci for his review and for kindly providing additional data on canid vertebrae. O.C. gratefully acknowledges Howard University, Washington D.C. for space and resources for his postdoctoral research. L.S. is supported by the FI AGAUR fellowship (ref. 2020 FI\_B1 00131) funded by the Secretaria d'Universitats i Recerca de la Generalitat de Catalunya and the European Social Fund.

Abbazzi L. (2004). Remarks on the validity of the generic name *Praemegaceros* Portis 1920, and an overview on *Praemegaceros* species in Italy. *Rendiconti Lincei*, 15 (2): 115-132.

REFERENCES

Abbazzi L., Albianelli A., Ambrosetti P., Argenti P., Basilici G., Gentili S., Masini F. & Pontini M.R. (1997). Paleontological and sedimentological records in Pliocene distal alluvial fan

- deposit at Cava Toppetti (Todi, Central Italy). Bollettino della Società Paleontologica
- 912 *Italiana*, 36 (1-2): 5-22.
- Alberdi M.T. & Palombo M.R. (2013). The late Early to early Middle Pleistocene stenonoid horses
- from Italy. *Quaternary International*, 288: 25-44.
- 915 Alberdi M.T., Cerdeño E., López-Martínez N., Morales J. & Soria M.D. (1997). La fauna
- villafranquiense de El Rincón-1 (Albacete, Castilla-La Mancha). Estudios Geológicos, 53: 69-
- 917 93.
- 918 Alberdi M.T., Ortiz Jaureguízar E. & Prado J.L. (1998). A quantitative review of European
- stenonoid horses. *Journal of Paleontology*, 72: 371-387.
- 920 Ambrosetti P., Bartolomei G., De Giuli C., Ficcarelli G. & Torre D. (1979). La breccia ossifera di
- 921 Slivia (Aurisina Sistiana) nel Carso di Trieste. *Bollettino della Società Paleontologica*
- 922 Italiana, 18 (2): 207-220.
- Ambrosetti P., Carboni M.G., Conti M.A., Esu D., Girotti O., La Monica G.B., Landini B. & Parisi
- G. (1987). Il Pliocene ed il Pleistocene inferiore del bacino del fiume Tevere nell'Umbria
- meridionale. Geografia Fisica e Dinamica Quaternaria, 10 (1): 10-33.
- Antón M. (2013). Sabertooth. 268 pp. Indiana University Press, Bloomington.
- 927 Argenti P. (2004). Plio-Quaternary mammal fossiliferous sites of Umbria (central Italy). Geologica
- 928 Romana, 37 (2003-2004): 67-78.
- Azanza B. (2000). Los Cervidae (Artiodactyla, Mammalia) del Mioceno de las Cuencas del Duero,
- Tajo, Calatayud-Teruel y Levante. Memorias del Museo Paleontologico de la Universidad de
- 931 *Zaragoza*, 8: 1-376
- Azzaroli A. (1947). I cervi fossili della Toscana con particolare riguardo alle specie villafranchiane.
- 933 Palaeontographia Italica, 43: 45-82.
- Azzaroli A. (1964). The two Villafranchian horses of the Upper Valdarno. *Palaeontographia*
- 935 *Italica*, 59: 1-12.

- Azzaroli A. (1983). Quaternary mammals and the "end-Villafranchian" dispersal event a turning 936 937 point in the history of Eurasia. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 44: 117-139. 938 Azzaroli A. (1992). The cervid genus Pseudodama n. g. in the Villafranchian of Tuscany. 939 Palaeontographia Italica, 79: 1-41. 940 Azzaroli A. (2000). On Equus livenzovensis Baigusheva 1978 and the "stenonid" lineage of equids. 941 Palaeontographia Italica, 87: 1-17. 942 Azzaroli A. & Mazza P. (1992). On the possible origin of the Giant Deer genus *Megaceroides*. 943 *Rendiconti Lincei*, 3 (1): 23-32. 944 945 Azzaroli A., De Giuli C., Ficcarelli G. & Torre D. (1988). Late Pliocene to early mid-Pleistocene mammals in Eurasia: faunal succession and dispersal events. *Palaeogeography*, 946 Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 66 (1-2): 77-100. 947 Bajgusheva V.S. (1978). Krupnaja Loshad Khaprovskogo Kompleksa is alluvija 948 Severo Vostochnoto Priazovija. Invesija Servo-Kavkazkogo Nauchnogo Zentra Vychei Shkoly, 949 1: 98-102. 950 Baldanza A., Bizzarri R., Famiani F., Garassino A., Pasin, G., Cherin M. & Rosatini F. (2018). The 951 early Pleistocene whale-fall community of Bargiano (Umbria, Central Italy): Paleoecological 952 insights from benthic foraminifera and brachyuran crabs. Palaeontologia Electronica, 21: 1-953 27. 954 Ballesio R. (1963). Monographie d'un Machairodus du gisement villafranchien de Senèze: 955 956 Homotherium crenatidens. Travaux et Documents des Laboratoires de Géologie de Lyon, 9: 1-129. 957 Barchi M.R. & Marroni M. (2007). Note illustrative della Carta Geologica d'Italia alla scala
- Barchi M.R. & Marroni M. (2007). Note illustrative della Carta Geologica d'Italia alla scala
   1:50.000. Foglio 310-Passignano sul Trasimeno. 196 pp. APAT, Dipartimento Difesa del
   Suolo, Servizio Geologico d'Italia.

