



## **Report of the International Expert Meeting on Integrity for Cultural Heritage**

**Al Ain, United Arab Emirates, 12-14 March 2012**

### **A. Introduction**

1. The participants of the International Expert Meeting on Integrity for Cultural Heritage which took place from 12 to 14 March 2012 in Al Ain, United Arab Emirates (UAE), appreciated the support of the government of the United Arab Emirates and its authorities, in particular the Abu Dhabi Tourism & Culture Authority, and the Al Ain Municipality for the financial support for organizing and generously hosting this important event in collaboration with the UNESCO World Heritage Centre.
2. The meeting was attended by 30 participants and experts from all regions of the world (from 18 countries), as well as by Representatives of IUCN, ICOMOS, ICCROM, and the UNESCO World Heritage Centre.
3. The meeting provided an opportunity for rich debate, underpinned by the consideration of a number of case studies reviewing the notion of integrity, including its relationship to authenticity and the State of Conservation for World Heritage properties, nominations and Tentative List sites, through inputs from the experts present, the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, and written contributions by Prof. Herb Stovel (Carleton University, Canada). The World Heritage Centre, IUCN, ICCROM and ICOMOS presented statements that will be included in the web-documentation of the Expert Meeting.
4. The meeting proceeded through in-depth reflection through three thematic working groups which took into account the specific decisions of the World Heritage Committee at its 35th session (Paris, 2011, 35 COM 13) and at its 33rd session (Seville, 2009, 33 COM 13) which requested “the World Heritage Centre, in cooperation with the Advisory Bodies in conformity with Section II.E of the *Operational Guidelines*, to organize an expert meeting to develop examples of the application of the conditions of integrity and authenticity to properties nominated under criteria (i) – (vi) for inclusion in Section II.E of the *Operational Guidelines* ...”.

5. These three thematic working groups were:
  - **Historic towns and urban areas**
  - **Archaeological sites and cultural landscapes**
  - **Monuments and groups of buildings**
6. The meeting agreed on a series of conclusions and recommendations provided in this document.

## **B Summary of key considerations from the meeting**

7. The meeting recognised that the World Heritage Committee adopted for the first time in 2005 paragraphs on integrity for cultural heritage in its revision to the Operational Guidelines in 2005 leaving specific definitions to future reflections (footnote paragraph 89). Both integrity and authenticity are considered as qualifying conditions for Outstanding Universal Value and are required in statements of Outstanding Universal Value, even when prepared retroactively and they also guide Committee decisions. Therefore further guidance to States Party authorities and site managers is needed.
8. The meeting noted that there is a variety of definitions of integrity and referred to functional, structural and visual integrity as defined by the La Vanoise Expert Meeting (France, 1996), which were taken up by cultural heritage experts as social-functional, structural and visual integrity (e.g. Jokiletho 2006, Stovel 2007). Other potential aspects of integrity were also discussed at the meeting including three concepts as the 'integrity of composition', the 'integrity of structure, relations and visual integrity' as well as 'functional integrity' (see ICOMOS input to the background paper to the meeting). Further reflections could be integrated into a future Annex to the Operational Guidelines which could be developed in parallel to the existing Annex 4 on authenticity.
9. The meeting further noted that establishing the conditions of integrity of a property includes the detailed analysis and establishment of what the attributes that convey the values of the property are, while considering the relationship between the different elements and the whole as well as the relationship between the different elements. This analysis also contributes to guide the planning, protection and management of the property.
10. The meeting referred to the Expert Meeting on buffer zones (Switzerland, 2008) documented in World Heritage papers 25 and also found that for cultural sites, the conditions of integrity can be enhanced with the establishment of an adequate buffer zone that takes into account other elements related with the property in terms of continuity and connectivity.

11. The meeting also noted that for integrity for cultural heritage adequate community involvement is required, as integrity and sustainable use are closely linked, as described in Paragraph 119 of the Operational Guidelines.
12. Concerning the conditions of integrity, the meeting considered that the management of change has to be taken into account, including for the socio-economic function of the site.
13. Based on the definition provided by Herb Stovel (2007), the meeting considered that authenticity may be understood as the capacity of a property to convey its significance over time, and integrity be understood as the ability of the property to secure and sustain its significance over time.
14. The meeting finally considered to provide the following specific recommendations (Section C) and concise revisions to the Operational Guidelines (Section D).

