

Chapter 4

URBAN MANAGEMENT INITIATIVES IN PAKISTAN

4.1- Introduction

This chapter explains the status of urban governance and development plan procedure to manage spatial growth in cities of Pakistan. It basically answers the first research question presented in chapter-1 i.e. What have been the development plan practices in Pakistan? In second section it examined urban management in the perspective of the five year plans. Section three has given an assessment of Management of Cities Policy 1987. Next it has examined the National Conservation Strategy. Then it analyzes the role of Federal government institutions in urban management which includes the assessment of Cantonment Boards, Defense Housing Authorities, Capital Development Authority and National Reconstruction Bureau. Thereafter, section fifth explaining the role of local level institutions in urban management, it incorporates the examination of Improvement Trusts, Development Authorities and Local Government Institutions. Finally it is giving a brief review of the urban development plans in Pakistan.

4.2- Urban Management in the Perspective of Five Year Plans

Soon after independence, formation of an organized effort was intensely realized to meet the planning requirement and integrate development work accordingly. Initially a development board was established in 1948 to coordinate development projects. In addition there was a planning advisory committee to assist the development board. A six year plan called “Colombo Plan” was prepared by the board. Thereafter in 1958, the board was renamed as “Planning Commission”. President/Prime Minister was declared as the Chairman of the Planning Commission and its deputy chairman (a cabinet minister) as its operational head. At present Planning Commission is responsible for the preparation of national five years plans, annual, medium term and perspective plans. The Commission also coordinates with the Federal Ministries, Provincial Governments, Autonomous Bodies and the private sector in connection with the preparation of development plans (GoP, 1997).

4.2.1- First five year plan

The first Five Year Plan (1955-60) was prepared by the Planning Board and published it in May 1956. This plan has mentioned manifested stages for the country's physical development needs.

The concept of planning was in fact introduced first in the Colombo Plan (1950). However, the first national five year plan refined this concept and proposed to establish some institutions through which planning could be effectively understood and implemented in future (GoP, 1955). The plan maintained to initiate the concept of physical planning; however, it remained limited to house the displaced families from India. Therefore, the administration did not adhere to the specified policies for coordinated planning for urban and rural areas as well as institutional development. Most of the recommended programs were not initiated or left incomplete, while a number of expensive sectorial schemes contrary to the plan were introduced (GoP, 1960).

4.2.2- Second five year plan

The second Five Year Plan was prepared for the period (1960-65) by the Planning Commission. Meanwhile the government decided to relocate the capital of Pakistan to Islamabad and also design and build a small subsidiary capital in East Pakistan. Therefore, the aspect of physical planning was intensely realized and the plan had a great focus on professional and institutional development to produce master plans for the rest of the cities too. The document of the plan explicitly demanded guided development and urban growth management through master plans and therefore allocated Rs. 18 million for preparation of master plans for selected 8 towns in East and 9 towns and cities in West Pakistan (GoP, 1966). In West Pakistan only four master plans for Lahore, Faisalabad, Peshawar and Hyderabad were completed till the end of the plan period, due to non availability of basic land use maps and lack of professional town planners in many cities of the country greatly hampered plan preparation process (Khan, 1983a). Unfortunately, none of these plans were properly implemented due to absence of appropriate legislation for physical planning, capacitated institutions and also due to lack of professionals in the field (GoP, 1966). Consequently growth of cities occurred in a haphazard manner, mostly with laissez-faire development pattern and physical development was not subjected to appropriate planning control.

4.2.3- Third five year plan

The Third Five Year plan was prepared for the period (1965-70) by the Planning Commission. The plan expressed that in the sphere of urban development a comprehensive program of research studies was initiated, to assess the systems of physical planning in selected countries. In light of these assessments the plan policies for physical development were framed in the context

of national and regional level. The physical planning approach adopted by the plan was based on the concept of coordination and integration of sectorial program in terms of the most advantageous uses of the land and harmony with the needs and distribution of population. The plan proposed to initiate the first modest comprehensive program for physical planning and housing, both on a curative and a preventive basis. The plan proposed preparation of 45 Outline Development Plans, 23 Urban Development Plans, and five Regional Development Plans for both (East and West) of the country (GoP, 1966).

In West Pakistan up to the end of third plan period six Master Plans and one Outline Development Plan would have been completed but as yet legal framework and administrative arrangements have not been finalized to implement these plans (Khan, 1983b). Therefore no such efforts have been made to vigorously address the congested and ever expanding nature of the cities except sporadic development of infrastructure only (GoP, 1971). Unfortunately, the plan was abandoned very soon due to a combination of adverse circumstances (war with India) in the very first year of the Plan.

4.2.4- Fourth five year plan

Consecutively the 4th five year plan (1971-76), called upon that uncontrolled development and an ineffective urbanization strategy placed enormous hurdles on the way to wholesome progress. The strategy proposed in the plan was to prepare regional plans instead of isolated master plans. Therefore the concept of regional planning was considered rigorously to mobilize the latent resources and aspirations of different regions. In this regard the plan proposed to establish independent departments of physical planning in all the provinces, to achieve a reasonable amount of success in the implementation of the plan policies and programs. The plan also proposed that professional staff within the planning organization should be increased. Section 36(xii) P-477 illustrates that Special priorities should be given to Urban, Metropolitan and Regional Development plans as well as Transportation and Traffic Planning Studies. The plan expressed that special efforts should be made to improve urban and metropolitan transport system in selected cities by means of widening of roads and streets, provision of parking spaces and providing better facilities for mass transport. Whereas in section 36 (xxiii) regarding "*Policies for Metropolitan and Urban Development*", the plan expresses that difference of opinion about policies for urban and metropolitan development exists amongst professionals.