- 961 Bartolini-Lucenti S. & Rook L. (2016). A review on the Late Villafranchian medium-sized canid
- Canis arnensis based on the evidence from Poggio Rosso (Tuscany, Italy). Quaternary
- 963 *Science Reviews*, 151: 58-71.
- 964 Bartolini-Lucenti S., Alba D.M., Rook L., Moya-Sola S. & Madurell-Malapeira J. (2017). Latest
- Early Pleistocene wolf-like canids from the Iberian Peninsula. *Quaternary Science Reviews*,
- 966 162: 12-25.
- 967 Bartolini-Lucenti S., Bukhsianidze M., Martínez-Navarro B. & Lordkipanidze D. (2020). The wolf
- from Dmanisi and augmented reality: review, implications, and opportunities. Frontiers in
- 969 *Earth Science*, 8: 131.
- 970 Bartolini-Lucenti S., Cirilli O., Pandolfi L., Bernor R.L., Bukhsianidze M., Carotenuto F.,
- 271 Lordkipanidze D., Tsikaridze N. & Rook L. (2022). Zoogeographic significance of Dmanisi
- large mammal assemblage. *Journal of Human Evolution*, 163: 103125.
- 973 Basilici G. (1997). Sedimentary facies in an extensional and deep lacustrine depositional system:
- the Pliocene Tiberino Basin, Central Italy. *Sedimentary Geology*, 109: 73-94.
- 975 Behrensmeyer A.K. (1978). Taphonomic and ecologic information from bone weathering.
- 976 *Paleobiology*, 4 (2): 150-162.
- 977 Bellucci L., Mazzini I., Scardia G., Bruni L., Parenti F., Segre A.G., Segre Naldini E. & Sardella R.
- 978 (2012). The site of Coste San Giacomo (Early Pleistocene, central Italy): palaeoenvironmental
- analysis and biochronological overview. *Quaternary International*, 267: 30-39.
- Bellucci L., Bona F., Corrado P., Magri D., Mazzini I., Parenti F., Scardia G. & Sardella R. (2014).
- Evidence of late Gelasian dispersal of African fauna at Coste San Giacomo (Anagni Basin,
- central Italy): Early Pleistocene environments and the background of early human occupation
- in Europe. *Quaternary Science Review*, 96: 72-85.
- Bernor R.L., Tobien H., Hayek L.A.C. & Mittmann H.W. (1997). *Hippotherium primigenium*
- 985 (Equidae, Mammalia) from the late Miocene of Höwenegg (Hegau, Germany). *Andrias*, 10:
- 986 1-230.

- 987 Bernor R.L., Cirilli O., Wang S.Q. & Rook L. (2018). *Equus* cf. *livenzovenzis* from Montopoli, Italy
- 988 (early Pleistocene; MN16b; ca. 2.6 Ma). Bollettino della Società Paleontologica Italiana, 57
- 989 (3): 203-216.
- 990 Bernor R.L., Cirilli O., Jukar A.M., Potts R., Bukhsianidze M. & Rook L. (2019). Evolution of
- Early *Equus* in Italy, Georgia, the Indian Subcontinent, East Africa, and the Origins of
- African Zebras. Frontiers in Ecology and Evolution, 7: 166.
- 993 Bernor R.L., Cirilli O., Bukhsianidze M., Lordkipanidze D. & Rook L. (2021). The Dmanisi *Equus*:
- Systematics, biogeography and paleoecology. *Journal of Human Evolution*, 158: 103051.
- 995 Bizzarri R. & Baldanza A. (2020). Integrated stratigraphy of the marine early Pleistocene in
- 996 Umbria. *Geosciences*, 10 (9): 371.
- 997 Bout P. & Azzaroli A. (1952). Stratigraphie et Faune du creux de Peirolles pres Perrier (Puy-de-
- 998 Dôme). Annales de Paléontologie, 38: 3-22.
- Bowdich T.E. (1821). An analysis of the Natural Classification of Mammalia for the use of students
- and travellers. 184 pp. J. Smith, Paris.
- Breda M. (2015). The early Middle Pleistocene fallow deer *Dama roberti*: new insight on species
- morphology from a complete postcranial skeleton from Valdemino (northwestern Italy).
- 1003 Geological Journal, 50 (3): 257-270.
- Breda M. & Lister A.M. (2013). Dama roberti, a new species of deer from the early Middle
- Pleistocene of Europe, and the origins of modern fallow deer. *Quaternary Science Reviews*,
- 1006 69: 155-167.
- Breda M., Peretto C. & Thun Hohenstein U. (2015). The deer from the early Middle Pleistocene site
- of Isernia la Pineta (Molise, Italy): revised identifications and new remains from the last 15
- years of excavation. *Geological Journal*, 50 (3): 290-305.
- Breda M., Kahlke R.D. & Lister A.M. (2020). New results on cervids from the Early Pleistocene
- site of Untermassfeld. *In* Kahlke R.D. (ed) The Pleistocene of Untermassfeld near Meiningen
- 1012 (Thüringen, Germany), Part 4: 1197-1249.

1013 Burchak-Abramovich N.I. & Vekua A.K. (1994). Novyy pryedstavityel' lyeystotsyenobykh bykov 1014 izz vostochnoy Gruzii. Voprosy teriologii Rossiyskaya Akademiya Nauk, 1: 253-261 (in 1015 Russian). Capellini G. (1888). Sui resti di Mastodon arvernensis recentemente scoperti a Spoleto, Pontremoli 1016 e Castrocaro. Memorie della Regia Accademia delle Scienze, 4 (9): 251-258. 1017 1018 Capellini G. (1889). Sulla scoperta di una caverna ossifera a Monte Cucco. Bollettino della Società 1019 Paleontologica Italiana, 8: 274-278. Capellini G. (1890). Comunicazione sui vertebrati fossili rinvenuti nella grotta di Monte Cucco 1020 presso Fabriano. Bollettino della Società Paleontologica Italiana, 9: 743-744. 1021 1022 Cherin M., Bertè D.F., Rook L. & Sardella R. (2014). Re-defining Canis etruscus (Canidae, 1023 Mammalia): a new look into the evolutionary history of Early Pleistocene dogs resulting from the outstanding fossil record from Pantalla (Italy). Journal of Mammalian Evolution, 21: 95-1024 1025 110. Cherin M., Iurino D.A., Willemsen G. & Carnevale G. (2016). A new otter from the Early 1026 Pleistocene of Pantalla (Italy), with remarks on the evolutionary history of Mediterranean 1027 Quaternary Lutrinae (Carnivora, Mustelidae). Quaternary Science Reviews, 135: 92-102. 1028 1029 Cherin M., Sorbelli L., Crotti M., Iurino D.A., Sardella R. & Souron A. (2018). New material of Sus 1030 strozzii (Suidae, Mammalia) from the Early Pleistocene of Italy and a phylogenetic analysis of suines. Quaternary Science Reviews, 194: 94-115. 1031 Cherin M., Azzarà B., Breda M., Brobia Ansoleaga A., Buzi C., Pandolfi L. & Pazzaglia F. (2019a). 1032 1033 Large mammal remains from the Early Pleistocene site of Podere San Lorenzo (Perugia, central Italy). Rivista Italiana di Paleontologia e Stratigrafia, 125 (2): 489-515. 1034 Cherin M., D'Allestro V. & Masini F. (2019b). New bovid remains from the Early Pleistocene of 1035

Umbria (Italy) and a reappraisal of *Leptobos merlai*. *Journal of Mammalian Evolution*, 26:

1036

1037

201-224.