### **C Recommendations**

15. The participants addressed the following recommendations to the World Heritage Committee, States Parties to the *World Heritage Convention*, the Advisory Bodies and the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, as appropriate:
  - Supplementary guidance to the Operational Guidelines (see Section D) should be provided in the Resource Manuals and other (on-line) publications or training materials;
  - Concerning serial nominations and properties, the meeting acknowledged previous expert meetings (e.g. International Expert Meeting on World Heritage serial nominations and properties, Ittingen, Switzerland, 2010) and considered that further reflections may be required to fully take into account the relationship of the integrity of each component part and the integrity of the overall property as a whole;
  - For further future revisions of the Operational Guidelines in addition to the specific proposals in Section D, it is recommended to add an Annex on Integrity (including definitions of integrity, a chronological bibliography, and examples), in parallel to Annex 4 existing for Authenticity. This Annex, covering both cultural and natural heritage, should include paragraphs for each of the aspects of integrity such as structural, functional, and visual, as suggested at previous expert meetings to complement the site typology paragraphs developed below.
  - It is also recommended that paragraphs be prepared for the various aspects of authenticity (form and design, location and setting, material and substance, etc.) as found in Paragraph 82 of the Operational Guidelines.

#### **D. Possible revisions to the text of the *Operational Guidelines***

The meeting proposed to remove the footnote to paragraph 89 and suggested the following changes to the *Operational Guidelines* to be taken into account at a future revision [all new text in *italics*]:

89. For properties nominated under criteria (i) to (vi), the physical fabric of the property and/or its significant features should be in good condition, and the impact of deterioration processes controlled. A significant proportion of the elements necessary to express the totality of the value conveyed by the property should be included. Relationships and dynamic functions present in cultural landscapes, historic towns or other living properties essential to their distinctive character should also be maintained.

*Additionally, guidance on the condition of integrity is provided for the following typologies:*

- a) *Properties nominated as cultural landscapes, should contain key interrelated, interdependent and visually integral elements. For example, an agricultural landscape should include not only the production fields, but also the watersheds and irrigation systems as well as processing features of the agricultural products, social practices and expressions of associative values such as rituals.*
- b) *Properties nominated as archaeological sites should contain the necessary interrelated, interdependent and visually integral elements which provide important information critical to its understanding. Prospects for future potential discoveries related to the Outstanding Universal Value should also be recognized. For example, a settlement area should take into consideration the physical traces of the social, economic, historical, aesthetic, ethnological or anthropological behaviour relating to the site. Or, for example, a property proposed for its ancient water irrigation system should have sufficient necessary elements to demonstrate the key aspects for the understanding of its overall value, i.e. physical components: underground and surface water channels, shafts (inspection covers), water collecting points, and irrigated fields; social/economic components: traditional water sharing practices, etc.*
- c) *For properties nominated as historic towns consideration should be given to the fact that they are living and dynamic and that their integrity should be considered within the framework of the need to ensure the protection of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property while its people maintain a good quality of life.*
  - (i) *The elements of the Historic Urban Landscape approach (see the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on Historic Urban Landscapes) should be used to assess the conditions of integrity including topography, geomorphology, hydrology and natural features; its built environment,*

*both historic and contemporary; its infrastructure above and below ground; its open spaces and gardens, its land use patterns and spatial organization; perceptions and visual relationships (both internal and external); building heights and massing as well as all other elements of the urban character, fabric and structure.*

*(ii) Conditions of integrity also include social and cultural practices and values, economic processes and the intangible dimensions of heritage as related to diversity and identity (valid also for other cultural heritage properties).*

*(iii) All of the elements mentioned above in (i) and (ii) will need to be assessed to consider their positive and negative impacts on integrity.*