Some experts feel that the *“growth of large urban centers ought to be discouraged and all efforts should be made for finding new urban centers or for promoting the growth of medium sized towns”*. However, others feel that *“it is not a good idea to discourage the growth of large urban centers. Their feeling is that our large urban centers and metropolitan areas were never adequately planned and accordingly some of the problems of transportation, facilities and services and housing had risen due to our faulty planning. By simply putting negative control on the growth of large cities we might obstruct our economic growth. Therefore, there is an urgent need for a clear-cut national policy for industrial and urban development”*. In this regards the plan concluded that the concept of “growth control” does not necessarily mean that complete halt for all sort of physical expansion would be made, but rather it reflects that growth management practices are to be introduced (GoP, 1977). It supports that there must be a limit to any sort of activity within specified time period, and that the cities must have defined limits for the expansion.

The plan also emphasized that until now enough attention has not been paid to metropolitan and urban administration. Too many institutions and agencies were responsible for various sectors of development within urban and metropolitan area (GoP, 1977). It was proposed that new types of urban and metropolitan management (as suited to our needs) should be promoted.

The plan also pointed out that there exist dramatic disparities among various income groups within cities. A very small proportion of the urban population enjoyed very high facilities and services, while a very large part of the urban population in many cases are living in depressed areas. The plan proposed awareness program to prepare people that how to live in an urban area should be introduced during the plan period, to promote civic sense as well as public participation in urban development. However, little progress seems to have been achieved and none of the plans’ proposal for urban development were considered in reality, consequently cities grew by their own fashion. Only one regional plan, one metropolitan development plan, one urban development plan and nine outline development plans were completed during the period (GoP, 1977). The most important was the preparation of a development plan for Karachi Metropolitan region with the assistance of the United Nations Development Program. But it also ended in itself due to non existence of a full fledge organization to implement the plan (GoP, 1977).

4.2.5- Fifth five year plan

In light of the fifth plan (1977-83), a Federal level Ministry for Housing and Works with a separate division for Environment and Urban affairs has been created. While the Government of the Punjab, Sindh and NWFP have established separate Housing and Physical Planning Departments. In this context Development Authorities have been created in Lahore, Faisalabad, Multan, Hyderabad, Peshawar, Mardan and Quetta to undertake urban development in a comprehensively planned manner. In NWFP, a Provincial Urban Development Board was prepared to tackle the problems of urban areas within the province. In Sind, a new organization, namely Sind Development Authority, has been created on the pattern of Karachi Development Authority for urban areas other than Karachi. A Regional Planning Organization in Sind has also been established to prepare regional plans for Sind Province.

Legislation for physical planning and up-dated local bye-laws as well as better enforcement arrangements were proposed so that the development of cities can proceed on a rational and planned basis. In the sphere of physical planning, the plan proposed that to economise the use of scarce urban land, high density development will be encouraged in major cities.

In order to encourage house construction activity in the private sector, housing has been declared as an industry. Tax incentives, including income tax rebate and tax exemptions on low income housing, were provided and commercial banks were authorized to provide loans for house construction. The allocations of the House Building Finance Corporation were substantially increased during the plan period.

Another important aspect of the 5th five year plan was to suggest regional level planning and to propose the concept of agro-villes at regional level in order to decrease rural urban shifts in the country. A regional plan for Karachi metropolitan area has been prepared. Regional Plans for Sind, NWFP, Baluchistan and areas of Multan, Bahawalpur and Sargodha Divisions were also materialized. Institutional capability for regional planning was being created in the Provincial Governments with UN assistance. During the fifth plan, the institutional arrangements were further strengthened and a National Institute of Regional Planning was suggested to be set up in the country. Training in regional planning concepts and techniques was proposed to be expanded. Regional plans, under preparation, were decided to be finalized to provide a new and

significant input in the development process during the Fifth Plan. An allocation of Rs. 38.0 million was being made in the Fifth Plan for preparation of 6 regional studies. In addition, an allocation of Rs. 4.0 million was also made for the preparation of six district plans.

It was proclaimed that the process of urbanization cannot be slowed down sharply at least in the short term. However, haphazard growth has to be checked. The development of cities should be regulated through proper urban plans. During the Fifth Plan, it was proposed to undertake the preparation of five Metropolitan Development Plans and Outline Development Plans of twenty selected urban areas for which an allocation of Rs. 44.0 million has been made.

4.2.6- Sixth five year plan

The Sixth Five year plan was formulated for (1983-88). It has no focus on plan formulation and had not suggested to undertake any specific programs for the city development plans preparation. The Sixth plan made a decisive shift to a laissez-faire philosophy. It has policies more concerned with infrastructure development through local government institution.

4.2.7- Seventh five year plan

The seventh five year plan was formulated for the period of (1988-93). This plan pointed out that even after the previous plan emphasis on regional development, still a major shift of population is taking place from rural to urban areas. As a consequence, urban areas are presently faced with an acute housing problem, environmental degradation and pressure on community facilities (GoP, 1988). The problem is much more pronounced in the larger cities of Karachi and Lahore which are likely to attract the bulk of migrants from the countryside.

The 7th five year plan set forth the following strategies to be adopted during the plan period. In the light of this strategy, the programs to be taken up under various sub-sectors are described as follows.

- Master Plans for all major towns having first class municipalities or metropolitan corporations will be developed. The plan pointed out that although Master Plans were prepared for a number of cities and towns but were not implemented.
- To improve the legal framework, the preparation of urban development plans its approval and implementation process. While the existing practices of the provincial housing and

town planning departments are cumbersome, which prepare urban development plans but its approving authority is with local government departments. This perplexity will have to be removed. The plan suggested that the provincial governments would be urged to either merge both the functions into a single agency or evolve a legal framework to approve and improve master plans within a specified time frame.

- Master plans will be reviewed and prepared for metropolitan cities of Karachi, Lahore and secondary cities; outline development plans for intermediate cities having a population of 25,000 to 500,000 will be taken up.
- In urban centers with a population in excess of 500,000, development authorities will be set up to undertake large urban development projects in accordance with these master plans.
- In order to economize on scarce land in the urban areas, multiple constructions on a single plot will be encouraged.
- To carry out environmental improvement programs; all local authorities will develop detailed plans for implementation during the seventh plan period.
- Future planning of towns and settlements must cater for parks and play grounds based on the requirements of the population.