- 1038 Cherin M., Alba D.M., Crotti M., Menconero S., Moullé P.É., Sorbelli L. & Madurell-Malapeira J.
- 1039 (2020). The post-Jaramillo persistence of *Sus strozzii* (Suidae, Mammalia) in Europe: new
- evidence from the Vallparadís Section (NE Iberian Peninsula) and other coeval sites.
- 1041 Quaternary Science Reviews, 233: 106234.
- 1042 Cherin M., Cirilli O., Azzarà B. & Bernor R.L. (2021). Equus stenonis (Equidae, Mammalia) from
- the Early Pleistocene of Pantalla (Italy) and the dispersion of stenonian horses in Europe.
- 1044 Bollettino della Società Paleontologica Italiana, 60 (1): 1-18.
- 1045 Cirilli O. (2022). Equus stehlini Azzaroli, 1964 (Perissodactyla, Equidae). A revision of the most
- enigmatic horse from the Early Pleistocene of Europe, with new insights on the evolutionary
- history of European medium- and small-sized hoses. Rivista Italiana di Paleontologia e
- 1048 Stratigrafia, 128 (1): 241-265.
- 1049 Cirilli O., Pandolfi L. & Bernor R.L. (2020). The Villafranchian perissodactyls of Italy: knowledge
- of the fossil record and future research perspectives. *Geobios*, 63: 1-21.
- 1051 Cirilli O., Pandolfi L., Rook L. & Bernor R.L. (2021a). Evolution of Old World Equus and origin of
- the zebra-ass clade. Scientific Reports, 11 (1): 10156.
- 1053 Cirilli O, Saarinen J., Pandolfi L., Rook L. & Bernor R.L. (2021b). An updated review on Equus
- stenonis (Mammalia, Equidae): new implications for the European Early Pleistocene Equus
- taxonomy and paleoecology, and remarks on the Old World Equus evolution. *Quaternary*
- 1056 Science Reviews, 269: 107155.
- 1057 Cirilli O., Bernor R.L. & Rook L. (2021c). New insights on the Early Pleistocene equids from
- 1058 Roca-Neyra (France, central Europe): implications for the *Hipparion LAD* and the *Equus*
- 1059 FAD in Europe. *Journal of Paleontology*, 95 (2): 406-425.
- 1060 Clerici E. (1894). Sul ritrovamento del castoro nelle ligniti di Spoleto. Bollettino della Società
- 1061 *Paleontologica Italiana*, 13 (169): 199-202.
- 1062 Clerici E. (1895). Ritrovamento di resti di tapiro nelle ligniti di Spoleto. Bollettino della Società
- 1063 Paleontologica Italiana, 14: 296-297.

- 1064 Cocchi I. (1867). L'uomo fossile dell'Italia Centrale. *Memorie della Società Italiana di Scienze*1065 *Naturali*, 2: 1-180.
- Collettini C., De Paola N., Holdsworth R.E. & Barchi M.R. (2006). The development and behaviour of low-angle normal faults during Cenozoic asymmetric extension in the Northern Apennines, Italy. *Journal of Structural Geology*, 28 (2): 333-352.
- Colombero S., Pavia M. & Rook L. (2012). *Pannonictis nestii* (Galictinae, Mustelidae), a new element in the vertebrate association of the human site of Pirro Nord (Italy, Early Pleistocene). *Geodiversitas*, 34 (3): 665-681.
- 1072 Cope E.D. (1892). A contribution to the vertebrate paleontology of Texas. *Proceedings of the*1073 *American Philosophical Society*, 30: 123-131.
- 1074 Croitor R. (2006). Early Pleistocene small-sized deer of Europe. *Hellenic Journal of Geosciences*, 41 (1): 89-117.
- 1076 Croitor R. (2018). Plio-Pleistocene deer of Western Palearctic: Taxonomy, Systematics, Phylogeny.

  1077 142 pp. Institute of Zoology of the Academy of Sciences of Moldova, Chişinău.
- 1078 Croizet J.B. & Jobert A. (1828). Recherches sur les ossemens fossils du Département du Puy-de-1079 Dôme. 224 pp. Thibaut-Landriot, Paris.
- Cuvier G. (1821). Recherches sur les ossemens fossiles, où l'on rétablit les caractères de plusiers animaux dont les révolutions du globe ont détruit les espéces. Tome 1. 334 pp. Dufour et d'Ocagne, Paris & Amsterdam.
- Cuvier G. (1824). Recherches sur les ossemens fossiles, où l'on rétablit les caractères de plusiers animaux dont les révolutions du globe ont détruit les espéces. Tome 5, partie 2. 547 pp.

  Dufour et d'Ocagne, Paris & Amsterdam.
- de Bonis L. (1976). Un félidé á longues canines de la colline de Perrier (Puy-de-Dôme): ses rapports avec les félinés machairodontes. *Annales de Paléontologie, Vertébrés*, 62 (2): 159-1088 198.