*d) Properties nominated as monuments should contain all elements (for example, principal and subsidiary buildings), infrastructure, and environmental and landscape layouts necessary to express their Outstanding Universal Value as well as their successive additions/expansions that are compatible with the Outstanding Universal Value or contribute to it. Consideration should also be given to the need to ensure important views to and from the monument using appropriate management tools such as buffer zones. Proposed properties may include surrounding neighbourhoods. For example, the nomination of a monument with religious significance should include its environment, spaces for related practices, and subsidiary buildings supporting traditional forms of maintenance.*

*e) Nominated properties which contain groups of buildings should contain all the necessary elements that through their mutual relationships, express their Outstanding Universal Value. For example, the nomination of a large and fragmented defence system should include the necessary constitutive elements (forts, bastions, wall-paths, towers as well as other defensive features), expressing the system's function along with those of its various parts.*

*Further specific examples can be found in the Resource Manuals at [whc.unesco.org](http://whc.unesco.org).*

*Footnote: Serial nominations still need to be considered in future discussions (see Section C on Recommendations of the meeting on Integrity for Cultural Heritage).*

**International World Heritage Expert Meeting on Integrity for Cultural Heritage, Al  
Ain, United Arab Emirates, 12 to 14 March 2012**

**Agenda**

<b>Sunday 11 March 2012</b>	
<u>Arrival of participants</u>	
<b>Monday 12 March 2012</b>	
09.00-09.30	<u>Registration of participants</u>
09.30-10.30	<u>Session 1: Opening Session</u> Chair: Dr Saleh (Abu Dhabi) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Welcome by host country, Dr El Masri, Deputy Director General, ADTCA</li> <li>- Welcome by Mr Rao, Director UNESCO World Heritage Centre</li> <li>- Background to the meeting and general issues (Ms Rössler, WHC)</li> </ul>
10.30-11.00	Coffee Break
11.00-13.00	<u>Session 2: Background, Results of previous work</u> Chair: Dr Yildirim (Abu Dhabi) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Presentation of background material collected by Prof. Herb Stovel</li> <li>- ICOMOS – Position Paper</li> <li>- ICCROM – Position Paper</li> <li>- IUCN – Position Paper</li> </ul>
13.00-14.30	Lunch Break
14.30-16.30	<u>Session 3: Working groups</u> <u>Working groups A, B, C</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>A: Cities and urban areas</b> (Chair: Mr Bondin – with presentations/contributions by Ms Cesi on Florence, Mr El Zahaby on Cairo, Mr Ould Sidi on Timbuktu, Mr de Almeida on Brasilia, Mr Mahdy, Ms Yildirim, Rapporteur: Mr King)</li> <li>- <b>B: Archeological sites and Cultural Landscapes</b> (Chair: Mr Sheehan with presentations/contributions by Mr Tsegaye on Ethiopian Heritage, Mr Molinari on Pehuen Co, Mr. El Masri, Mr Al-Tikriti, Mr Beech, Mr Al Neyady, Ms Rössler, Rapporteur: Ms Leitao)</li> <li>- <b>C: Monuments and individual buildings</b> (Chair: Mr Soos with presentations/contributions by Mr Qasim on Pakistan, Mr El Omari Ezajani on Morocco, Mr Measketh on Khmer Heritage, Mr Curcic on Byzantine monuments, Rapporteur: Mr Chorfi)</li> </ul> <p><small>Note: observers will be equally distributed among the groups if possible according to their specific heritage background and experience</small></p>
16.30-17.00	Coffee Break

17.00-19.00	<u>Session 4: Working groups</u> Continued with specific considerations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- preparation of texts on the concept of integrity applied to cultural heritage by type of property</li> <li>- relationship of integrity to authenticity</li> <li>- further recommendations for revisions to the Operational Guidelines</li> </ul>
	Gala Dinner (hosted by Al Ain Municipality)