4.2.8- Eighth five year plan

The eighth five year plan (1993– 98) envisaged that urban population will grow from 33 percent in 1993 to 35 percent in 1998. This increase was about 46 million and it was feared that the brunt of this increase is likely to be borne by major cities such as Karachi, Lahore, Faisalabad, Multan, Gujranwala, Peshawar, Quetta, Rawalpindi and Hyderabad (GoP, 1994). Therefore it was suggested that economic and social policies are to be so designed that the direction of urbanization shifts towards secondary and intermediate cities. In the sphere of physical development the development strategy was that, the investment opportunities and availability of social services will attract entrepreneurs in the secondary and intermediate cities/towns in order to minimize migration towards bigger cities.

4.2.9- Tenth five year plan

This is the current plan and is formulated for a period started at 2010 till 2015. A new vision that Planning Commission has presented is people centric development. It endeavours not just

poverty reduction but makes a serious attempt to exit from poverty towards sustainable inclusive growth. The vision also attempts to remove the provincial and intra-provincial disparities. This plan hopes to remove the social deficit in health, education, gender equity, social safety nets etc. However, the physical planning and urban development has not been given importance in this plan.

4.3- Management of Cities Policy (1987)

In pursuance of the Cabinet directive, the Ministry of Housing and Works in collaboration with the Environment and Urban Affairs Division formulated a national policy in 1987 for the management of cities in Pakistan. Substantial reforms suggested in the legal, administrative, financial management and human resource development are as under:

In the legal domain, three areas of action with sub programs have been identified in the policy (GoP, 1987) and are reproduce as follow.

i- Revision of laws

It was highlighted in the policy that there is a need for simpler, more effective provincial legislation in the following areas:

- a) land acquisition
- b) Planning
- c) Electoral laws for urban local government bodies.

ii- Reorientation of rules

It was emphasized in the policy that there is a need for reorientation of provincial rules made under existing and proposed laws. The policy recommended that rules need to be made based on performance rather than prescription and control oriented. In this domain the policy recommendations are:

- a) Rules under Local Government Ordinance need to be reviewed. Some rules need to be revoked to allow flexibility and initiative in urban local governments.
- b) Rules for coordination between agencies need to be framed, as no rules of business for coordinated action exist in the present set up.

iii- More use of Bye-laws

Focus needs to be shifted to encourage urban local governments and urban agencies to make their own bylaws. It is evident that laws imposed from above are not self enforcing, besides there exists loop holes in the existing bye laws in the following areas:

- a) Planning (zoning, scheme identification, selection and processing).
- b) Building control (market oriented approach)
- c) Environmental control.

In the administrative sphere the policy recommends rationalizing the role of various agencies and induction of systems to enable inter-agency and inter-departmental coordination by evolving effective partnerships, including good conventions and clear systems for case processing responsibilities. These were identified as under:

- i- Coordination between agencies:*
- ii- Efficiency within agencies*

In the financial management sphere, the policy proposes:

- i- Plan oriented budgeting
- ii- Double entry accrual accounting system
- iii- Unit cost accounting

It was envisaged that these measures would lead to progressive introduction of a full-fledged planning, programming and budgeting system. In the sphere of human resource development, the policy analyses availability of professionals (urban planners) and proposed to remove the existing shortfall through the following measures:

- i- Improving prospects and inducements
- ii- Induction training
- iii- On-job service training
- iv- Career management and removal of disparities and
- v- Creation of itinerant team at higher levels of government.

It was anticipated that these reforms could strengthen urban local government institutions in order to introduce innovative planning techniques. As a result it would bring radical changes in

the prevailing laws pertaining to urban development and would establish rules/regulations to guide city wide development prospects, allow greater local initiatives and an improved decision making system. Institutions would be strengthened in respect of trained manpower and supporting staff to facilitate and initiate planned development within cities.

In order to increase administrative efficiency, equity and citizen welfare in cities, the policy recommended various options on individual case to case basis and action agencies were recommended to bring the required change in the system¹... (GoP, 1987).

4.4- National Conservation Strategy

The Pakistan National Conservation Strategy (PNCS) was emerged in response to the World Conservation Strategy (WCS) developed in collaboration with the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN). It was approved as official policy by the Federal Cabinet on March 1, 1992. The PNCS launched after almost a decade of analysis and discussion, and has served as a de facto environmental policy for Pakistan. It presents the environmental situation in Pakistan and recommends actions to readdress issues pertaining to environmental degradation in order to facilitate sustainable utilization of natural resources (Naureen, 2009).

A total of 86 specific programs were identified in 14 core areas, which included urban growth management as its prime goal for sustainable development. Various ministries including Urban Affairs and Local Government established a special cell for the implementation of PNCS. The midterm review of PNCS was undertaken in 2000, this review finds that achievements under PNCS have been scanty and primary in nature i.e. awareness rising rather than actual on ground improvement of natural resources and environment (Arthur, 2000). This review pointed out that PNCS influence on economic and social issues is limited and some basic elements of sustainable development such as sustainable livelihoods and climate change are not considered by PNCS. Therefore, like other plans, policies and programs, PNCS remains just a good document and could not fully guide the development in its true sense. It was necessary to strengthen the institutions, set priorities and then to start its implementation. The enforcement procedure and tools of implementation are important but there exists shortage of skilled manpower to implement plans and policies in Pakistan (Naureen, 2009).

¹ For more detail see table 10.1 Pages (125-134) of Management of Cities Policy, 1987 (Pakistan).

4.5- Role of Federal Government Institutions in Urban Management

In Pakistan urban development evolved through various forms but did not settled down with a perfect and sustainable setup. The institutions have taken various shapes and forms to address urban environmental issues in cities. Unfortunately none of these initiatives prove to be successful for one reason or another. Most specifically the institutional strength, power and function remain overwhelmingly cumbersome and unclear. This muddled and unclear power and function completely ruins down the consistent efforts for effective planning. Thus it could be discovered from these perplexities that why a uniform and consistent planning and development move does not take place in Pakistan.

The whole range of physical planning acts, ordinances, rules and regulation were assessed and analyzed to find loopholes and gaps of the system, which are constantly hampering development plans implementation and causes for the failure of such plan in all major cities of Pakistan.