- De Giuli C. (1987). Late Villafranchian faunas in Italy: the Selvella Local Fauna in southern Chiana
- Valley Umbria. *Palaeontographia Italica*, 74: 11-50.
- De Giuli D. & Heintz E. (1974). Croizetoceros ramosus (Cervidae, Artiodactyla, Mammalia) de
- Montopoli, nouvel élément de la faune villafranchienne d'Italie. Atti della Società Toscana di
- 1093 *Scienze Naturali*, 81: 241-252.
- Delafond F. & Depéret C. (1893). Les terrains tertiaires de la Bresse et leurs gites de lignites et de
- minerais de fer. Etudes des Gites Minéraux de la France. 332 pp. Imprimerie Nationale, Paris.
- Del Campana D. (1913) I cani pliocenici di Toscana. *Palaeontographia italica*, 19: 189–254.
- De Lumley H., Kahlke H.D., Moigne A.M. & Moullé P.E. (1988). Les faunes de grandes
- Mammifères de la grotte du Vallonet Roquebrune-Cap Martin, Alpes-Maritimes.
- 1099 *L'Anthropologie*, 92: 465-496.
- Dubois E. (1904). On an equivalent of the Cromer Forest-bed in the Netherlands. *Proceedings*
- 1101 Koniklijke Akademie der Wetenschapen, Section Science, 7 (3): 214-222.
- Duvernois M.P. (1989). Les *Leptobos* (Mammalia, Artiodactyla) du Villafranchien inférieur
- d'Europe occidentale. Comptes rendus de l'Académie des sciences. Série 2, 309 (7): 769-775.
- Duvernois M.P. (1990). Les *Leptobos* (Mammalia, Artiodactyla) du Villafranchien d'Europe
- occidentale. Systématique, évolution, biostratigraphie, paléoécologie. *Travaux et Documents*
- 1106 des Laboratoires de Géologie de Lyon, 113 (1): 3-213.
- Duvernois M.P. (1992). Mise au point sur le genre *Leptobos* (Mammalia, Artiodactyla, Bovidae);
- implications biostratigraphiques et phylogénétiques. *Geobios*, 25 (1): 155-166.
- Eisenmann V., Alberdi M.T., De Giuli C. & Staesche U. (1988). Studying Fossil Horses. Volume I
- Methodology. *In* Woodburne M.O. & Sondaar P.Y. (eds), Collected Papers after the New
- York International *Hipparion* Conference 1981. Brill, Leiden: 1-71.
- Fabrini E. (1890). I Machairodus (Megantereon) del Val d'Arno superiore. Bollettino Comitato
- 1113 *Geologico d'Italia*, 21: 121-144.

- Falconer H. (1868). Paleontological memoirs and notes, mastodon, elephant, rhinoceros, ossiferous
- caves, primeval man and his contemporaries. Volume 2. 675 pp. Robert Hardwicke, London.
- Faure M. & Guérin C. (1983). Le Sus scrofa (Mammalia, Artiodactyla, Suidae) du gisement
- pléistocène supérieur de Jaurens à Nespouls, Corrèze, France. *Publications du musée des*
- 1118 *Confluences*, 21 (1): 45-63.
- Ficcarelli G. (1979). The Villafranchian machairedonts of Tuscany. *Paleontographica Italica*, 71:
- 1120 17-256.
- Fidolini F., Ghinassi M., Magi M., Papini M. & Sagri M. (2013). The Plio-Pleistocene fluvio-
- lacustrine Upper Valdarno Basin (central Italy): stratigraphy and basin fill evolution. *Italian*
- *Journal of Geosciences*, 132 (1): 13-32.
- Florindo F., Marra F., Angelucci D.E., Biddittu I., Bruni L., Florindo F., Gaeta M., Guillou H.,
- Jicha B., Macrì P., Morigi C., Nomade S., Parenti F., Pereira A. & Grimaldi S. (2021).
- Environmental evolution, faunal and human occupation since 2 Ma in the Anagni basin,
- central Italy. *Scientific Reports*, 11: 7056.
- Forsyth Major C.I. (1877). Considerazioni sulla fauna dei Mammiferi pliocenici e postpliocenici
- della Toscana. III. Cani fossili del Val d'Arno superiore e della Valle dell'Era. Memorie della
- 1130 Società Toscana di Scienze Naturali, 3: 207-227.
- Forsyth Major C.I. (1881). Studi sugli avanzi pliocenici del genere Sus. Atti della Società Toscana
- di Scienze Naturali, Processi Verbali, 2: 227.
- Freudenberg W. (1914). Die Säugetiere des älteren Quartars von Mitteleuropa. Geology and
- 1134 *Paleontology. Abh*, 12, 533-549.
- Fujita M., Kawamur, Y. & Murase N. (2000). Middle Pleistocene wild boar remains from NT cave,
- Niimi, Okayama prefecture, west Japan. *Journal of Geosciences Osaka City University*, 43:
- 1137 57-95.
- Gentili S. (1993). I paleoambienti plio-pleistocenici continentali umbri: caratteri sistematici,
- pleoecologici e tafonomici delle mammalofaune fossili. CNR, Comitato 05, Scienze

1140	Geologiche e Minerarie, "Sedimentologia e stratigrafia delle formazioni pliopleistoceniche".
1141	23 pp. Relazione Borsa di Studio 1991/93.
1142	Ghinassi M., Abbazzi L., Esu D., Gaudant J. & Girotti O. (2005). Facies analysis, stratigraphy and
1143	paleontology (molluscs and vertebrates) in the upper Pliocene sandy flood-basin deposits of
1144	the Upper Valdarno basin (Northern Apennines). Rivista Italiana di Paleontologia e
1145	Stratigrafia, 111 (3): 467-487.
1146	Girotti O., Capasso Barbato L., Esu D., Gliozzi E., Kotsakis T., Martinetto E., Petronio C., Sardella
1147	R. & Squazzini E. (2003). The section of Torre Picchio (Terni, Umbria, Central Italy): a
1148	Villafranchian site rich in vertebrates, molluscs, ostracods and plants. Rivista Italiana di
1149	Paleontologia e Stratigrafia, 109 (1): 77-98.
1150	Goldfuss G.A. (1820). Handbuch der Zoologie. Erste Abteilung. 696 pp. Schrag, Nürnberg.
1151	Gray J.E. (1821). On the natural arrangement of vertebrose animals. London Medical Repository,
1152	15: 296-310.
1153	Hays I. (1834). Descriptions of the specimens of inferior maxillary bones of mastodons in the
1154	cabinet of the American Philosophical Society, with remarks on the genus Tetracaulodon
1155	(Godman). Transactions of the American Philosophical Society, 4: 317-339.
1156	Heintz E. (1970). Les cervidés villafranchiens de France et d'Espagne. Memoires du Museum
1157	National d'Histoire Naturelle Nouvelle Serie, Serie C, Sciences de la Terre, 22 (1): 303.
1158	Hemmer H. (2001). Die feliden aus dem Epivillafranchium von Untermassfeld. In Kahlke, R.D.
1159	(ed), Das Pleistozän von Untermassfeld bei Meiningen (Thüringen), Teil 3: 699-782.
1160	Iannucci A., Sardella R., Strani F. & Mecozzi B. (2020). Size shifts in late Middle Pleistocene to
1161	Early Holocene Sus scrofa (Suidae, Mammalia) from Apulia (southern Italy):
1162	ecomorphological adaptations? Hystrix, 31 (1): 10-20.
1163	Illiger C.D. (1811). Prodromus Systematis Mammalium et Avium Additis Terminis Zoographicis
1164	Uttriusque Classis. 301 pp. Salfeld, Berlin.