<b>Tuesday 13 March 2012</b>	
08.30-11.00	<u>Session 5: Reports of the Working groups A, B, C, D</u> Chair: Dr. Mahdy
11.00-11.30	Coffee break
11.30-13.00	<u>Session 6: Continuation of the parallel working groups</u>
13.00-14.30	Lunch Break
14.30-15.30	<u>Session 7: Local Presentation (Case Study: Al Ain)</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Cultural Sites of Al Ain World Heritage Site (by Dr. Yildirim, ADTCA)</li> <li>-</li> <li>- Historic Overview of Al Ain (by Mr Goldie, Al Ain Municipality)</li> <li>- Plan Al Ain 2030 (by Mr Al Kuwaiti, Abu Dhabi Urban Planning Council)</li> </ul>
15.30-19.30	<u>Site visit: The Cultural Sites of Al Ain</u>
20.00	Dinner

<b>Wednesday 14 March 2012</b>	
08.30-10.00	<u>Session 8: Discussion of recommendation by chairs/rapporteurs of the working groups</u>
10.00-10.30	<u>Coffee Break</u>
10.30-13.00	<u>Session 9: Final report of the expert meeting and discussion</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <u>Discussion</u></li> </ul>
13.00-14.30	Lunch break
14.30-16.00	<u>Session 10: Presentations of Recommendations and draft report</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <u>Synthesis report</u></li> <li>- <u>Discussion of final recommendations and agreement on further steps</u></li> </ul>
16.00-17.00	<u>Session 11: Closing session</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <u>Closing remarks:</u></li> <li>-</li> </ul>

	Representative of the host country Representative of the UNESCO World Heritage Centre  - <u>Closure of the meeting</u>
20:00	<u>Dinner</u>

<b>Thursday, 15 March 2012</b>	
	<u>Departure of Participants</u>



**International World Heritage Expert Meeting on Integrity for Cultural Heritage, Al Ain, United Arab Emirates (12 to 14 March 2012)**

**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

<p><b><u>Experts</u></b> <b><u>Group I</u></b></p> <p><b>H.E. Mr. Raymond Bondin</b> Ambassador of Malta to UNESCO Ministry of Foreign Affairs Palazzo Parisio, Merchants Street, Valletta Malta Phone : 00356 21242853 Fax : 00356 21240210 Mail : ray.bondin@gov.mt</p> <p><b>Ms. Adele Cesi</b> Architect, Ministry for Cultural Heritage, UNESCO World Heritage Bureau 27 Via del Collegio Romano 00186 Rome Italy Phone: +39 06 672 32234 Mail: <a href="mailto:acesi@beniculturali.it">acesi@beniculturali.it</a></p> <p><b><u>Group II</u></b></p> <p><b>Dr. Gabor Soos</b> Head of Division Division of International Cooperation, Public Relations and World Heritage Affairs National Office of Cultural Heritage Budapest 1014 Táncsics u. 1 Hungary Phone: +36 303 779 594 Mail: <a href="mailto:gabor.soos@Koh.hu">gabor.soos@Koh.hu</a></p> <p><b>Mr. Slobodan Curcic</b> 27 Karakasi 54248 Thessaloniki Greece (represents Serbia) Mail: <a href="mailto:Curcic@princeton.edu">Curcic@princeton.edu</a></p> <p><b><u>Group III</u></b></p> <p><b>Mr. Robson Antônio de Almeida</b> Deputy Director Department of Built Heritage and Surveillance IPHAN – Historic and Artistic National Heritage Institute SEPS 713/913, Lote D, 3o andar, Brasília Brasil 70390-135 Phone: +55 (61) 2024.6376/ +55 (61) 2024.6380 Mail: <a href="mailto:robson.almeida@iphan.gov.br">robson.almeida@iphan.gov.br</a></p> <p><b>Mr. Roberto Molinari</b> Alsinq 1418 P.5 OF. 507 (1088) Cdad. de Buenos Aires Argentina Tel: + 54 11 43828831/ 43822140 Mail: <a href="mailto:rmolinari@apn.gov.ar">rmolinari@apn.gov.ar</a></p>	<p><b><u>Group IV</u></b></p> <p><b>Mr. David Measketh</b> Counsellor, Permanent Delegation of Cambodia to UNESCO 1, rue Miollis 75015 Paris, France Cambodge Phone: +33 1 45 68 26 12 Mail: <a href="mailto:cambodia_unesco@yahoo.fr">cambodia_unesco@yahoo.fr</a></p> <p><b>Mr. Qasim Ali Qasim</b> Director Exploration &amp; Excavation Branch, Culture Department Government of Sindh, 57-Hafiz Plaza, Shahrae Faisal, Karachi Pakistan Phone: +21-36828628 / +21-34542973 Mobile: +333-30561191 Mail: <a href="mailto:aliqasimnca@yahoo.com">aliqasimnca@yahoo.com</a>/<a href="mailto:piahmad@gmail.com">piahmad@gmail.com</a></p> <p><b><u>Group Va</u></b></p> <p><b>Mr. Ali Ould Sidi</b> Head of the Cultural Mission of Timbuktu PO Box 63, Timbuktu Mali Phone: +223 21 92 10 77 / + 223 76 02 39 41 Mail: <a href="mailto:ouldsidi_ali@hotmail.fr">ouldsidi_ali@hotmail.fr</a></p> <p><b>Mr. Yonas Desta Tsegaye</b> Director Ethiopian Authority for Research and Conservation of Cultural Heritage PO Box 13247, Addis Ababa Ethiopia Phone: +251 -1-157630 Mail : <a href="mailto:yonasdesta@ymail.com">yonasdesta@ymail.com</a></p> <p><b><u>Group Vb</u></b></p> <p><b>Mr. Mohamed El Zahaby</b> Délégué permanent adjoint 1, rue Miollis, 75732 Paris Cedex 15 France (represents Egypt) Tel: +33(0)1 45 68 33 09 E-mail: <a href="mailto:m.el-zahaby.eg@unesco-delegations.org">m.el-zahaby.eg@unesco-delegations.org</a></p> <p><b>Mr. Mohammed Mouhcine El Idrissi El Omari Ezajani</b> Inspecteur des Monuments Historiques et des Sites Rce Rita, 3ème étage, appt.9, Rue Marmoucha Atlas, Fès Maroc Phone: + 212 6 63 10 72 37 Mail: <a href="mailto:mouhcine2222@yahoo.fr">mouhcine2222@yahoo.fr</a></p>
---	---