4.5.1- Cantonment Boards

The areas of major British interest were cantonments. These new settlement were located outside but in close vicinity of the existing cities to accommodate colonial masters in a planned manner and were designed to serve the British strategic needs. For this purpose, several notable English planners like, Sir Patrick Geddes, were brought to Sub-continent for a very brief period (Khan, 1983b). It is urged that during this period certain schemes were prepared and implemented for limited physical planning of selected cities and some irrigation colonies. However, after 1921 the British rulers have changed their priorities and the temporary interest in physical planning declined (Khan, 1983b).

The planning and development of Cantonments still continue to consolidate and amend the administrative functions of Cantonments in Pakistan through the Cantonment Act, promulgated in 1924. Presently there are 40 Cantonments in Pakistan, 18 in Punjab province, 8 in Sind, 11 in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and 3 in Baluchistan. The Cantonment Act 1924 spells out the classes of these Cantonments. Cantonments with civilian population of more than 100, 000, 50,000 to 100,000 and less than 50,000 are to be considered as Class I, II and III respectively. Thus CBs

set up to run the Cantonment administration with their own budgets and sources of revenue. The composition of these boards is in accordance with the criteria given in the Cantonment Act 1924.

(1) The Board members for Class I Cantonment:

- (a) The Officer Commanding the station or, if the Federal Government so directs in respect of any cantonment, such other military officer as may be nominated by the Competent Authority;
- (b) Twelve elected members;
- (c) The Health Officer;
- (d) The Maintenance Engineer;
- (e) A Magistrate of the first class nominated by the District Magistrate;
- (f) Nine civil or military officers nominated by the Officer Commanding the station by order in writing.

(2) The Board members for Class II Cantonment:

- (a) The Officer Commanding the station or, if the Federal Government so directs in respect of any Cantonment, such other military officer as may be nominated by the Competent Authority;
- (b) Seven elected members;
- (c) The Health Officer;
- (d) The Maintenance Engineer;
- (e) A Magistrate of the first class nominated by the District Magistrate;
- (f) Four military officers nominated by the Officer Commanding the station by order in writing.

(3) The Board members for a Class III Cantonment:

- (a) The Officer Commanding the station or, if the Federal Government so directs in respect of any cantonment, such other military officer as may be nominated by the Competent Authority;
- (b) Two elected members: Provided that the Federal Government may, by notification in the official Gazette, increase the number of elected members to such extent not exceeding five as it deems fit;
- (c) The Health Officer;
- (d) One military officer nominated by the Officer Commanding the station by order in writing:
Provided that, if the number of elected members is increased under clause (b), the number of members so nominated be one less than the number of elected members so increased.

The Act authorizes Cantonment Boards to carry and regulate development activities within their limits under the provisions of this act and that the Provincial Law on the subject would not be applicable within the territorial limits of the Cantonment Board concerned (Government of India, 1924). The Act also enabled Cantonments to make their own bye-laws for governing local matters that require particular treatments. Based on the urgency of the emerging issues within

their limits, and the continuous expansion of military colonies, the government of Pakistan passed an Ordinance in 2002. However, later on due to unknown reasons the government abrogated the ordinance. In the prevailing system Cantonment Boards work directly under the Federal Defense Ministry and are not responsible for following the plans of LPAs. Cantonments generate social and environmental problems, particularly traffic and sewerage problems for their parent cities, however, the relevant laws do not address solutions to these problems in the rest of the cities. Therefore, the assignment of powers and functions to organizations within cities creates confusion and mismanagement in the remaining city enclaves. The Cantonment law is applicable only to development associated with the Directorate of Military Land and Cantonment (MLC). Agencies working under the military headquarters, such as the Defense Housing Authority (DHA), can develop land for the benefit of the armed forces but are not directly controlled by any specific development law. This phenomenon greatly hampers the implementation of Master or Structure plans prepared by DAs. This clearly suggests that a city within a city exists with no common vision and coordination in Pakistan (Ahmad and Anjum, 2011).

4.5.2- Defense Housing Authorities

Defense Housing Authority (DHA) is a residential enterprise which was established in 1953 first in Karachi and then it extended its branches/activities to all major cities of Pakistan. DHAs have separate laws for development projects in their respective areas. Section 24 of the DHA ordinance 2007 provides indemnity to the authority such that “No suit or legal proceedings shall lie against the Authority, the Governing Body, the Executive Board, the Administrator, or any of their members, or employees of the Authority for anything done or purported to have been done by them in good faith under the Ordinance, including the rules or the regulations made there under” (GoP, 2007). Utilizing this power, DHAs have the liberty to deviate from any sort of development plan that exists with the LPA. This is an urban planning dilemma for LPA planners to deal with the affairs of these institutions in the cities’ development plans or land use/zoning plans (Ahmad and Anjum, 2011). Whilst DHAs mega projects within various cities spread on thousands of acres of land (i.e. 11,640 acres of land on Super Highway Karachi) creating cities within cities.

4.5.3- Capital Development Authority

The Capital Development Authority (CDA) is responsible for providing municipal services in the capital city of Pakistan (Islamabad). CDA was established on June 14, 1960 through CDA Ordinance 1960. This Ordinance laid down its charter and defined its power and functions. Initially a three member's board was responsible to administer the Authority. However, at present the CDA board is comprised of the Chairman and head of various directorates such as: Planning, Administration, Finance, Environment, Estate, and Engineering (CDA Islamabad Web portal, 2012).

A master plan devised by an international Consultant firm, Doxiadis Associates provided a broad framework for the development of capital city on a grid iron pattern. Some of the concepts of the master plan, however, remained unrealized. Within Islamabad Capital Territory the concept of acquiring entire land for development of Islamabad Park remained an unaffordable proposition and led to large scale unauthorized construction. Development remained urban biased and neglected rural areas, induced migration to urban areas beyond its absorbing capacity. Thereafter, this master plan was reviewed consistently at the lapse of the time framework.