- Kostopoulos D.S. (1996). The Plio-Pleistocene Artiodactyls of Macedonia (Greece) systematics,
- palaeoecology, biochronology, biostratigraphy. PhD thesis. 671 pp. Aristotle University of
- Thessaloniki, Thessaloniki (in Greek).
- Kostopoulos D.S. & Athanassiou A. (2005). In the shadow of bovids: suids, cervids and giraffids
- from the Plio-Pleistocene of Greece. *Quaternaire*, 179-190.
- Lacombat F., Abbazzi L., Ferretti M.P., Martínez-Navarro B., Moullé P.E., Palombo M.R., Rook
- L., Turner A. & Valli A.M.F. (2008). New data on the Early Villafranchian fauna from
- 1172 Vialette (Haute-Loire, France) based on the collection of the Crozatier Museum (Le Puy-en-
- 1173 Velay, Haute-Loire, France). *Quaternary International*, 179 (1): 64-71.
- Leidy J. (1853). Description of an extinct species of American lion: Felis atrox. Transactions of the
- 1175 American Philosophical Society, 10: 319-321.
- Linnaeus C. (1758). Systema naturae per regna tria naturae, secundum Classes, Ordines, Genera,
- Species cum characteribus, differentiis, synonimis, locis. 824 pp. Laurentii Salvii, Stockholm.
- Lotti B. (1917). L'antico Lago Tiberino e le ligniti dell'Umbria. La Miniera Italiana, 7: 1-8.
- Maniakas I. & Kostopoulos D.S. (2017). Morphometric-palaeoecological discrimination between
- Bison populations of the western Palaearctic. Geobios, 50 (2): 155-171.
- Martinetto E., Bertini A., Basilici G., Baldanza A., Bizzarri R., Cherin M. Gentili S. & Pontini M.R.
- 1182 (2014). The plant record of the Dunarobba and Pietrafitta sites in the Plio-Pleistocene
- palaeoenvironmental context of central Italy. Alpine and Mediterranean Quaternary, 27 (1):
- 1184 29-72.
- Martínez-Navarro B., Madurell-Malapeira J., Ros-Montoya S., Espigares M.P., Medin T., Hortola
- P. & Palmqvist P. (2015). The Epivillafranchian and the arrival of pigs into Europe
- Ouaternary International, 389: 131-138.
- Martini I.P. & Sagri M. (1993). Tectono-sedimentary characteristics of Late Miocene-Quaternary
- extensional basins of the Northern Apennines, Italy. *Earth-Science Reviews*, 34 (3): 197-233.

- 1190 Masini F. (1989). I bovini villafranchiani dell'Italia. PhD Thesis. 152 pp. Università di Modena-
- Bologna-Firenze-Roma.
- 1192 Masini F. & Sala, B. (2007). Large-and small-mammal distribution patterns and chronostratigraphic
- boundaries from the Late Pliocene to the Middle Pleistocene of the Italian peninsula.
- 1194 *Quaternary International*, 160 (1): 43-56.
- Masini F., Palombo M.R. & Rozzi R. (2013). A reappraisal of the Early to Middle Pleistocene
- 1196 Italian Bovidae. *Quaternary International*, 288: 45-62.
- Mayda S., Alçiçek M.C., Demirel F.A. & Alçiçek H. (2017). The first record of a Villafranchian
- small cervid "Croizetoceros" from Turkey. 15<sup>th</sup>RCMNS Congress (Regional Committee on
- Mediterranean Neogene Stratigraphy), 3-6 September, Athens, Greece.
- Meli R. (1895). Notizie sui resti di Mammiferi fossili rinvenuti in località italiane. Bollettino della
- 1201 Società Geologica Italiana, 14: 148-164.
- Merla G. (1949). I Leptobos Rütim. italiani. Palaeontographica Italica, 46: 41-155.
- Nesti F. (1825). Sulla nuova specie di elefante fossile del Valdarno all'Illustrissimo Sig. Dott. Prof.
- Ottaviano Targioni Tozzetti (Lettere sopra alcune ossa fossili del Valdarno non per anco
- descritte). Nuovo Giornale di Lettere, 11: 195-216.
- Nomade S., Pastre J.F., Guillou H., Faure M., Guérin C., Delson E., Debard E., Voinchet P. &
- Messager E. (2014). <sup>40</sup>Ar/<sup>39</sup>Ar constraints on some French landmark late Pliocene to early
- Pleistocene large mammalian paleofaunas: paleoenvironmental and paleoecological
- implications. *Quaternary Geochronology*, 21: 2-15.
- Olsen S.J. (1990). Fossil ancestry of the yak, its cultural significance and domestication in Tibet.
- 1211 Proceedings of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia, 142: 73-100.
- Owen R. (1848). Description of the teeth and portions of jaws of two extinct anthracotheroid
- quadrupeds (*Hyopotamus vectianus* and *Hyop. bovinus*) discovered by the Marchioness of
- Hastings in the Eocene deposits of the N.W. coast of the Isle of Wight: with an attempt to