<p><b><u>Host Country</u></b></p> <p><b>Dr. Sami El-Masri</b> Deputy Director General for Arts, Culture and Heritage Abu Dhabi Tourism and Culture Authority P.O. Box 2380, Abu Dhabi, UAE Mail: <a href="mailto:smasri@adach.ae">smasri@adach.ae</a></p> <p><b>Dr. Awadh Saleh</b> Advisor for International Cultural Collaborations Abu Dhabi Tourism and Culture Authority P.O. Box 2380, Abu Dhabi, UAE Mail: <a href="mailto:awadh.saleh@adach.ae">awadh.saleh@adach.ae</a></p> <p><b>Dr. Walid Yasin Al-Tikriti</b> Archaeology Section Manager, Historic Environment Department Abu Dhabi Tourism and Culture Authority P.O. Box 2380, Abu Dhabi, UAE Mail: <a href="mailto:walid.ismail@adach.ae">walid.ismail@adach.ae</a></p> <p><b>Dr. Mark Beech</b> Cultural Landscapes Section Manager, Historic Environment Department Abu Dhabi Tourism and Culture Authority P.O. Box 2380, Abu Dhabi, UAE Mail: <a href="mailto:mark.beech@adach.ae">mark.beech@adach.ae</a></p> <p><b>Mr. Peter Sheehan</b> Historic Buildings Section Manager, Historic Environment Department Abu Dhabi Tourism and Culture Authority P.O. Box 2380, Abu Dhabi, UAE Mail: <a href="mailto:peter.sheehan@adach.ae">peter.sheehan@adach.ae</a></p> <p><b>Dr. Hossam Mahdy</b> Building Conservation Section Manager, Conservation Department Abu Dhabi Tourism and Culture Authority P.O. Box 2380, Abu Dhabi, UAE Mail: <a href="mailto:hossam.mahdy@adach.ae">hossam.mahdy@adach.ae</a></p> <p><b>Dr. Ayse Ege Yildirim</b> Heritage Planner, Strategic Planning &amp; Development Dept. Abu Dhabi Tourism and Culture Authority Phone: +9712 657 6217 Mail: <a href="mailto:ayse.yildirim@adach.ae">ayse.yildirim@adach.ae</a></p> <p><b>Mr. Mohammed Amer Al Neyady</b> Director of the Historic Environment Department, ADTCA Abu Dhabi Tourism and Culture Authority P.O. Box 2380, Abu Dhabi, UAE</p>	<p><b><u>Advisory Bodies of the World Heritage Convention International Council of Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS)</u></b></p> <p><b>Mr. Abderrahmane Chorfi</b> President of the National Committee ICOMOS Morocco Mail: <a href="mailto:abd.chorfi@hotmail.fr">abd.chorfi@hotmail.fr</a></p> <p><b><u>International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and the Restoration of Cultural Property (ICCROM)</u></b></p> <p><b>Mr. Joseph King</b> Sites Unit Director Via di San Michele 13 Rome 153 Italy Phone: 39 06 585 53 313 Fax: 39 06 585 53 349 Mail: <a href="mailto:jk@iccrom.org">jk@iccrom.org</a></p> <p><b><u>International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN)</u></b></p> <p><b>Ms. Leticia Leitao</b> World Heritage Capacity Building Officer Rue Mauverney 28 CH-1196 Gland Switzerland Tel: +41 22 999 0278 Fax: +41 22 999 0025 Mail: <a href="mailto:leticia.leitao@iucn.org">leticia.leitao@iucn.org</a></p> <p><b><u>UNESCO World Heritage Centre</u></b></p> <p><b>Mr. Kishore Rao</b> Director of the UNESCO World Heritage Centre 7, place de Fontenoy 75352 Paris 07 SP, France Mail: <a href="mailto:k.rao@unesco.org">k.rao@unesco.org</a> Phone : + 33 1 45 68 15 59</p> <p><b>Dr. Mechtild Rössler</b> Chief, Policy and Statutory Implementation Section UNESCO World Heritage Centre 7, place de Fontenoy 75352 Paris 07 SP, France Mail: <a href="mailto:m.rossler@unesco.org">m.rossler@unesco.org</a> Phone : + 33 1 45 68 18 91</p>
---	--