4.5.4- National Reconstruction Bureau

The establishment of National Reconstruction Bureau (NRB) came into being in November, 1999. Its prime responsibility was to formulate policy for reconstruction within the parameters of the 7-point agenda put forward by the Government of Pakistan, in October 1999. This new system was explained through 5-Ds concept i.e. Devolution of political power, Distribution of resources to the district, Decentralization of administrative authority, Diffusion of power and authority nexus and De-centralization of management functions. NRB devised recommendations to bring reforms in the Local Governments system and the police department which were approved in August 2000 by the National Security Council and the Federal Cabinet (GoP, Web, 2010).

Since August 2001, the administrative system went through some major transformations to de-concentrate federal and provincial functions, and devolve monetary and financial authorities and

responsibilities to Local Governments. This was an attempt to eliminate overlapping of responsibilities between the federal, provincial and local institutions in service delivery. Municipal and development authorities' functions have been decentralized to the TMA level in the districts governments. A significant development of this change was the abolition of urban and rural concept, which caused the merger of urban and rural Union Councils under one service delivery system.

The Local Government Ordinance 2001 was simultaneously promulgated in all the provinces of the country other than areas notified as Cantonments under the Cantonment Act, 1924. The main purpose of the ordinance was to decentralize administration and financial authority to ensure good governance, efficient services provision and rational decision through community's involvement at the grass root level. Various departments of the provincial government have been decentralized (change in operations, financial and management control) to the local government (GoP Web, 2010).

4.6- Role of Local Institutions in Urban Management

Pakistan, being a federation of five provinces, the Punjab, Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Baluchistan and Gilgit Baltistan as well as FATA, however, physical planning is not in the federal legislative responsibility. The provinces are responsible to deal with physical planning in accordance with their own legislation, rules and regulation pertaining to its need and preferences. Therefore province wise Act and Ordinances are listed in the table 4.1. The analysis of these acts and ordinances comprehended the rule of business of local level institutions to carry out development plan practices.

4.6.1- Improvement Trusts

Improvement Trusts were created through an Act of the Parliament in 1922 by the British rule in the sub-continent. Municipal Corporations and other government institutions handed over all vacant lands to Trusts. These institutions supported Municipalities and undertook a host of measures to improve sanitary and living conditions in major cities. The first Improvement Trust in areas now constituting Pakistan was established at Lahore in 1936 (Khan, 1983a).

After partition, Pakistan had faced formidable problems of housing the refugees. Cities were flooded by migrants and haphazard growth of cities occurred. Consequently sanitary conditions deteriorated due to over crowdedness and lack of physical infrastructure. The Municipalities were unable to tackle the issue promptly and there was an urgent need for development planning in cities. Looking at the experience of Lahore city, there was separate organization called Improvement Trust to shoulder development responsibilities with municipality. The government statutory created Improvement Trusts for bringing about improvements in the rest of the cities. By December 1964, the country had 22 Improvement Trusts in all major cities of the country (GoP, 1966). However, these institutions remained incapacitated and only three of these Trusts had qualified staff for physical planning and housing, while the rest of the Trusts remained incapacitated in terms of physical planning and housing tasks (GoP, 1966). Consequently Improvement Trusts have rarely undertaken physical planning; at best, they carry out systematic execution of schemes only. No such serious efforts were made to evaluate and review the system's failure but Development Authorities were established through various Urban Planning Acts to take over the responsibility for planning and development of the major cities.

4.6.2- Development Authorities

Development Authorities were established in major cities of the country after the promulgation of the Urban Planning Acts/Ordinances respectively in these provinces. These Acts and Ordinances repealed the Improvement Trusts and their establishments and other assets were transferred to the newly developed agencies i.e. Development Authorities (DAs).

Karachi Development Authority (KDA) was established in 1957 in order to prepare and implement the master plan for the city. KDA replaced Karachi Improvement Trust (KIT) through a presidential order No V of 1957. Empirical research has established that KDA launched various development projects such as: National Stadium & Karsaz, Liaquat National Hospital & Liaquat Memorial Library known as Dhoraji Colony KDA Scheme 1-A, Korangi Township, Malir Town, Drigh Township, Malir Extension Township, North Karachi Township, Old Nazimabad, North Nazimabad, Orangi Township, Baldia Township, Lyari Town, Hawksbay, Shah Latif, Mehran Town, Halkani Town, Landhi Industrial Area, Landhi Residential Scheme, Metroville-I to III, Gulzar-e-Hijri, Gulshan-e-Iqbal, Gulistan-e-Jauhar, Taiser Town, Korangi Industrial Area, SITE Metroville, mega transportation projects and light rail transit etc

(Wikipedia web, 2012). However, none of these development projects could confirm its relevance with the contemporary development plan for the city (Ahmad, 2009).

Recently Karachi Development Authority has launched some mega projects such as 16.5 kilometer long Lyari express way; development of DHA water front on around 600 acres of coastal land; A 24 kilometer long grade separated Karachi Elevated Expressway project and a 40 storied commercial high rise Karachi financial tower in deviation of the development plan (Ahmad, 2009).

Lahore Development Authority (LDA) was created under the LDA Act 1975 duly approved by Punjab Legislative Assembly. It replaced Lahore Improvement Trust in 1975. LDA is responsible for new planned development in Lahore city district/Metropolitan area. LDA acts as regulatory body for new development including housing schemes; commercial and industrial establishments; grants planning permissions for new housing projects, private houses in the city areas. It also manages urban renewal; traffic and transportation network planning through Traffic Engineering and Transport Planning Agency (TEPA); water supply through WASA, parks and arboriculture of the city and any new urban extension. The LDA succeeded to successively formulate two urban development plans for Lahore city, however, none of these got implemented.

The city has a record of violations and LDA played no role to control it. Recently the Lahore high court commission identified 480 high rise buildings constructed in violation of the permissible height (Dawn, 2009). In this connection the Supreme Court on Dec 29, 2009 ordered the Punjab Government to pull down all structures built in violation of the approved site plan (Dawn, 2010). Whereas, influential people have developed 102 housing schemes in violation of the city development plan proposals for the city (Hussain, 2012). The report says that some of these schemes are 10-30 years old. The officials claim that this was happened due to the perplexities of the law and that section 33 of the LDA Act is too weak to punish such developers. As the reporter explained that the developers succeed to get approval from the TMAs under the Local Government Ordinance 2001 if LDA refuses to give permission for such schemes.