develop Cuvier's idea of the classification of the pachyderms by the number of their toes. 1215 1216 *Quarterly Journal of the Geological Society of London*, 4: 103-141. Palombo M.R. & Alberdi M.T. (2017). Light and shadows in the evolution of South European 1217 stenonoid horses. Fossil Imprint, 73 (1-2): 115-140. 1218 Palombo M.R., Alberdi M.T., Bellucci L. & Sardella R. (2017). An intriguing middle-sized horse 1219 from Coste San Giacomo (Anagni Basin, central Italy). Quaternary Research, 87 (2): 347-1220 1221 362. Pantanelli D. (1886). Monografia degli strati pontici del Miocene superiore nell'Italia settentrionale 1222 e centrale. Memorie della Reale Accademia di Scienze, Lettere ed Arti di Modena, 4: 127-231. 1223 1224 Pascucci V., Merlini S. & Martini I.P. (1999). Seismic stratigraphy of the Miocene-Pleistocene sedimentary basins of the Northern Tyrrhenian Sea and western Tuscany (Italy). Basin 1225 Research, 11 (4): 337-356. 1226 Petronio C. & Pandolfi L. (2011). First occurrence of the genus Arvernoceros Heintz 1970 from the 1227 late Early Pleistocene of Italy. Rivista Italiana di Paleontologia e Stratigrafia, 117 (3): 501-1228 508. 1229 Petronio C., Argenti P., Caloi C., Esu D., Girotti O. & Sardella R. (2003). Updating Villafranchian 1230 molluse and mammal faunas in Umbria and Latium (Central Italy). Geologica Romana, 36: 1231 1232 369-387. Pfeiffer T. (2016). Deer from the Pliocene site of Bad Deutsch-Altenburg 26 (Lower Austria, 1233 Leithagebirge) - Conclusions based on skeletal morphology. Annalen des Naturhistorischen 1234 1235 Museums in Wien, Serie A, 118: 133-173. Pilgrim G.E. (1939). The fossil Bovidae of India. Palæontologia Indica. New series, 26: 1-356. 1236 Pomel A. (1853). Catalogue methodique et descriptif des Vertebres fossiles decouverts dans le 1237 bassin hydrographique superieur de la Loire, et surtout dans la vallee de son affluent 1238

principal, l'Allier. 193 pp. J.B. Bailliere, Paris.

1239

- Pons Moyà J. (1987). Los carnivoros, Mammalia de Venta Micena, Granada, España. Paleontologia
- *i Evolució, Memòria especial*, 1: 109-128.
- Prat F. (1964). Contribution à la classification des équidés Villafranchiens. *Procès-verbaux de la*
- 1243 Société Linnéenne de Bordeaux, 101: 14-32.
- 1244 Prat F. (1980). Les equidés villafranchiens en France, genre Equus. Cahiers du Quaternaire, 2: 1-
- 1245 290.
- 1246 Qiu Z.X., Deng T. & Wang B.Y. (2004). Early Pleistocene mammalian fauna from Longdan,
- Dongxiang, Gansu, China. *Palaeontologia Sinica New Series C*, 27: 162-164.
- R Core Team. (2013). R: a language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for
- 1249 Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria.
- Regione Umbria (2013). Cartografia geologica informatizzata vettoriale della Regione Umbria in
- http://www.territorio.regione.umbria.it/ and in http://dati.umbria.it/dataset/carta-geologica-
- dell-umbria. Regione Umbria, Servizio Geologico.
- Rook L., Bernor R.L., Avilla L.D., Cirilli O., Flynn L., Jukar A.M., Sanders W., Scott E. & Wang
- 1254 X. (2019). Mammal biochronology (Land Mammal Ages) around the world from the late
- Miocene to middle Pleistocene and major events in horse evolutionary history. *Frontiers in*
- 1256 Ecology and Evolution, 7: 278.
- Rütimeyer L. (1877-1878). Die Rinder der Tertiär-Epoche nebst vorstudien zu einer natürlichen
- Geschichte der Antilopen. *Paläontologische Gesellschaft*, 4: 1-72.
- Sala B. (1986). Bison schoetensacki Freud. from Isernia La Pineta (early mid Pleistocene, Italy) and
- revision of the European species of bison. *Palaeontographica Italica*, 74: 113-170.
- Sardella R. & Iurino D.A. (2012). The latest Early Pleistocene sabertoothed cat *Homotherium*
- 1262 (Felidae, Mammalia) from Monte Peglia (Umbria, central Italy). Bollettino della Società
- 1263 Paleontologica Italiana, 51 (1): 15-22.
- Sardella R., Di Stefano G. & Petronio C. (1995). The Villafranchian mammal faunas from the Tiber
- River Basin (Umbria, Central Italy). *Il Quaternario*, 8: 509-514.

- Sardella R., Mazzini I., Giustini F., Mecozzi B., Brilli M., Iurino D.A., Lembo G., Muttillo B.,
- Massussi M., Sigari D., Tucci S. & Voltaggio M. (2018). Grotta Romanelli (Southern Italy,
- Apulia): legacies and issues in excavating a key site for the Pleistocene of the Mediterranean.
- 1269 Rivista Italiana di Paleontologia e Stratigrafia, 124 (2): 247-264.
- 1270 Sher A.V. (1997). An Early Quaternary bison population from Untermaßfeld: *Bison menneri* sp.
- nov. In Kahlke R.D. (ed), Das Pleistozan von Untermaßfeld bei Meiningen (Thüringen). Teil
- 1: 101-180.
- 1273 Sismonda E. (1846). Descrizione dei pesci e dei crostacei fossili nel Piemonte. 24 pp. Stamperia
- 1274 Reale, Torino.
- 1275 Skinner M.R. & Kaisen O.C. (1946). The fossil *Bison* of Alaska and preliminary revision of the
- genus. Bulletin of the American Museum of Natural History, 89 (3): 123-256.
- Soergel W. (1928). Ein kleiner Wolf aus den Kiesen von Süßenborn. Zeitschrift der Deutschen
- 1278 Geologischen Gesellschaft, 80: 227-237.
- Sorbelli L., Alba D.M., Cherin M., Moullé P.É., Brugal J.P. & Madurell-Malapeira J. (2021). A
- review on *Bison schoetensacki* and its closest relatives through the early-Middle Pleistocene
- transition: Insights from the Vallparadís Section (NE Iberian Peninsula) and other European
- localities. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 261: 106933.
- Sotnikova M. & Rook L. (2010). Dispersal of the Canini (Mammalia, Canidae: Caninae) across
- Eurasia during the late Miocene to early Pleistocene. *Quaternary International*, 212 (2): 86-
- 1285 97.
- Stefanescu S. (1924). Sur la presence de l'*Elephas planifrons* et de trois mutations de l'*Elephas*
- 1287 antiquus dans les couches géologiques de Roumanie. Comptes rendus de l'Académie des
- 1288 *sciences*, 179: 1418-1419.
- 1289 Teilhard de Chardin P. & Piveteau J. (1930). Les mammifères fossiles de Nihowan (Chine).
- 1290 Annales de Paléontologie, 19: 1-134.