**Observers**

**Group I**

**Mr. Oliver Martin**

Chef de Section Adjoint  
Office fédéral de la Culture OFC  
Hallwylstrasse 15  
CH – 3012 Bern  
Switzerland  
Phone : +41 31 322 44 48  
Mobile : +41 79 760 86 94  
Mail : [oliver.martin@bak.admin.ch](mailto:oliver.martin@bak.admin.ch)

**Group II**

**Mr. Alexander Robotkevich**

Russian Federation  
Phone: +7-495-62 8-5 6-6 1  
Fax: +7-495-625-07-01  
Mail : [robotkevich@mail.ru](mailto:robotkevich@mail.ru)

**Ms. Jasna Zrnovic**

Minister Plenipotentiary  
Secretary General  
National Commission for UNESCO  
KnezaMilosa 24-26, Belgrade  
Serbia  
Phone: +381 11 3068306  
Fax:+381 11 3618030  
Mail: [jasna.zrnovic@mfa.rs](mailto:jasna.zrnovic@mfa.rs)

**Group IV**

**Mr. Chihei Suzuki**

The Agency for Cultural Affairs  
3-2-2, Kasumigaseki, Chiyoda  
Tokyo,  
Japan  
Phone: +81 3 67342876  
Fax: +81 3 67343822  
Mail: [chihei@bunka.go.jp](mailto:chihei@bunka.go.jp)

**Dr. Shika Jain**

Member Secretary, Advisory  
Committee on World Heritage  
Matters  
Ministry of Culture, India  
A-258, South City-1  
Gurgaon  
India  
Tel: +91 9 312 876 831  
Fax: +91 1 244 269 081  
Mail: [dronah@gmail.com](mailto:dronah@gmail.com)