Quetta Development Authority (QDA) came into existence in 1978 by the Government of Baluchistan. The jurisdiction of the QDA extends over whole of the Quetta city/Tehsil. So far it

has prepared two development plans for the city. There exists no empirical research on the development plan practices of the city. Ground realities exemplify great variations between what was proposed by the plan and what actually happened.

4.6.3- Local government institutions

The Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan conforms only to two levels of government (the federal and Provincial), there exists no Local Government. The tier of local government was always introduced whenever the other two remains dissolved. These three tiers of government never worked in parallel with each other and are therefore do not flourished in Pakistan.

The system of Local Government was first introduced in various military (Martial Law) regimes in the country for almost three times. First period was from (1959-72), second period was from (1979-88) and third period was from (1999-2008). These episodic attempts, gave us an inconsistent system for local development. The 1959 Basic Democracy Ordinance introduced a four tier structure of local government at the Divisional, District, Municipal Committees and the Town Committee level in urban areas. This hierarchy stayed functional simultaneously until 1972 in all the provinces. After a short while, the political government was again dissolved through another martial law in 1979, this time the LGO introduced a two tier system at district and union council level. These institutions were abandoned by the successive political government due to strong opponent of the martial law administrator. Therefore, all their policies remained appalled in the successive governments. Once again in 2001 the military rule introduced local government system in the country and promulgated LGO 2001. The LGO 2001 has given us a totally new system through NRB called devolution of power to the local level. It introduces three levels of hierarchies of the local government institutions in major cities called City District Governments (CDGs), Town Municipal Administration (TMAs) and Union Councils (UCs). The selection of Nazims and Naib Nazim for CDGs and TMAs were made through election among the elected members, while Union Nazim and Naib Nazim were elected through direct adult franchise election.

City District Governments: With the promulgation of the LGO 2001, the established institution in federal and provincial capital cities (Islamabad; Karachi; Lahore; Peshawar and Quetta) were devolved into new sort of organizations called City District Governments (CDGs). A CDG is a

district that consists entirely of a major city or large metropolitan area. Later on the large metropolitan cities have also been restructured into the City District status (Faisalabad; Multan; Rawalpindi and Gujranwala) by using section 8 of the LGO 2001. While there are 117 Districts in Pakistan, however, only nine districts were declared as CDGs. These CDGs are further subdivided into various Towns and Union Councils. Various powers were devolved to the district level in order to enhance the decision making process.

Town Municipal Administrations: Districts Governments were further subdivided into (Tehsil in rural and Town in urban) Municipal Administration called TMAs. City District Government Karachi is divided into 18-TMAs, City District Government Lahore into 9-TMAs, City District Government Faisalabad into 7-TMAs, City District Government Peshawar into 4-TMAs and City District Government Quetta into 3-TMAs etc. While each TMA is further sub divided into a number of Union Councils.

Union Councils: At the bottom was the Union Councils (UCs) to support the identification of various projects. The functions of UCs were limited and were responsible for execution of very small scale projects within their jurisdictions.

In actual multiplicity of institutions created a state of confusion among these institutions and finally it did not generate any cohesive action to carry out physical planning functions in the country. The development works were carried out through the consent of the members of parliaments. Similarly perplexities among Improvement Trusts and Municipalities as well as thereafter Development Authorities and Municipalities persisted without little head paid to it (For illustration of perplexities see appendix-3a).

4.7- Legal Framework

For the preparation of urban development plans various Acts and Ordinances were promulgated in various parts of the country (See table 4.1). The main purpose of these Acts was to establish Development Authorities, which would carry physical planning function in order to improve the quality of life in cities. A number of development plans (Master Plan, Structure Plan and Outline Development Plans) were prepared through these organizations (see appendix-2). Besides development plans, a series of Outline Development Plans were also prepared through various

consultants but could not be put into reality for many reasons. The province wise list of these initiatives is mentioned in the table (see appendix-2).

Table 4.1: Legal provision empowering institutions to prepare development plans in Pakistan

Punjab	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Sindh	Baluchistan
The LDA Act 1975	NWFP Urban Planning Ordinance 1978	Karachi Development Order 1957	QDA amendment Ordinance 1985
Punjab Development of Cities Act 1976	-	Hyderabad Development Authority Act 1976	-
Punjab LGO 2001	NWFP LGO 2001	Sindh LGO 2001	Baluchistan LGO 2001

Source: GoP Web portal.

Comparative analysis of these Acts/Ordinances shows that LGO 2001 simultaneously empowers local government institutions to carry out physical planning. Alongside, the Development Authorities have been empowered by their respective Acts and Ordinances to prepare the development plans. Ironically, these laws were not repealed nor covered with legal procedures to delegate the function of physical planning to the local government institutions. Therefore there remains complete complexities amongst the officials to carry out physical planning functions as the diversity of laws are creating perplexity and hampering the implementation of development plans in Pakistan (Ahamd and Anjum, 2011).

Similarly, confusion persists among the professionals regarding the term “Spatial Planning” given in LGO 2001. It is not defined that what is actually meant by spatial planning, what sort of plans it incorporates, whether it means master plans or structure plans, local plans or other sort of land use plans. The level of planning is also not clear, because large cities have more than one TMA and section (54A) of the ordinance empower that “Town Municipal Administration (TMAs) shall prepare spatial plans for Town in collaboration with Zila and Union Councils”. While Section, 29 of the ordinance empowers the Executive District Officer for preparation of development plans and its implementation etc.

Here it is quite pertinent to clarify the type of plan that LGO is proposing. If it means Master Plan for such plan at the district level then what plan will be prepared by the TMA to fulfill the function of the section (54A). If one goes for the Master Plans prepared by the TMA then how many plans will be prepared at the city level where more than one TMA exists?