- Tong H.W., Chen X. & Zhang B. (2016). New fossils of *Bison palaeosinensis* (Artiodactyla,
- Mammalia) from the steppe mammoth site of early Pleistocene in Nihewan basin, China.
- 1293 Quaternary International, 445: 450-468.
- Torre D. (1967). I cani villafranchiani della Toscana. Palaeontographia Italica, 63: 113-138.
- 1295 Torre D., Ficcarelli G., Masini F., Rook L. & Sala B. (1992). Mammal dispersal events in the early
- Pleistocene of Western Europe. *Courier Forschungsinst Senckenberg*, 153: 51-58.
- Torre D., Abbazzi L., Bertini A., Fanfani F., Ficcarelli G., Masini F., Mazza P. & Rook L. (2001).
- Structural changes in Italian late Pliocene Pleistocene large mammal assemblages. *Bollettino*
- 1299 della Società Geologica Italiana, 40 (2): 303-306.
- 1300 Tuccimei G. (1891). Sui mammiferi fossili dell'Umbria e della provincia di Roma. Atti
- 1301 dell'Accademia Pontificia de' Nuovi Lincei, 44: 274-275.
- Tuccimei G. (1895). Sopra i resti fossili di mammiferi trovati alla Villa Spinola presso Perugia. Atti
- 1303 *dell'Accademia Pontificia de' Nuovi Lincei*, 48: 44-46.
- Valli A.M.F. (2004). Les Cervidae du gisement Pliocène supérieur (Villafranchien moyen) de Saint-
- Vallier (Drôme, France). Geobios, 37: S191-S232.
- Venables W.N. & Ripley B.D. (2008). Modern Applied Statistics with R. 498 pp. Springer-Verlag,
- New York.
- Van der Made J. (1999). Ungulates from Atapuerca TD6. *Journal of Human Evolution*, 37 (3-4):
- 1309 389-413.
- Van der Made J., Rosell J. & Blasco R. (2017). Faunas from Atapuerca at the Early–Middle
- Pleistocene limit: The ungulates from level TD8 in the context of climatic change.
- 1312 Quaternary International, 433: 296-346.
- 1313 Verri A. (1879). Avvenimenti nell'interno del Bacino del Tevere antico durante e dopo il periodo
- pliocenico. Atti della Società Italiana di Scienze Naturali, 21: 149-180.
- von Meyer H.V. (1829). Taschenbuch für die gesammte Mineralogie. Zeitschrift für Mineralogie,
- 1316 23 (1): 150-152.

1317	von Reichenau W. (1915). Beiträge zur näheren Kenntnis fossiler Pferde aus deutschen Pleistozän.
1318	Abhandlungen der Grossherzoglich Hessischen Geologischen Landesanstalt zu Darmstadt, 7:
1319	1.
1320	Wickham H. (2016). ggplot2: Elegant Graphics for Data Analysis. 213 pp. Springer-Verlag, New
1321	York.
1322	Wüst E. (1900). Das Pliozän und das älteste Pleistozän Thüringens. Nördlich vom Thüringer Walde
1323	und Westlich von der Saale. Abhandlungen der Naturforscgung Gessellschaften zu Halle, 23:
1324	1-352.
1325	Zeder M.A. & Lemoine X. (2020). Factors affecting molar size in Sus scrofa. Journal of
1326	Archaeological Science, 124: 105266.

1327	CAPTIONS
1328	
1329	Fig. 1 - (color online) Location of the study area. a) The extensional basins cited in the text are
1330	highlighted. Red star: Vigna Nuova; black star: Selvella. b) Detail of the Vigna Nuova outcrop.
1331	
1332	Fig. 2 - (color online) Taphonomy of the Vigna Nuova assemblages. a) Detail of the inner part of a
1333	proboscidean bone (SABAP_UMB 22.3.264) showing heavy mineralization and filling of trabeculae
1334	by minerals and organic matter. b) Distribution of weathering stages (following Behrensmeyer, 1978)
1335	in the fossils from the two fossiliferous layers of Vigna Nuova.
1336	
1337	Fig 3 - (color online) Carnivorans from Vigna Nuova (Italy), lower layer. a) cf. Megantereon: right
1338	upper canine (SABAP_UMB 129842) in labial (a1) and distal (a2) views. b-d) Canis sp.: cervical
1339	vertebrae 3-7 (SABAP_UMB 129850) in dorsal view (b); left rib (SABAP_UMB 129875) in lateral
1340	view (c); thoracic vertebrae 2-3 (SABAP_UMB 129875) in lateral view (d). Scale bar: 2 cm. e-f)
1341	Comparison between the vertebrae C3-C4 from Vigna Nuova (SABAP_UMB 129850) (e) and those
1342	of Canis etruscus from Olivola (IGF 4523) (f) in left lateral view. Vertebrae are shown in anatomical
1343	connection, as they were discovered; the relative position of the vertebrae in the two specimens is
1344	slightly different (C4 is rotated clockwise with respect to C3 in SABAP_UMB 129850, while the two
1345	vertebrae are almost aligned in IGF 4523). Red asterisks indicate broken portions. The morphology
1346	of the posterior edge of C4 in SABAP_UMB 129850 is estimated (dotted line) because it is partially
1347	covered by C5. Scale bar: 2 cm. g) Mustelidae indet., left upper canine (SABAP_UMB 22.3.263) in
1348	mesial view. Scale bar: 1 cm.
1349	
1350	Fig. 4 - (color online) Comparisons between Machairodontinae upper canines. a) From left to right:
1351	Smilodon fatalis Leidy, 1868 from La Brea Tar Pits (LAMC Hc1142); Megantereon cultridens from

Villarroya (IPS36785); M. cultridens from Villarroya (IPS36784); cf. Megantereon from Vigna

Nuova (SABAP\_UMB 129842; reversed); *Homotherium crenatidens* from Incarcal-I (IPS IN-I1542); *H. crenatidens* from Incarcal-I (IPS IN-I-421). Scale bar: 2 cm. b) Violin plot for the width/length ratio of the upper canine (measured at the cervix) in Pliocene to Middle Pleistocene *Homotherium*, *M. cultridens*, *Megantereon adroveri* Pons-Moyà, 1987, and the Vigna Nuova specimen. Legend: Epi, Epivillafranchian; EVal, Early Villafranchian; Gal, Galerian; LVal, Late Villafranchian; MVal, Middle Villafranchian. Sources of data: Ballesio (1963); de Bonis (1976); Ficcarelli (1979); Hemmer (2001); Sardella & Iurino (2012).

Fig. 5 - Equus cf. senezensis from Vigna Nuova (Italy), lower layer. a) Left hindlimb with distal tibia, tarsus, metatarsals II-III-IV (SABAP\_UMB 129856+129861+129862+129868): specimen in anatomical connection, lateral view (a1); metatarsals in anterior (a2) and posterior (a2) views. b) Left astragalus (SABAP\_UMB 129869) in anterior (b1) and medial (b2) views. c) Left metacarpals II-III-IV (SABAP\_UMB 129840) in anterior (c1) and posterior (c2) views. d) Mandible (SABAP\_UMB 129835+129837): incisor arcade in occlusal (d1) and ventral (d2) views; left corpus fragment with p2 in labial (d3) and occlusal (d4) views. Scale bar: 5 cm.

Fig. 6 - (color online) Biometric comparisons between the horse from Vigna Nuova and several *Equus* samples from the Plio-Pleistocene of Eurasia. a) Bivariate plot comparing the maximum width (M6) versus maximum length (M1) of the p2. b) PCA performed on ten measurements of the third metatarsal (M1, maximum length; M3, midshaft width; M4, depth of the diaphysis at level of M3; M5, proximal articular width; M6, proximal articular depth; M10, distal maximum maximum supraarticular width; M11, distal maximum articular width; M12, distal maximum keel depth; M13, distal maximum depth of the lateral condyle; M14, distal maximum depth of the medial condyle). c-d) Log10 ratio diagrams of third metatarsal measurements in European Gelasian (c) and Calabrian (d) equids. In addition to the measurements used in the PCA, this analysis includes M7 (maximum

diameter of the articular facet for the third tarsal) and M8 (diameter for the anterior facet for the fourth tarsal).

Fig 7 - (color online) Artiodactyls from Vigna Nuova (Italy). a) cf. *Leptobos*: horn core fragment (SABAP\_UMB 129851). b) *Croizetoceros ramosus*: maxilla with P2-M3 (SABAP\_UMB 129863) in occlusal (b1) and labial (b2) views. c-h) *'Pseudodama'* sp.: right hemimandible with p2-m3 (SABAP\_UMB 129848) in occlusal (c1) and labial (c2) views; left hemimandible with dp4 (fragmented), m1-m2 (SABAP\_UMB 129865+129860) in occlusal (d1) and labial (d2) views; left frontal fragment with antler basis (SABAP\_UMB 129845) in medial (e1) and anterior (e2) views; right antler fragment (SABAP\_UMB 129880) in lateral (f1) and anterior (f2) views; right M1 (SABAP\_UMB 129870) in occlusal view (g). h) Cervidae indet. (large size): left maxilla with dP2-M2 (SABAP\_UMB 129866) in occlusal (h1) and labial (h2) views. j) *Sus* cf. *strozzii*: maxilla with P4-M2 and M3 fragment (SABAP\_UMB 129847) in occlusal view. Scale bar: 2 cm.

Fig. 8 - Comparisons between *Croizetoceros ramosus* upper tooth rows. a) SABAP\_UMB 129863 from Vigna Nuova. b) NHMB Prr.346 from Les Etouaires (France; reversed). c) MCL QSV-766 from Saint Vallier (France). d) AUT GER-188 from Gerakarou (Greece). e) IPS28245/740b from La Puebla de Valverde (Spain; reversed). The fossils are drawn not to scale to highlight morphological similarities.

Fig. 9 - (color online) Boxplots of upper tooth measurements (mm) comparing the suid from Vigna
Nuova with *Sus arvernensis*, *Sus strozzii*, and *Sus scrofa*. Boxplots show minimum, median, and
maximum values with 25<sup>th</sup> and 75<sup>th</sup> percentile of each sample. L, length; W, width.

Fig. 10 - (color online) cf. *Leptobos* from Vigna Nuova (Italy), upper layer. a) Left hemimandible with p4-m3 (SABAP UMB 129836) in labial (a1) and occlusal (a2) views. b) Left P2 (SABAP UMB

129855) in occlusal view; c) Atlas (SABAP UMB 129839) in ventral (c1) and dorsal (c2) views. d) Right metacarpal (SABAP UMB 129838) in proximal (d1) and anterior (d2) views. e) Horn core fragment (SABAP UMB 22.3.248). f) Horn core fragment (SABAP UMB 22.3.249). g) Intermediate phalanx (SABAP UMB 129854) in abaxial (g1) and axial (g2) views. Scale bar: 5 cm. Fig. 11 - (color online) Bivariate plot comparing the maximum length (Lmax; in mm) versus the ratio between the distal end width (DEW) and maximum length of the metacarpal in several samples of Eurasian bovines. The sample of *Leptobos etruscus* includes data from Faella/Matassino and Olivola (Italy), Senèze (France), and Fonelas P-1 (Spain). The sample of Leptobos vallisarni includes data from Upper Valdarno and Farneta (Italy). The sample of *Leptobos* ex gr. SEM includes the following sub-samples: Leptobos cf. stenometopon from Montopoli (Italy); Leptobos stenometopon/elatus from Upper Valdarno (Italy; several sites); Leptobos elatus from Les Etouaires (France) and Villarroya (Spain); Leptobos merlai from Saint Vallier (France); Leptobos cf. furtivus from Senèze and Olivola; Leptobos aff. furtivus from Upper Valdarno and Carsoli (Italy). The sample of Eobison includes the following sub-samples: Eobison sp. from Venta Micena (Spain), Eobison degiulii from Pirro Nord (Italy); Eobison cf. degiulii from Capena (Italy) and Mygdonia Basin (Greece); Eobison georgicus (Burchak-Abramovich & Vekua, 1994) from Dmanisi (Georgia); Eobison palaeosinensis Teilhard de Chardin & Piveteau, 1930 from Nihewan Basin (China). The sample of Bison menneri includes data from Untermassfeld (Germany). The sample of Bison schoetensacki includes data from Süssenborn and Mauer (Germany), Vallparadís composite section (Spain), Le Vallonnet, Le Vassirie, and Durfort (France). Source of data: Sorbelli et al. (2021), and references therein.

1404

1405

1406

1407

1408

1409

1410

1411

1412

1413

1414

1415

1416

1417

1418

1419

1420

1421

1422

1423

1424