In practice local government institutions have no capabilities to prepare and implement these plans (See chapter 6). The parallel counterpart institutions to the local government i.e. Development Authorities have capabilities to implement such plans but they lack responsibilities and political support to do so. Development activities are mainly controlled by the political leaders who give no regards to plan led process but to mould the plan according to their desires and wishes.

4.8- Urban Development Plans

To understand the concept of spatial planning in Pakistan, there is a need to set it in the context of the legacy of colonialism. When the British arrived they began to build cantonments in major cities for military and an area of civil lines for the administration (Go Punjab, 2008). Legal and regulatory framework (i.e. Cantonment Act 1924 and Cantonment Boards) were developed to manage the affairs of these cantonments. The spatial settings of these cantonments were properly planned in accordance to the principle of planning, but plan initiatives were not extended to other portion of the cities. Therefore, the growth of cities occurred in a haphazard manner as many settlements emerged next to these Cantonments.

After inception of the country in 1947, a plan led approach was realized in the very beginning for all major cities of the country. The 2nd Five Year Plan envisaged preparation of development plans for all major cities of the country. In order to guide and manage the growth of major cities in a planned manner development plans were prepared since 1960s for all major cities of Pakistan. The assessment of these plans is carried out to indicate how these instruments were prepared and implemented by their concerned agencies. A brief overview of the latest development plans of major cities is presented in the following table-4.2. However none of these plans proved to be successful in the achievement of its stated goals.

Table 4.2

Development plan practices in major cities of Pakistan

City/Plans	Major highlights of the plan
Karachi Strategic Development Plan (KSDP) 2020	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Prepared by Master Plan Group of Offices (MPGO)-CDGK and Consultants group of M/S ECIL and PADCO-AECOM. ▪ The KSDP extends over the whole City District of Karachi, consisting of 18 administrative towns, 6 cantonments, and the Federal and Provincial governments land holding agencies ▪ The CDGK has a vision of making Karachi a world class city and attractive economic centre with a decent life. Objectives are set for the achievement of the vision ▪ The KSDP was approved by the competent authority and have a legal status under Section 40 of the Sindh Local Government Ordinance 2001 (SLGO), for guiding city's growth ▪ Socio-economic survey and a land use survey were carried out ▪ Proposed that densification and infill process will intensify to accommodate future growth. ▪ The plan proposed mixed use developments in designated areas and in new development areas ▪ The plan proposed development of new urban centers and its connections through improved radial and concentric roads and improved public transport services ▪ A new inter/intra bus terminal is proposed to be located along the RCD Highway and Northern Bypass. ▪ A new warehousing area, adjacent to a new wholesale market is proposed ▪ The plan proposed a new ICT centre in Bin Qasim ▪ New housing areas for employees of the centre will be developed to the northeast and south. ▪ A new government centre at the intersection of the Northern Bypass and Super Highway is proposed ▪ Renewal of Federal and Sindh Government Secretariat Blocks is proposed ▪ Renewal and up-gradation of government servant quarters at specified location ▪ Land for special projects to be undertaken by the private sector or for public uses such as hospitals, educational institutions transport infrastructure for BRT / Mass Transit or municipal ▪ Offices up gradation undertaken on case by case basis ▪ The plan proposed three more location / zones for industrial development at specified location. To realize the early development of these industrial zones the requisite infrastructure is also proposed. ▪ The plan proposed to allocate an additional site for an International Airport for future use. ▪ An urban corridor with a length of 38 Km is planned for special purposes along the Northern Bypass. The proposed land use include housing, commercial, institutional and public uses. ▪ The plan proposed 9000 acres for Education City. ▪ The plan identified three major sites for graveyards ▪ The plan propose new sites for landfill sites ▪ The plan propose that CDGK will develop an action program to address the housing backlog in the plan period at guiding principles given in the plan ▪ The propose that the demand of low-income groups would be met through high ratio (75 percent) of small plots in all housing schemes ▪ The plan proposed that about 100,000 new housing units will be required annually. Etc
Lahore Integrated Master Plan for Lahore-2021	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Prepared by NESPAK (2004) a local firm ▪ The plan was formally approved by the City District Government Lahore Nazim in 2004 ▪ The plan includes aggressive programs of densification and infill development with the objective to channelize the growth from south to southwest of the LMA ▪ Detailed land use survey is conducted ▪ Proposed to establish 10,000 hectares of industrial zones in the southwest of the LMA at Chunnian ▪ A total demand of 1,265,183 housing units is estimated until 2021, which includes existing shortage of 199,204 units ▪ The IMPL did not proposed a standard plot sizes for housing (particularly the poor) in the city ▪ The do not identify the potential sites for the new housing needs ▪ The IMPL also does not provide sufficient and realistic land projections for commercial activities ▪ The plan focused on industrial establishment and is not adequately covering the present and future commercial and trade boost ▪ The plan does not considering the land requirements for institutional and educational activities ▪ Development of the city has been restricted on the north side ▪ Lake city has also been proposed to the north of Lahore ▪ The plan strictly oppose the conservation of nonconforming uses particularly commercialization of residential areas. ▪ Trade centre measuring about 14000 kanal is proposed to be developed in Johar Town. ▪ Proposed 2-business districts on the south of Hudiara Drain of 4800 kanal each ▪ Proposed 140 roads in various towns proposed for commercialization ▪ Proposed 19 roads for industrial use ▪ Proposed 18 for commercial/industrial use in Iqbal, Nishter and Ravi towns. ▪ 2-5% area allocated for commercial use in the public and private approved housing schemes. Etc
Faisalabad Faisalabad Structure Plan-1986-2000	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Prepared by Indus Consultants a local firm ▪ The plan was not approved from the competent authority ▪ The period of implementation was 15 year ▪ Land use survey was conducted ▪ A zoning plan for the city is described in the Structure Plan ▪ The proposed areas of various uses in future were also forecasted in the plan ▪ The plan recommended infill development in the existing built up areas in order to attain a form of compact development

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the plan forecasts the provision of 13000 houses for meeting the existing shortage ▪ One shop for 50 persons. ▪ The plan allowed 'linear development' along the major roads ▪ The plan propose that the city should expand on the radial form on the neighborhood pattern ▪ The SP aimed at the development of secondary and tertiary centers beyond the inner metropolitan area to reduce the pressure on CBD ▪ The plan considered that the FDA established new markets/commercial areas in different parts of the city to be enough for future growth of population ▪ The plan proposed two ring roads and a green belt with a width of 2 miles at the periphery of the external ring road was recommended all around the city ▪ The plan does not provide any focused provisions related to the promotion of industries.
Rawalpindi Rawalpindi Master Plan (1996-2016)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The plan was prepared for a period of 20 years ▪ The plan was approved by the Government of Punjab, Department of Local Government and Rural Development in 1998 ▪ Four zones have been proposed for residential, commercial, Cantonment and future development ▪ It provided broad guidelines for a systematic and planned growth of the city ▪ Extensive land use study has been made ▪ The proposals are based on both the primary and secondary data ▪ Identification of planning needs are not reliable due to unrealistic population projections ▪ Total dwelling units identified to meet the housing demand of present population, existing shortage and dilapidated units are 74,252 ▪ No redevelopment proposals exists for dilapidated areas ▪ No low income housing proposals exists ▪ RDA has not accepted the road network strategy proposed by the plan ▪ The plan did not cover establishment of the commercial activities within the city ▪ The plan proposed a green belt around the city to ensure environmental safety ▪ The proposed to integrate the road network with capital city Islamabad, and two by-passes and a ring road is proposed ▪ The plan did not envisage a commercialization trend
Multan Multan Master Plan (1987-2007)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The plan is approved by the Technical Committee (Members Parliaments from Multan, Mayor of the MC, DG of MDA, senior government officials, technocrats and heads of government departments/agencies) approved the master plan in October, 1987 ▪ Prepared by Master Planning Cell without any involvement of consultants ▪ Estimates for future land uses have been made ▪ The plan envisaged an improvement to urban economy with the proposed expansion and strengthening of industrial and commercial centers ▪ It suggests the establishment of small scale industrial units rather than large units. ▪ An Industrial Estate of over 2500 acres was proposed to be developed for medium and heavy industrial purpose. ▪ The area along both sides of Bahawalpur Road was earmarked for light to medium scale industry. ▪ The area lying in the surroundings of Pak Arab Fertilizer Factory was recommended to be developed for light industrial use. ▪ Housing need for the plan period is calculated as 406539 units. ▪ The plan recommended that 1225 houses will be provided each year ▪ It is recommended that the projected houses would be met through strategies such as: strict enforcement of town planning layouts, installation of sewerage system and full-scale mass production of low cost housing to meet this demand ▪ A strategy of rehabilitation of the existing stock is suggested but no financial strategy is developed for it ▪ It is proposed to provide maximum infrastructure and services in new areas and partial services in major areas of intensification throughout the city and its immediate vicinity ▪ A Detailed zoning exercise is carried out in the preparation of the Master Plan of Multan ▪ A detailed exercise to delineate permitted uses, permissible uses and prohibited uses for the purposes of their permission in each zone is mentioned in the MP. ▪ Most of the proposals and projects of the master plan have been implemented
Gujranwala Gujranwala Outline Development Plan (1986-2010)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provide development guidelines for the growth of city ▪ Both the primary and secondary sources of data have been used ▪ Data pertaining to land use distribution, industrial establishments, and a hierarchy of commercial centers, transportation and traffic flows, educational institutions, health, open spaces and public utilities has been compiled through extensive primary surveys ▪ The element of environmental planning, finance management and implementation strategies are completely missing ▪ The plan has no phasing for the implementation of the plan proposals ▪ The minimum and maximum sizes of plots have been proposed to be restricted to 3 ½ Marla and 1 kanal respectively. ▪ The proposed demand of land for various land uses in the ODP is 23993 acres till the year 2010. ▪ New sites were proposed on an area of 1214 acres at different locations for industrial establishment ▪ The sites earmarked for industrial establishment have been occupied by other uses ▪ The proposed strategy for commercial establishment is based on one shop for 100 persons ▪ The growth of the city has been taking place in the direction which is not indicated in the ODP
Peshawar	See Chapter 5 and 6 for detail contents of the plan

Source: Go Punjab, 2008, GoS, 2006

4.9- Conclusion

Review of the national urban management initiatives illustrates that planned development has been greatly realized in Pakistan since its inception, but never been practiced. Although the government managed to consecutively prepare and adopt the national five year plans, some of these plans laid high emphasis on achieving planned urban growth. Yet it failed to generate any action at the local level and these plans were shelved due to change in regime. Assessment of these plans reflects that actually five year plans were a haste grouping of policy measures without further insurance for implementation at the provincial level.

This apathy persists in various other policy documents such as Management of Cities Policy and PNCS, which highlighted core problems of haphazard development. Different initiatives regarding planned growth at urban and regional level were suggested but they were never put into reality. In short, the efforts to improve the chaotic condition and muddled form of cities remained one of the constant priorities of every government but none of the proposed strategies happened in reality.

One of the impediments is that unlike other countries specifically illustrated in chapter-3, physical planning is not incorporated in the federal legislation concurrent list in Pakistan. Therefore, there exists no unanimous Town Planning Act at the national level to provide a uniform strategy for the physical growth of cities. However, provinces have been empowered to draft their separate legislation to address the issue of physical planning. In this scenario, various organizations (both National and Provincial level) are striving for the planned physical development in cities. In actual these fragmented stakeholders with multiplicity of institutional mandates and legal provision along with an indifferent framework indicate an inefficient system.

In this regard, the Management of Cities Policy 1987 declared that: revision of law; Re-orientation of rules; more use of by laws; coordination among agencies are utmost important to avoid further failure. The policy recommended that in the sphere of financial management plan oriented budget is to be ensured in city districts so that plan led approach may flourish within the country but no one took it serious. Therefore, the continuous failure of various types of plans clearly indicates that without removing the system lacunas, plan can not prove to be successful by itself. It is, therefore, necessary to treat institutional mandates in order to enable planners to avoid further chaos in major cities.